

**Community Planning & Economic Development
Planning Division**
250 South 4th Street, Room 110
Minneapolis, MN 55415-1385



City of Minneapolis
*Department of Community Planning
& Economic Development - CPED*

MEMORANDUM

TO: Heritage Preservation Commission
FROM: Aly Pennucci, AICP
DATE: August 21, 2012
RE: Conceptual Review, 2225 East Lake of the Isles Pkwy- Charles Fredrick Keyes House addition

Background:

The Charles Frederick Keyes house is a 2.5 story single-family dwelling constructed in 1904 at 2225 East Lake of the Isles Parkway. Charles and Ruth Keyes chose Minneapolis architect Adam Lansing Dorr to complete their design. Dorr, one of the most prolific architects of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries in Minneapolis, chose a blend of Queen Anne and Craftsman architecture for the Keyes House. Charles and Ruth Keyes were active civic leaders in Minneapolis for many years, involved in Tax Payers Associations and the Sanitary Commission. Charles also served on the Parents and Teachers Council, the Citizens Committee on Public Health and the University of Minnesota Alumni Association. In commemoration of the active lives of the Keyes family, as well as the association with Adam Lansing Dorr, the exterior of the Keyes house was designated by the Minneapolis City Council as a local landmark on June 26, 1998.

The wood frame house sits on a limestone foundation and has wide, horizontal lap siding on the first floor and narrow, horizontal lap siding on the second floor. Asphalt shingles cover the roof. The existing residence consists of approximately 950 square feet per floor and was constructed in a Midwestern four-square plan where the rooms were arranged around a central landing and stairway. Two porches were also included in the design: an open front porch and an attached rear porch. A detached garage, approximately 20 feet by 22 feet, was constructed to the rear of the dwelling in 1923 during the period of significance for this landmark.

The house has had two previous owners and remains relatively intact as it was in 1904. Based on information provided in the City's designation study, it appears that the Keyes family made a few changes to the dwelling that include adding a window on the second story of the south elevation in the master bedroom and removing the original front porch railings in favor of no railing. In reviewing historic photos it appears that the decking for the porch was removed and the stairs pushed in to abut the front door.

Summary of Applicant's Proposal:

The applicant intends to renovate and remodel the existing dwelling, add an approximately 1,500 square foot addition and demolish the existing detached garage. The rehabilitation will include restoring the front porch to the original design, reroofing the house with more period sensitive materials, repairs to the exterior lap siding and trim, removal of an existing side door and replace with a window and removing the rear mudroom and enclosed two-story porch to accommodate an addition. The addition includes an approximately 600 square foot two-story addition to the rear of the existing structure, a 225 square foot breezeway (noted as gallery on the plans) single-story addition leading to an approximately 710 square foot attached, single-story garage. Included in the garage addition is a guest suite and a mud room.

The applicant has provided a detailed description of the intended scope of work as well as a site plan, floor plans and elevation drawings detailing existing and proposed conditions (see the project description and plans in the appendix).

Discussion Items

Staff and the applicant are looking for general feedback on the proposed project, but are particularly interested in feedback regarding the following items:

Addition – size, location, attached garage

The applicant is proposing an approximately 1,500 square foot addition, which will almost double the gross floor areas of the existing structure (approximately 1,800 square feet). The proposed addition will be located to the rear of the existing dwelling to minimize visibility from the public sidewalk and street. The two-story portion of the proposed addition steps in 3.25 feet from the existing north wall and only one (1) foot from the existing south wall. The proposed addition also includes a long breezeway/gallery space that leads to a new attached garage. A detached garage accessed via an alley is more in keeping with typical single-family development patterns in Minneapolis and is more consistent with the early development of this property that included a detached garage. The majority of the properties in the area have a detached garage accessed via the alley. Staff is concerned that the size of the proposed addition is not consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's standard regarding compatibility with the historic size, scale and proportion, and massing of the original dwelling.

Removal of existing detached garage

The applicant is proposing to demolish the existing detached garage that was constructed in 1923 during the period of significance for this landmark. The existing garage is a wood frame structure that includes a low pitch roof and narrow, horizontal lap siding that matches the house. Staff is concerned that the removal of the detached garage is not consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's standard regarding destruction of historic materials, features and spatial relationships that characterize the property and could not meet the finding that the destruction is necessary to correct an unsafe or dangerous condition on the property.

Front Porch

Based on information provided in the original designation study, historic photos and analysis by the applicants (see sheets HA2-HA3 in appendix), it appears that the original front porch was removed at some point prior to the local designation and replaced with steps and a wider ground level patio without railings. The applicants have proposed rebuilding the porch in a design consistent with the original design of the structure. This proposal is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's standard regarding substantiating any replacement of missing features with physical evidence.

North side entrance

The applicants are proposing to remove the existing side secondary entrance on the north elevation and to replace it with a new window to accommodate the proposed floor plan that includes a larger living room space. The side entrance was part of the original design of the house but was not the primary entrance and may not be considered a significant feature under the Secretary of the Interior's standards characterizing the property.

Roof materials:

The applicant is proposing to reroof the house using cedar shingles or similar materials more commonly used in 1904. The existing dwelling includes green, asphalt shingles. Building permit records indicate the dwelling was reroofed in 1977. It is unlikely that asphalt shingles were used in the original construction of the dwelling in 1904, however, evidence has not been provided to determine what the original roofing material was. That being said, cedar shingles would be more consistent with materials used in residential construction in the early 1900s. With more research the applicants could demonstrate that this proposal is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's standard regarding substantiating any replacement of missing features with physical evidence.

Windows:

The applicants do not have specific plans for repairs to the existing windows on the front, north and south elevations but would like to discuss the potential to replace the existing storm windows with a fully operable storm window with screens. The applicants will provide photo examples at the meeting. In addition, the proposal includes a new egress well on the south side of the existing structure. The proposed egress window will use an existing opening but the new window and well will meet present day building code standards for egress.

Interior renovations:

Significant changes are proposed for the interior of the structure to accommodate a more modern floor plan. While the local designation is for the exterior, the designation study notes that the interior is in excellent condition and throughout the interior the original wood and its finish has been maintained along with many of the built-in features. At this point staff it is not certain what features will be maintained or incorporated into the new layout or if there is an opportunity to document these features prior to their alteration or removal and either incorporate them into the new design or, if feasible, preserved in some other manner.

Action Requested

The Heritage Preservation Commission is asked to provide the applicant and staff with feedback and guidance on the proposed project, particularly regarding the items outlined above. This input will be used by the applicant as they prepare a formal application, and by staff when reviewing the application and preparing the staff report.

Attachments

1. Project description provided by the applicant
2. Preliminary site plan, floor plans and elevations provided by the applicant