

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development
Certificate of Appropriateness
BZH-27588

Proposal: Replace rear porch with a new rear addition, construct a detached garage

Applicant: Mark Nelson, David Heide Design, 612-337-5060

Address of Property: 1775 Colfax Avenue S, John Lind House

Planning Staff: Kimberly Holien, Senior Planner, 612-673-2402

Date Application Deemed Complete December 19, 2012

Public Hearing: January 29, 2013

Appeal Period Expiration: February 8, 2013

Ward: 7

Neighborhood Organization: Lowry Hill Neighborhood Association

Concurrent Review: n/a

Attachments:

- Zoning Context Map
- Application
- Neighborhood and City Council Letters
- Project Description
- Images
- Site Plan
- Elevations
- Revised garage elevation dated January 15, 2013
- Floor Plans

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development
BZH-27588

CLASSIFICATION:	
Period of Significance	1905-1930
Criteria of significance	Person (Criterion 2)
Date of local designation	1985
Applicable Design Guidelines	<i>The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Treatment of Historic Properties</i>

PROPERTY INFORMATION	
Current name	N/A (single family home)
Historic Name	John Lind House
Current Address	1775-77 Colfax Avenue S
Historic Address	1775 Colfax Avenue S
Original Construction Date	1905-1907
Original Contractor	unknown
Architects	William Channing Whitney
Historic Use	Private Residence
Current Use	Private Residence
Proposed Use	Private Residence

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development
BZH-27588

BACKGROUND: The John Lind House was constructed between 1905-07 for former Minnesota Governor John Lind. John Lind was a Swedish-born immigrant who was elected as Minnesota's 14th Governor in 1899. According to the designation study, John Lind was the first Democratic Governor in Minnesota after the Civil War and the second foreign-born Governor of Minnesota. During his lifetime John Lind was a school teacher, superintendent of Brown County schools, a New Ulm Lawyer, and land agent. John Lind was also the first Swedish-born American to be elected to the United States Congress and was president of the University Board of Regents and diplomatic representative to Mexico. Working at the end of the nineteenth century, Lind was a part of the Progressive movement, which championed the interests of the rural and urban working classes in Minnesota in a reaction against economic and social abuses.

While serving as a Congressman from the 5th Congressional District, John Lind had the home at 1775 Colfax Avenue S built. Construction of the home occurred from 1905-1907 and in 1907 John Lind returned from Washington, D.C. and took residence in the home with his wife and four children. He was appointed to the Board of Regents at the University of Minnesota where he was president until 1914. In 1913, he was appointed by President Wilson Howard Taft to serve as Presidential Emmissary to Mexico. He was also appointed by President Taft as Chair of the Minnesota Public Safety Commission. He was a founding member of the Board of Trustees of the American Swedish Institute. In 1918 he was appointed Chair of the Advisory Council to the Secretary of Labor and on the National War Labor Board.

The house at 1775 Colfax Avenue S was the scene of many civic functions and political conferences during his career. The active years of John Lind's political career were played out in this house. He resided there until he died in 1930 and his widow continued to live in the house for approximately 10 more years.

While the designation study does not mention architecture as an area of significance, the house is a private residence that was designed by prominent local architect William Channing Whitney. The two-story house is constructed of red brick and designed in the Georgian Revival style with Colonial design elements, including a front entry portico, a main entrance with elliptical fanlights and sidelights and marble keystones set in brick lintels above the windows. The symmetry of the primary façade includes a brick belt course at the second story and brick quoins. Paired chimney stacks on the north and south facades are connected by parapets. The front and rear facades each have three gables above a dentilated cornice.

John Lind was a friend of Swan Turnblad, owner of the Swedish language newspaper, *Svenska Amerikanska Posten*, in Minneapolis. Both men emigrated from the same area in Sweden and Lind served as Turnblad's personal attorney. Turnblad dispatched Swedish workmen from the Turnblad mansion construction site on Park Avenue in Minneapolis to Lind's house project and helped oversee the construction of the John Lind House, as Lind was in Washington serving as a Congressman during most of the construction period.

As stated above, the house was constructed as a single-family home. In 1960, the house was converted to a duplex and a number of interior modifications were made. The exterior of the house remained intact. A two-story, stucco stairway was added to the rear of the house to serve as a second stairway for the duplex. In 1986 the house was converted back to a single

family dwelling. The current detached garage was constructed at that time. The date of removal of the rear stairway addition is unknown.

