

**Department of Community Planning and Economic Development - Planning Division**

Certificate of Appropriateness  
BZH-27462

**Proposal:** Rear addition and repairs to existing home.

**Applicant:** Jean Rehkamp Larson, Rehkamp Larson Architects, 612-285-7275

**Address of Property:** 2225 East Lake of the Isles Parkway,  
Charles Frederick Keyes House

**Planning Staff:** Aly Pennucci, City Planner, 612-673-5342

**Date Application Deemed Complete:** August 29, 2012

**Public Hearing:** September 24, 2012

**Appeal Period Expiration:** October 5, 2012

**Ward:** 10

**Neighborhood Organization:** East Isles Residents Association

**Concurrent Review:** n/a

**Attachments:**

- Zoning Context Map
- Correspondence to Neighborhood and City Council Letters
- Project Description & findings submitted by the applicant
- Site Plan
- Floor Plans
- Elevations
- Images
- Color Renderings

Department of Community Planning and Economic Development - Planning Division  
**BZH-27462**

<b>CLASSIFICATION:</b>	
Period of Significance	1904 - 1955
Criteria of significance	Significant persons or groups (Criterion 2) Master Architect (Criterion 6)
Date of local designation	1998
Applicable Design Guidelines	<i>The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Treatment of Historic Properties</i>

<b>PROPERTY INFORMATION</b>	
Current name	Charles Frederick Keyes House
Historic Name	Charles Frederick Keyes House
Current Address	2225 East Lake of the Isles Parkway
Historic Address	2301 Lake of the Isles Boulevard
Original Construction Date	1904
Original Contractor	F.G. McMillan
Architects	Adam Lansing Dorr
Historic Use	Private Residence
Current Use	Private Residence
Proposed Use	Private Residence

**BACKGROUND:**

The Charles Frederick Keyes house is a 2.5 story single-family dwelling constructed in 1904 at 2225 East Lake of the Isles Parkway. Charles and Ruth Keyes chose Minneapolis architect Adam Lansing Dorr to design a new single-family dwelling. Dorr, one of the most prolific architects of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries in Minneapolis, chose a blend of Craftsman and Queen Anne architecture for the Keyes House. Charles and Ruth Keyes were active civic leaders in Minneapolis for many years, involved in the Taxpayers Association and the Sanitary Commission. Charles also served on the Parents and Teachers Council, the Citizens Committee on Public Health and the University of Minnesota Alumni Association. In commemoration of the active lives of the Keyes family, as well as the association with Adam Lansing Dorr, the exterior of the Keyes house was designated by the Minneapolis City Council as a local landmark on June 26, 1998.

The wood frame house sits on a limestone foundation and has wide, horizontal lap siding on the first floor and narrow, horizontal lap siding on the second floor. Asphalt shingles cover the roof. The existing residence consists of approximately 950 square feet per floor and was constructed in a Midwestern four-square plan where the rooms were arranged around a central landing and stairway. Two porches were also included in the design: an open front porch and an attached rear porch. A detached garage, approximately 20 feet by 22 feet, was constructed to the rear of the dwelling in 1923.

The house has had two previous owners and remains relatively intact as it was in 1904. Based on information provided in the City's designation study, it appears that the Keyes family made a few changes to the dwelling that include adding a window on the second story of the south elevation in the master bedroom and removing the original front porch railings in favor of no railing. In reviewing historic photos it appears that the decking for the porch was removed and the stairs pushed in to abut the front door.

**SUMMARY OF APPLICANT'S PROPOSAL:**

The applicant intends to renovate and remodel the existing dwelling, add an approximately 2,125 square foot addition and demolish the existing detached garage. The rehabilitation will include the following:

- Restoring the front porch to the original design
- Replacing the existing roof made of asphalt shingles with cedar shingles
- Repairs to the exterior lap siding and trim
- Removal of an existing side door and replacing that with a new window
- Removal of the existing detached garage
- Window repairs as needed (no replacement) and the addition of new wood combination storm windows
- Removal of the rear mudroom and enclosed two-story porch to accommodate a rear addition.

The addition includes an approximately 1,190 square foot two-story addition to the rear of the existing structure, a 225 square foot single-story breezeway/gallery addition leading to an approximately 710 square foot attached, single-story garage. The two-story addition will allow for an expanded living room area, new kitchen, dining room, master suite and mudroom leading to the gallery and attached garage. Included in the proposed attached garage addition are a mud room and a guest suite.

The applicant has provided a detailed description of the intended scope of work as well as a site plan, floor plans and elevation drawings detailing existing and proposed conditions (see the project description and plans in the appendix).

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

Staff has received no public comment on the proposed project.

