

**Department of Community Planning and Economic Development**  
Certificate of Appropriateness  
BZH-27645

**Date:** February 26, 2013

**Applicant:** Miller Dunwiddie Architecture, on behalf of Our Lady of Lourdes

**Address of Property:** 1 (3) Lourdes Place

**Project Name:** Our Lady of Lourdes - Roof-top Condensing Units

**Contact Person and Phone:** Miller Dunwiddie Architecture, Attn: Paul May, 612-278-7712

**CPED Staff and Phone:** Becca Farrar-Hughes, 612-673-3594

**Date Application Deemed Complete:** January 18, 2013

**Publication Date:** February 19, 2013

**Public Hearing:** February 26, 2013

**Appeal Period Expiration:** March 8, 2013

**Ward:** 3

**Neighborhood Organization:** Nicollet Island-East Bank Neighborhood Association

**Concurrent Review:** N/A

**Attachments:**

Materials Submitted by CPED

Materials Submitted by Applicant

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development  
BZH-27645

| <b>CLASSIFICATION:</b>       |  |
|------------------------------|--|
| Historic District            | Saint Anthony Falls Historic District  |
| Period of Significance       | 1858-1940  |
| Criteria of Significance     | Architecture and Social Significance   |
| Date of Local Designation    | 1971   |
| Applicable Design Guidelines | - <i>Saint Anthony Falls Historic District Guidelines</i><br>- <i>Secretary of Interior Standards for Treatment of Historic Properties</i> |

| <b>PROPERTY INFORMATION:</b> |                               |
|------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Current name                 | Our Lady of Lourdes           |
| Historic Name                | First Universalist Church     |
| Current Address              | 1 Lourdes Place               |
| Historic Address             | 21-27 Prince Street Southeast |
| Original Construction Date   | 1856-1857                     |
| Original Contractor          | Unknown                       |
| Original Architect           | Unknown                       |
| Historic Use                 | Church                        |
| Current Use                  | Church                        |
| Proposed Use                 | Church                        |

**BACKGROUND:**

Our Lady of Lourdes Church, located at 1 Lourdes Place (formerly 21-27 Prince Street SE), is the oldest church in continuous use in Minneapolis, and it is one of the oldest structures in the St. Anthony Falls Historic District. The structure is a contributing building in the district, reflecting the significance of the district. The limestone-clad building was constructed in 1856-1857 by the First Universalist Society of St. Anthony. In 1877, the church was sold to a French Canadian congregation that substantially enlarged the church in 1881-1883 to its present appearance and remodeled it to reflect the character of Canadian French Provincial models. The church was originally constructed in the Gothic Revival style but incorporated additional elements from other architectural styles including Romanesque and Second Empire. Over time, additions to the structure have doubled the size of the building, the pitch of the roof was increased, a transept and apse, and a Gothic-style wood steeple were added. The two-story, Neo-Classical Rectory, was designed by Minneapolis architect C.F. Struck and built in 1903. The changes in ownership and architectural styles are a visual reminder of the tiers of history found along the Minneapolis riverfront.

**SUMMARY OF APPLICANT'S PROPOSAL:**

Miller Dunwiddie Architecture, on behalf of Our Lady of Lourdes Parish, has applied for a Certificate of Appropriateness application to allow for the addition of condensing units for air conditioning purposes on the roof of the church sacristy.

The applicant explored various options that included on grade options as well as the proposed roof installation. The applicant chose to pursue the roof installation option due to the small size of the site as well as the negative impacts to both the church and grounds that would occur with the addition of the condensing units on grade. The roof installation eliminates the visual impact of the units by placing them above grade and out of site. The roof placement includes the addition of screening in a cresting typical of the French Empire style represented by the main church building.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

No public comment had been received by the time of publication.

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:** Certificate of Appropriateness for roof-top condensing units.