The home on property to the south at 1777 Colfax Avenue S was demolished in April of 1986. This vacant lot was purchased by the current property owner of 1775 Colfax Avenue S in 1991. While the property at 1777 Colfax Avenue S does not have any historical significance and was not historically associated with the John Lind House, it became part of the same zoning lot as 1775 Colfax Avenue S at the time of purchase in 1991.

SUMMARY OF APPLICANT'S PROPOSAL:

The applicant is proposing to demolish a small entry porch on the rear of the structure and construct a single story, 11' x 8' kitchen addition in roughly the same footprint. Exterior modifications to the structure also include removing two double-hung windows to allow the construction of a new rear entry flanked by two double-hung windows in new openings and creating a second new rear entry by converting an existing window in the butler's pantry to a doorway. These alterations are proposed to allow the existing kitchen and breakfast room to be reversed, to convert the butler's pantry to a rear entry and to remodel an existing bathroom.

The information submitted by the applicant asserts that, while there was likely a porch in this location historically, the current rear entry porch is not original to the structure. This is based on contemporary construction and an analysis of the existing materials, including modern wrought iron railings.

The proposed addition will be clad with brick matching the existing structure and brick salvaged through the creation of the new rear entries and openings. The mortar color and composition and joint profile will also match the existing. The addition will have a limestone water table, matching the existing structure. To differentiate the new addition from the historic structure, the east wall of the addition will be recessed two inches from the adjoining wall and the north wall will be recessed 1'9" from the north elevation. Unlike the other corners of the house, the corner of the addition will not have any brick quoins. The addition will have a hip roof, similar to the existing porch roof.

The new windows proposed on the rear elevation will be wood and have simulated divided lights with space bars to achieve a muntin profile similar to the existing windows. The openings and window configuration are consistent with the existing windows, including limestone sills, brick flat-arched panels with brick keystones and brick molding. The windows will be recessed from the wall at a depth that matches the existing windows. The new window openings will have wood combination storm/screen windows. The two doors proposed on this elevation are full-view doors with wood storm doors. The applicant is also proposing a 16' x 33.5' masonry terrace in the rear yard, directly abutting the house, which would be accessed from the new rear entry and breakfast room. The terrace will have a brick base with cast stone nosing aligning with the water table of the existing historic structure. The terrace will also have a stone balustrade that recalls the wooden balustrade on the front porch of the house. The stone will match the color of the limestone on the house.

In addition to the alterations to the structure, the applicant is proposing to demolish an existing detached garage that was constructed in 1986 and construct a new detached garage on the

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development
BZH-27588

south side of the site, on the parcel addressed as 1777 Colfax Avenue S. The proposed three-stall garage will be 23.5' x 40.5 feet. The applicant is proposing wood or HardiPlank siding as the primary exterior material. The garage is proposed to have a gambrel roof (similar to but not matching the pitch of the roof on the principal structure) with three shed-roofed dormers on the front elevation. Two brick pillars that flank each side of the existing driveway will be removed and the driveway will be relocated to the south side of the site, on the property at 1777 Colfax Avenue S. Four canopy trees will be planted between the detached garage and the street.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Staff has not received any public comment regarding the proposed project. Any correspondence received will be forwarded to the Commission for review.

Findings as required by the Minneapolis Preservation Code:

The Minneapolis Community Planning and Economic Development Department has analyzed the application based on the findings required by the Minneapolis Preservation Ordinance. Before approving a certificate of appropriateness, and based upon the evidence presented in each application submitted, the commission shall make findings based upon, but not limited to, the following:

(1) The alteration is compatible with and continues to support the criteria of significance and period of significance for which the landmark or historic district was designated.

As conditioned, the proposed alterations are compatible with and continue to support the criteria of significance and period of significance for which the landmark was designated. The John Lind House is designated for John Lind's contributions to political history; the building's period of significance is from 1905-1930. The proposed rear addition will not significantly impact the original construction and the rear entry porch that is proposed for demolition is not original to the structure. The other alterations are designed to have minimal impact on the historic landmark. The addition is designed in a sensitive manner that will be subordinate to the original construction. The materials proposed will be complimentary to the original brick construction.

The proposed terrace is located in the rear yard and is minimally visible from the street. While the terrace will directly abut the house, it is a reversible alteration. The proposed materials recall features of the existing structure, including the balustrade on the front porch, the limestone water table and a stone material that matches the color of the limestone on the John Lind House.

The garage is proposed on a portion of the site that was not historically associated with the John Lind House. As conditioned, the garage will be compatible with the criteria of significance and period of significance. The requested modifications to the roof pitch and front façade will result in a design that is consistent with character and design of the historic

structure, but will not mimic it to the extent that the garage may detract from the character and significance of the John Lind House.