***Findings as required by the Minneapolis Preservation Code:***

*The Planning Division of the Minneapolis Community Planning and Economic Development Department has analyzed the application based on the findings required by the Minneapolis Preservation Ordinance. Before approving a certificate of appropriateness, and based upon the evidence presented in each application submitted, the commission shall make findings based upon, but not limited to, the following:*

- (1) *The alteration is compatible with and continues to support the criteria of significance and period of significance for which the landmark or historic district was designated.***

The proposed alteration is compatible with and continues to support the criteria of significance and period of significance for which the landmark was designated. The Keyes house is designated for the association with the lives of significant persons and for its association with the architect, Adam Lansing Dorr. The proposed alterations will restore the front porch to its original design and replace the roofing materials with cedar shingles which the applicants assert are more period sensitive. In addition, the proposal includes needed repairs and maintenance to the front (west), north and south elevations that will help re-establish and restore some of the original design elements. The addition is located entirely to the rear and will be minimally visible from the public street.

- (2) *The alteration is compatible with and supports the interior and/or exterior designation in which the property was designated.***

The proposed addition is compatible with and supports the exterior designation of the property. This home stands as an example of Dorr's style that is recognized for its addition to the Craftsman aesthetic in Minneapolis. The proposed alterations are intended to balance preserving the original features of the home while allowing more

modern features and a house size that is more in keeping with the size of homes in the area.

The proposed addition will disrupt the original design of the rear (east) elevation of the house but the front and side elevations will continue to communicate the details and style that Dorr utilized in the original design. While the rear addition is significant in size, it is designed to be minimally visible from the street. The removal of the side entrance is needed to accommodate the revised interior floor plan requested by the applicant. This door was part of the original design of the house but was not the primary entrance and not considered a significant feature.

Significant changes are proposed for the interior of the structure to accommodate a more modern floor plan. While the local designation is for the exterior, the designation study notes that the interior is in excellent condition and throughout the interior the original wood and its finish has been maintained along with many of the built-in features. It is not certain what features will be maintained or incorporated into the new layout; staff encourages the applicant to consider minimizing the changes proposed to the four-square configuration of the original home and where that is not possible, to document significant features prior to their alteration or removal and either incorporate them into the new design or, if feasible, preserve in some other manner.

**(3) *The alteration is compatible with and will ensure continued integrity of the landmark or historic district for which the district was designated.***

The proposed work is compatible with and will ensure continued integrity of the landmark for which it is designated. The home is oriented towards the west, facing the lake, and the principal elevations exhibit the details of the Craftsman style while maintaining elements of Queen Anne. These design features will not be disrupted by the proposed addition. The proposed addition is located entirely to the rear of the principal structure and steps in 3 feet 3 inches on the north side and 2 feet from the existing south wall, minimizing the visibility from the street and defining the addition from the original structure. The materials on the addition blend the style and design of the historic structure, such as lap siding, wide flat trim boards, and exposed rafter tails, while adding subtle changes that differentiate the new from the old. In the original design, the exposed rafter tails are interrupted above the original windows, while in the new addition there will be no interruption of the rafter tails. On the first floor of the addition, on the south elevation, there will be a large glass and wood sliding door system and on the north side the siding will be vertical rather than horizontal to differentiate it from the historic structure. Additionally, the roof over the gallery/breezeway will be a copper metal roof system.

**(4) *The alteration will not materially impair the significance and integrity of the landmark, historic district or nominated property under interim protection as evidenced by the consistency of alterations with the applicable design guidelines adopted by the commission.***

No local guidelines have been adopted by the Minneapolis Heritage Preservation Commission for the Charles Frederick Keyes house.

- (5) ***The alteration will not materially impair the significance and integrity of the landmark, historic district or nominated property under interim protection as evidenced by the consistency of alterations with the recommendations contained in The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.***

The alteration will not materially impair the significance and integrity of the landmark. If the addition is approved, the property will continue to be used as a single-family residence; its historic use. The proposed addition does not significantly destroy historic materials, features or spatial relationships that characterize the property. The proposed work will be differentiated from the original in terms of the design and materials described in finding number three.

The *Secretary of the Interior's* requirements for new additions to historic buildings include the following guidance: "Constructing a new addition so that there is the least possible loss of historic materials and so that character-defining features are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed." The proposal aims to minimize the changes to the historic materials while also giving attention to components of the original design that are in need of repair, such as restoring the original porch, providing general maintenance to the rotting wood trim and blistering paint and repairing the existing windows and adding storms that will not require removing the original windows. Many of the more significant features of this home, as described in the original designation study, such as the irregular window pattern, the bay windows and dormers found on the west, south and north elevations, the use of wide lap siding on the main level and narrow lap siding on the second story and the low-pitched, hipped roof with intersecting gabled dormers, will be maintained on the north, south and west elevations.