***Findings as required by the Minneapolis Preservation Code:***

*The Minneapolis Community Planning and Economic Development Department has analyzed the application based on the findings required by the Minneapolis Preservation Ordinance. Before approving a certificate of appropriateness, and based upon the evidence presented in each application submitted, the commission shall make findings based upon, but not limited to, the following:*

- (1) The alteration is compatible with and continues to support the criteria of significance and period of significance for which the landmark or historic district was designated.***

CPED Staff believes the proposal to install roof top condensing units on the sacristy of the church, screened by cresting typical of the French Empire style that is represented by the main church building, is compatible with and continues to support the criteria of significance and period of significance for which Our Lady of Lourdes is a contributing building to the Minneapolis St. Anthony Falls Historic District. The St. Anthony Falls Historic District is significant in part for the mill and industrial buildings from the 19<sup>th</sup> century and early 20<sup>th</sup> century which propelled Minneapolis to become the largest city in Minnesota (the period of significance is from 1858-1940) as well as culturally significant due to the geologic and geographic significance of the falls.

A total of six mechanical condensing units are proposed on the roof of the church sacristy. In order to allow for the installation of the condensing units, the sacristy roof would be structurally reinforced, and the exterior of the roof would be replaced with the same materials (EPDM membrane) as the existing roof. The size of each of the condensing units is 37 inches tall (includes 4" legs underneath the condensing unit) by 31 inches wide by 44 inches long. The condensing units are recessed approximately 6.5 feet from the edge of the roof line. The screening fence that is proposed is a 4-foot tall galvanized, picket steel fence with fleur-de-lis finials and fleur-de-lis ornamentation on the picket fence segments. The placement of the decorative screen fence would be located 1.5 feet from the edge of the roof line. The screen fence is compatible with the existing metal fence located around the perimeter of the property.

The air conditioning system would not be visible within the church space as the routing would be accommodated in the attic area of the church, and within the existing grill work located in the church ceiling.

- (2) ***The alteration is compatible with and supports the interior and/or exterior designation in which the property was designated.***

The proposed alteration is compatible with and supports the criteria of significance and period of significance for which the historic district was designated. The overall impact of the proposed condensing units on the district as a whole would be negligible. The sacristy roof would be structurally reinforced to accommodate the condensing units. The structural components would be oversized to avoid any potential for vibrations. The area directly below the condensing units at the interior of the sacristy storage area would be repaired to its original condition. Further, the placement of the condensing units, recessed from the edge of the roof line and their compressed size would not be visible from the street or at grade across the street.

- (3) ***The alteration is compatible with and will ensure continued integrity of the landmark or historic district for which the district was designated.***

The proposed work would not affect the building's location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, or association and would not, therefore, affect the building's integrity.

- (4) ***The alteration will not materially impair the significance and integrity of the landmark, historic district or nominated property under interim protection as evidenced by the consistency of alterations with the applicable design guidelines adopted by the commission.***

The *St. Anthony Falls Historic District Design Guidelines* were recently updated, and approved by the City Council in October of 2012. The property is located within the Hennepin & Central District Character Area. The guidelines state the following regarding the area: “The current configuration of the Hennepin and Central District contains a disparate collection of historic buildings including a collection of historic storefront buildings on Hennepin and First Avenue Northeast, Our Lady of Lourdes Church, and the Art Godfrey house, which was moved into Chute Square, an open space across Central Avenue from the library. Interspersed among these historic buildings are more recent high rise residential townhomes and other commercial and residential development.” The guidelines specific to this area further discuss site and landscape guidelines as well as building design which are not applicable in this specific circumstance.

The *St. Anthony Falls Historic District Design Guidelines* also address both building equipment and roof standards in a comprehensive fashion for the district. The guidelines do note that externally mounted equipment, including HVAC equipment and fans, can negatively impact the character of a property and further notes that historically, these elements were subordinate to most commercial and residential building types. The intent is to minimize the visual impacts of building equipment on the character of the district in residential and commercial contexts through the following requirements:

7.6 Minimize the visual impacts of building equipment as seen from the public way.

- a. Screen building equipment from view.
- b. Do not locate equipment on a primary facade. Primary wall penetrations for HVAC equipment are not permitted.
- c. Prioritize use of low-profile or recessed mechanical units on rooftops.
- d. Rooftop equipment on residential and commercial buildings shall be set back from the primary building facade by a minimum of one structural bay or 15’ whichever is greater.