(2) The alteration is compatible with and supports the interior and/or exterior designation in which the property was designated.

The proposed addition is compatible with and supports the exterior designation of the property. This home stands as an example of Georgian Revival architecture. The modifications proposed to the rear, including the new window openings and entries, will maintain a sense of symmetry and utilize brick as an exterior material. Windows will be wood, consistent with the existing windows. The proposed alterations are intended to balance preservation of the original features of the home while allowing more modern features and interior modifications to the kitchen, bath and butler's pantry. Materials that are impacted by the proposed alterations, including brick and the existing windows, will be salvaged for future use and for use in the proposed addition.

The proposed rear addition respects the scale, size and massing of the historic structure and will not be visible from the public street. The addition will have the same footprint as the existing porch that will be removed and is not original to the structure. The proposed addition and proposed openings will disrupt the original design of the rear elevation of the house but the front and side elevations will continue to communicate the details and style that Whitney utilized in the original design. The proposed terrace is located in the rear yard and is minimally visible from the street. While the terrace will directly abut the house, it is a reversible alteration. The proposed materials recall features of the existing structure, including the balustrade on the front porch, the limestone water table and a stone material that matches the color of the limestone on the John Lind House.

The interior modifications are limited to the rear of the house, including a modified floor plan in the kitchen and breakfast room, modifications to a powder room and converting the butler's pantry to a rear entry. The designation does not include the home's interior.

The proposed garage is on a portion of the site that was not historically associated with the John Lind House and the existing detached garage proposed for demolition is not original to the property. The brick pillars that flank each side of the existing driveway that are proposed to be removed do not appear to be original to the site. As such, these alterations are also compatible with the exterior designation. An existing plaque with "Lind" inscribed on it will be retained and installed elsewhere on the site.

(3) The alteration is compatible with and will ensure continued integrity of the landmark or historic district for which the district was designated.

As conditioned, the proposed work is compatible with and will ensure continued integrity of the landmark for which it is designated. The proposed addition will not affect the building's location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, or association. The detached garage is proposed on a portion of the site that was not part of the property at the time of designation or during the time John Lind resided in the home, thus not impacting the historic setting.

(4) The alteration will not materially impair the significance and integrity of the landmark, historic district or nominated property under interim protection as evidenced by the consistency of alterations with the applicable design guidelines adopted by the commission.

No local guidelines have been adopted by the Minneapolis Heritage Preservation Commission for the John Lind Residence.

(5) The alteration will not materially impair the significance and integrity of the landmark, historic district or nominated property under interim protection as evidenced by the consistency of alterations with the recommendations contained in *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*.

The alteration is in compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*. If the addition is approved, the property will continue to be used as a single-family residence; its historic use. The proposed addition does not destroy historic materials, features, or spatial relationships that characterize the property. The design of the addition will allow for it to be compatible with the existing structure, yet distinguished from the original with a modest setback and absence of brick quoins at the corner. The other alterations on the rear will require removal of historic materials, such as brick and windows, but those materials will be retained for future use and for use in the proposed addition. These alterations are on the rear of the structure and will not impair the significance or integrity of the structure.

(6) The certificate of appropriateness conforms to all applicable regulations of this preservation ordinance and is consistent with the applicable policies of the comprehensive plan and applicable preservation policies in small area plans adopted by the city council.

The proposed work is consistent with the *Minneapolis Plan for Sustainable Growth*, the City's Comprehensive Plan. Comprehensive plan policy 8.1 states that the City will, "Preserve, maintain, and designate districts, landmarks, and historic resources which serve as reminders of the city's architecture, history, and culture." The proposed work allows the property to be maintained as a single-family residence while respecting its historic significance.

Implementation Step 8.1.1 of the comprehensive plan indicates that the City shall protect historic resources from modifications that are not sensitive to their historic significance. As conditioned, the project will be sensitive to its historical character.

(7) Destruction of any property. Before approving a certificate of appropriateness that involves the destruction, in whole or in part, of any landmark, property in an historic district or nominated property under interim protection, the commission shall make findings that the destruction is necessary to correct an unsafe or dangerous condition on the property, or that there are no reasonable alternatives to the destruction. In determining whether reasonable alternatives exist, the commission shall consider, but not be limited to, the significance of the property, the integrity of the property and the economic value or usefulness of the existing structure, including its current use, costs of renovation and feasible alternative uses. The commission may

delay a final decision for a reasonable period of time to allow parties interested in preserving the property a reasonable opportunity to act to protect it.