The proposal also includes removing the existing detached garage on the property that was built during the period of significance for the landmark. However, while the garage incorporates similar exterior materials as the house, it was built 19 years after the house was constructed and there is no evidence to suggest that the architect for the house, Dorr, was associated with the design or construction of the detached garage.

- (6) ***The certificate of appropriateness conforms to all applicable regulations of this preservation ordinance and is consistent with the applicable policies of the comprehensive plan and applicable preservation policies in small area plans adopted by the city council.***

The proposed work is consistent with the *Minneapolis Plan for Sustainable Growth*, the City's Comprehensive Plan. Comprehensive plan policy 8.1 states that the City will, "Preserve, maintain, and designate districts, landmarks, and historic resources which serve as reminders of the city's architecture, history, and culture." The proposed work allows the property to be maintained as a single-family residence while respecting its historic significance.

Implementation Step 8.1.1 of the comprehensive plan indicates that the City shall protect historic resources from modifications that are not sensitive to their historic significance. The project will be sensitive to its historical character.

- (7) ***Destruction of any property. Before approving a certificate of appropriateness that involves the destruction, in whole or in part, of any landmark, property in an historic district or nominated property under interim protection, the commission shall make findings that the destruction is necessary to correct an unsafe or dangerous condition on the property, or that there are no reasonable alternatives to the destruction. In determining whether reasonable alternatives exist, the commission shall consider, but not be limited to, the significance of the property, the integrity of the property and the economic value or usefulness of the existing structure, including its current use, costs of renovation and feasible alternative uses. The commission may delay a final decision for a reasonable period of time to allow parties interested in preserving the property a reasonable opportunity to act to protect it.***

The project does not involve the destruction of the property.

***Before approving a certificate of appropriateness, and based upon the evidence presented in each application submitted, the commission shall make findings that alterations are proposed in a manner that demonstrates that the Applicant has made adequate consideration of the following documents and regulations:***

- (8) ***Adequate consideration of the description and statement of significance in the original nomination upon which designation of the landmark or historic district was based.***

The Applicant has given adequate consideration to the original nomination upon which the designation of the Charles Frederick Keyes House was based. The original nomination emphasized the importance of the west façade facing the lake, the eaves, the dormers on the west, south and north elevations, the asymmetry of the fenestration patterns and the front and rear porches. The addition requires the removal of the existing rear porch and will significantly alter the east (rear) elevation. This portion of the historic structure is not visible from the street and while it will alter the original design it minimizes the impact of the changes by disrupting only one elevation that will help justify (financially) the maintenance and repairs to the west, south and north elevations.

- (9) ***Where applicable, Adequate consideration of Title 20 of the Minneapolis Code of Ordinances, Zoning Code, Chapter 530, Site Plan Review.***

The scope of work in this application does not trigger site plan review under Title 20 of the Minneapolis Code of Ordinances, Zoning Code, Chapter 530. As proposed, the addition would meet the all other zoning code standards and glazing requirements for additions.

- (10) ***The typology of treatments delineated in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and the associated guidelines for preserving, rehabilitating, reconstructing, and restoring historic buildings.***

The application complies with the rehabilitation guidelines of *the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*. The majority of the character defining features called out in the designation report reference the irregular window pattern, the bay windows and dormers found on the west, south and north elevations, the use of wide lap siding on the main level and narrow lap siding on the second story and the low-pitched, hipped roof with intersecting gabled dormers. These features will be maintained on the north, south and west (front) elevations. In addition, the proposal is differentiated from the old in terms of design details (i.e. the exposed rafter tails above the new windows), stepping the addition in, the use of subtly different exterior materials on portions of the addition in a way that makes clear what is historic and what is new.

## **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

The Department of Community Planning and Economic Development - Planning Division recommends that the Heritage Preservation Commission adopt the above findings and **approve** the Certificate of Appropriateness to allow for a rear addition at 2225 East Lake of the Isles Parkway subject to the following conditions:

1. The rear addition, alterations and repairs outlined in the applicant's project description is the only work approved at this time.
2. By ordinance, approvals are valid for a period of one year from the date of the decision unless required permits are obtained and the action approval is substantially begun and proceeds in a continuous basis toward completion. Upon written request and for good cause, the planning director may grant up to a one year extension if the request is made in writing no later than September 24, 2013.
3. By ordinance, all approvals granted in this Certificate of Appropriateness shall remain in effect as long as all of the conditions and guarantees of such approvals are observed. Failure to comply with such conditions and guarantees shall constitute a violation of this Certificate of Appropriateness and may result in termination of the approval.
4. CPED-Planning Staff shall review and approve the final plans and elevations prior to building permit issuance.