Staff comment: The condenser units would be screened and set back from the edge of the roof line; no equipment is located on the primary building façade; low-profile condensing units are proposed and while the equipment is not proposed on a primary façade the equipment it is set back approximately 6.5 feet from the edge of the roof line.

7.7 Minimize the visual impacts of utility lines, junction boxes and similar equipment.

- a. Locate utility lines and junction boxes on secondary walls and group them.
- b. Locate utility pedestals (ground mounted) to the rear of the building.
- c. Enclose lines in conduit.
- d. Paint these elements to match the existing background color.

Staff comment: The system (piping, etc.) would not be visible within or on the exterior of the church space as the routing would be accommodated in the attic area of the church, and within the existing grill work located in the church ceiling. Any modifications that would result in exposed equipment from the system would be conditioned to meet these standards.

8.5 Minimize the visual impacts of rooftop mechanical equipment on the public way.

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development  
BZH-27645

- a. Screen equipment from view. Set it back a significant distance from building walls so it is not visible.
- b. Use low-profile or recessed mechanical units.
- c. Paint the equipment a dark muted color

Staff comment: The visual impacts of the condenser units would be minimized as the equipment would be screened and setback from the edge of the roof line. Low profile units are proposed. Based on final unit selection, Staff would require that the equipment be painted to either blend into the background of the building or into the foreground consistent with the proposed cresting.

- (5) ***The alteration will not materially impair the significance and integrity of the landmark, historic district or nominated property under interim protection as evidenced by the consistency of alterations with the recommendations contained in The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.***

The proposed alteration is compatible with the guidelines of *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*. CPED believes that the addition of rooftop condenser units on the roof of the church sacristy located on the rear of the building would comply as a rehabilitation project that meets Standard 1 and Standard 9.

*Standard 1: A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.*

*Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

- (6) ***The certificate of appropriateness conforms to all applicable regulations of this preservation ordinance and is consistent with the applicable policies of the comprehensive plan and applicable preservation policies in small area plans adopted by the city council.***

The project would comply with Policy 8.1 which states that the City will, "Preserve, maintain, and designate districts, landmarks, and historic resources which serve as reminders of the city's architecture, history, and culture," as well as implementation step

8.1.1, which states: "Protect historic resources from modifications that are not sensitive to their historic significance." The project would not modify the building in ways that are insensitive to its historical character.

***Before approving a certificate of appropriateness, and based upon the evidence presented in each application submitted, the commission shall make findings that alterations are proposed in a manner that demonstrates that the applicant has made adequate consideration of the following documents and regulations:***

**(7) Adequate consideration of the description and statement of significance in the original nomination upon which designation of the landmark or historic district was based.**

The applicant submitted a statement outlining how they feel the proposed work meets the guidelines of *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*.

**(8) Where applicable, Adequate consideration of Title 20 of the Minneapolis Code of Ordinances, Zoning Code, Chapter 530, Site Plan Review.**

The proposal does not trigger Site Plan Review as required by Zoning Code Chapter 530. However, as required, all mechanical equipment must meet the screening standards as outlined in Section 535.70 of the Zoning Code. Those standards are as follows:

Screening of mechanical equipment. (a) In general. All mechanical equipment installed on or adjacent to structures shall be arranged so as to minimize visual impact using one (1) of the following methods. All screening shall be kept in good repair and in a proper state of maintenance.

- (1) Screened by another structure. Mechanical equipment installed on or adjacent to a structure may be screened by a fence, wall or similar structure. Such screening structure shall comply with the following standards:
  - a. The required screening shall be permanently attached to the structure or the ground and shall conform to all applicable building code requirements.
  - b. The required screening shall be constructed with materials that are architecturally compatible with the structure.
  - c. Off-premise advertising signs and billboards shall not be considered required screening.
- (2) Screened by vegetation. Mechanical equipment installed adjacent to the structure served may be screened by hedges, bushes or similar vegetation.
- (3) Screened by the structure it serves. Mechanical equipment on or adjacent to a structure may be screened by a parapet or wall of sufficient height, built as an integral part of the structure.
- (4) Designed as an integral part of the structure. If screening is impractical, mechanical equipment may be designed so that it is balanced and integrated with respect to the design of the building.