The project does not involve the destruction of the property.

Before approving a certificate of appropriateness, and based upon the evidence presented in each application submitted, the commission shall make findings that alterations are proposed in a manner that demonstrates that the Applicant has made adequate consideration of the following documents and regulations:

(8) Adequate consideration of the description and statement of significance in the original nomination upon which designation of the landmark or historic district was based.

The applicant has given adequate consideration to the original nomination upon which the designation of the John Lind House was based. The original nomination emphasizes the life of John Lind and his significance in political history and says little about the architecture of the structure. The proposed addition, on a tertiary elevation, has limited visibility and will not damage the original exterior fabric. The demolition of the existing garage and construction of the new detached garage will not impact the property's ability to communicate its historical significance.

(9) Where applicable, Adequate consideration of Title 20 of the Minneapolis Code of Ordinances, Zoning Code, Chapter 530, Site Plan Review.

The scope of work in this application does not trigger site plan review under Title 20 of the Minneapolis Code of Ordinances, Zoning Code, Chapter 530. As proposed, the alterations and addition would meet all other zoning code standards and glazing requirements for additions. Chapter 537 of the zoning code regulates accessory structures.

Accessory structures are limited to a maximum floor area of 676 square feet or ten percent of the lot area, whichever is greater, up to 1,000 square feet. Detached accessory structures greater than 676 square feet shall utilize primary exterior materials that match the primary exterior materials of the principal structure and the roof pitch shall match the roof pitch of the principal structure. The height of a detached accessory structure is limited to 12 feet (as measured to midpoint), but may be increased to 16 feet provided it meets the aforementioned requirements for materials and roof pitch. The proposed garage is 972 square feet in area and 13'10" in height. The garage is proposed to be clad with wood siding, painted to match the wood siding on the sides of the dormers on the front of the principal structure. In order to meet the requirements of Chapter 537, staff recommends that the front elevation of the garage be clad in brick to match the principal structure. The house contains a gambrel roof with a steeper pitch of 11/12 and the other pitch is unknown due to a parapet wall. The garage in the original drawings was proposed to have a gambrel roof with pitches of 8/12 and 5/12. The applicant sent an updated garage rendering to staff on January 15, 2013 with a roof pitch matching the pitch of the principal structure and gabled dormers matching the principal structure, as requested by staff. As a condition of approval, staff recommends that the roof pitch of the garage match that of the principal structure as shown in the revised plan.

(10) The typology of treatments delineated in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards

for the Treatment of Historic Properties and the associated guidelines for preserving, rehabilitating, reconstructing, and restoring historic buildings.

The application, as conditioned, complies with the rehabilitation guidelines of *the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*. The proposed addition is on a non-character defining elevation. The entry porch that is proposed for removal does not appear to be original to the structure. Therefore, the character-defining features are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed. The proposed addition is modest and respectful in relationship to the size and scale of the historic building and consistent in design. The design of the addition will allow for it to be compatible with the existing structure, yet distinguished from the original with a modest setback and absence of brick quoins at the corner. The other alterations to add/modify openings are also on a non-character defining elevation. The proposed terrace will have limited visibility from the street and is designed in a manner that makes it a reversible alteration. The proposed garage is on a portion of the site that was not originally part of the designated property. .

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The Department of Community Planning and Economic Development recommends that the Heritage Preservation Commission adopt the above findings and **approve** the Certificate of Appropriateness to allow for the replacement of a rear porch with a new rear addition and the construction of a detached garage at 1775-77 Colfax Avenue S subject to the following conditions:

1. The rear addition, windows and two entry doors, the terrace and the detached garage is the only construction approved at this time.
2. The detached garage shall include brick matching the principal structure on the front elevation, gabled dormers matching those on the principal structure and a roof pitch that matches the roof pitch of the principal structure.
3. By ordinance, approvals are valid for a period of two years from the date of the decision unless required permits are obtained and the action approval is substantially begun and proceeds in a continuous basis toward completion. Upon written request and for good cause, the planning director may grant up to a one year extension if the request is made in writing no later than January 29, 2015.
4. By ordinance, all approvals granted in this Certificate of Appropriateness shall remain in effect as long as all of the conditions and guarantees of such approvals are observed. Failure to comply with such conditions and guarantees shall constitute a violation of this Certificate of Appropriateness and may result in termination of the approval.
5. Community Planning and Economic Development staff shall review and approve the final plans and elevations prior to building permit issuance.