The screening proposed complies with the applicable provisions of (1).

**(9) The typology of treatments delineated in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and the associated guidelines for preserving, rehabilitating, reconstructing, and restoring historic buildings.**

The applicant submitted a statement saying that the alteration makes adequate consideration for the treatments delineated in the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties* as the proposed scope of work is compatible with, but does not copy, elements of the original project and the project alterations are reversible. The application, complies with the

rehabilitation guidelines of *the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties* as discussed in finding #5 above.

***Before approving a certificate of appropriateness that involves alterations to a property within an historic district, the commission shall make findings based upon, but not limited to, the following:***

- (10) The alteration is compatible with and will ensure continued significance and integrity of all contributing properties in the historic district based on the period of significance for which the district was designated.***

As proposed, the alteration is compatible with and ensures the continued significance and integrity of all contributing properties within the St. Anthony Falls Historic District. Installing condensing units on the roof of the church sacristy that are relatively small, recessed from the edge of the roof line and screened would comply with this finding. The alterations are small, relative to the building's size, and in keeping with local and federal design guidelines as the alteration utilizes design details common to the existing church.

- (11) Granting the certificate of appropriateness will be in keeping with the spirit and intent of the ordinance and will not negatively alter the essential character of the historic district.***

The spirit and intent of the City of Minneapolis' Heritage Preservation Regulations is to preserve historically significant buildings, structures, sites, objects, districts, and cultural landscapes of the community while permitting appropriate changes to be made to these properties. The granting of the certificate of appropriateness to allow the condenser units that would provide air conditioning in the church improves the usability of the structure during all months of the year.

- (12) The certificate of appropriateness will not be injurious to the significance and integrity of other resources in the historic district and will not impede the normal and orderly preservation of surrounding resources as allowed by regulations in the preservation ordinance.***

Granting the certificate of appropriateness with the conditions of approval listed below would not be injurious to the significance and integrity of other resources in the historic district nor would it impede the normal and orderly preservation of surrounding resources as allowed by regulations in the preservation ordinance. The proposed placement of the condensing units does not have any visual impacts on the overall character of the district and the proposed cresting maintains the integrity of the church and the district guidelines.

## **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

The Department of Community Planning and Economic Development recommends that the Heritage Preservation Commission adopt the above findings and **approve** the Certificate of Appropriateness to allow for the installation of air conditioning units on the roof of the sacristy of Our Lady of Lourdes Church located at 1 (3) Lourdes Place subject to the following condition(s):

1. All workmanship must be completed in conformance with the Secretary of Interior Standards, see: <http://www.nps.gov/history/hps/tps/standguide/>.

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development  
BZH-27645

2. The Applicant shall obtain all other necessary City approvals prior to the commencement of work.
3. By ordinance, approvals are valid for a period of two years from the date of the decision unless required permits are obtained and the action approval is substantially begun and proceeds in a continuous basis toward completion. Upon written request and for good cause, the planning director may grant up to a one year extension if the request is made in writing no later than February 26, 2015.
4. By ordinance, all approvals granted in this Certificate of Appropriateness shall remain in effect as long as all of the conditions and guarantees of such approvals are observed. Failure to comply with such conditions and guarantees shall constitute a violation of this Certificate of Appropriateness and may result in termination of the approval.
5. The condenser units must meet the size stipulations and locational specifications as noted in the attached plans.
6. The condenser units shall be screened with a 4-foot tall galvanized, picket steel fence with fleur-de-lis finials and fleur-de-lis ornamentation on the picket fence segments.
7. Final plans shall comply with the *St. Anthony Falls Historic District Design Guidelines* as noted within this report.

Attachments:

1. Project description and applicable C of A findings
2. BZH Map
3. Correspondence – Ward 3 & Nicollet Island / East Bank Neighborhood Assn.
4. Plans – site plan, roof plan, elevations and mechanical and cresting specifications
5. Photos and renderings
6. Aerial images