

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT**

FILE NAME: One of the Mayhew Building Townhouses, 620 9th Street South (APN 2602924230063), BZH-25758

CATEGORY/DISTRICT: South Ninth Street Historic District

CLASSIFICATION: Certificate of Appropriateness

APPLICANT: Grant Carlson, 612-720-3448

DATE OF APPLICATION: January 22, 2009

PUBLICATION DATE: March 3, 2009

DATE OF HEARING: March 10, 2009

APPEAL PERIOD EXPIRATION: March 20, 2009

STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: John Smoley, Ph.D., (612) 673-2830

REQUEST: Add deck to rear roof

A. SITE DESCRIPTION:

620 9th Street South is a flat roofed, three-story brick townhouse located just northwest of the intersection of Park Avenue and 9th Street South in the 9th Street South Historic District (Attachment 1).

The South Ninth Street Historic District is locally significant for its depiction of architectural styles and community planning principles during the period 1886-1915. The multi-family dwellings in this district highlight this neighborhood's function as a transitional zone connecting the downtown commercial core with outlying lower density residential districts.¹

Minneapolis' economic boom of the mid-1880s encouraged a rapid influx of new residents and created a strong demand for housing. Architects and builders responded by introducing the row house to the Minneapolis streetscape. The proximity of the South Ninth Street Historic District to the downtown business district and streetcar lines made higher density dwellings appealing to developers and acceptable to upper and middle class workers, thanks to the variety of dwelling options made available by prominent local architects. These row houses continue to mark the evolution of the urban city from its village roots.²

¹ Beth Bartz, Thonda Carolan, and Paul Larson, "Local Heritage Preservation Designation Study, South Ninth Street District," 1989, 9th Street S. District Designation Study Folder, Files of the South Ninth Street Historic District, Planning Division, Community Planning and Economic Development Department, Minneapolis, MN, 12.

² Beth Bartz, Thonda Carolan, and Paul Larson, "Local Heritage Preservation Designation Study, South Ninth Street District," 1989, 9th Street S. District Designation Study Folder, Files of the South Ninth Street Historic District, Planning Division, Community Planning and Economic Development Department, Minneapolis, MN, 13-18.

The exterior portions of 620 9th Street South contribute to the district's significance as part of the Mayhew Building, a series of townhouses from 614-626 9th Street South constructed in 1886. Designed by Frederick A. Clark, this building exhibits numerous decorative details including arches, corbelled towers, a variety of roof parapets, varied entryways, and window moldings. Facade breaks and varied entryways divide the structure into seven principle townhouses. The brick exterior is punctuated by a varied, though recognizable, pattern of fenestration on each floor and on each townhouse.³

B. PROPOSED CHANGES:

620 South 9th Street South currently consists of three apartments. The building owner would like to construct an outdoor deck on the second floor of the building, and desires to add a balustrade, wood decking, and wood joists to create this space, currently existing as an unfinished rooftop area set behind the three-story roof at the front of the building (Attachment 2).

C. ANALYSIS:

Certificate of Appropriateness

Article VI of the city of Minneapolis' Heritage Preservation Regulations state:

Certificates of appropriateness are established to protect landmarks, historic districts and nominated properties under interim protection by providing the commission with authority to review and approve or deny all proposed alterations to a landmark, property in an historic district or nominated property under interim protection...

...Any alteration of a landmark, property in an historic district or nominated property under interim protection shall be prohibited except where authorized by a certificate of appropriateness approved by the commission...

...Before approving a certificate of appropriateness, the commission shall make findings that the alteration will not materially impair the integrity of the landmark, historic district or nominated property under interim protection and is consistent with the applicable design guidelines adopted by the commission, or if design guidelines have not been adopted, is consistent with the recommendations contained in The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, except as otherwise provided in this section...

As conditioned, the proposed balustrade, decking, and wood joists will not materially impair the integrity of the subject property and are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the Ninth Street South Historic District Design Guidelines.

³ Beth Bartz, Thonda Carolan, and Paul Larson, "Local Heritage Preservation Designation Study, South Ninth Street District," 1989, 9th Street S. District Designation Study Folder, Files of the South Ninth Street Historic District, Planning Division, Community Planning and Economic Development Department, Minneapolis, MN, 6.

Integrity

Both the city of Minneapolis' Heritage Preservation Regulations and the National Register of Historic Places identify integrity as the authenticity of historic properties and recognize seven aspects that define a property's integrity: location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association. The most widely recognized standard in the United States for determining adverse effects to the integrity of historic properties is the Secretary's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (36 CFR part 68), one part of which is the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. In all but rare circumstances, alterations consistent with the Secretary's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties produce no adverse effects to historic properties. The proposed alterations at 620 9th Street South comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, as discussed below. Staff finds no unusual circumstances that cause the proposed project to meet these standards while materially impairing the integrity of the subject property.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation ("New Additions to Historic Buildings") recommend constructing a new addition so that there is the least possible loss of historic materials and so that character-defining features are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed. The roofing materials at the rear of the property are not historic materials nor are they character defining features. The applicant has not submitted details of the proposed decking and floor joists. Staff recommends conditioning the project to ensure the proposed balustrade, decking and joists do not obscure, damage, or destroy historic building materials.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation ("New Additions to Historic Buildings") recommend locating the attached exterior addition at the rear or on an inconspicuous side of a historic building; and limiting its size and scale in relationship to the historic building. They also recommend placing new additions such as balconies on non-character-defining elevations and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic building. The applicant proposed locating the deck at the rear of the building on top of a second-story roof. Views of the deck shall be completely screened from 9th Street South by the third-story roof that exists in front of this second-story roof. The deck shall not extend beyond the existing second-story roof which comprises only a small portion of the entire roof area.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation ("New Additions to Historic Buildings") recommend designing new additions in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new. The proposed balustrade consists of square black metal balusters supporting a square black metal railing devoid of ornamentation. This balustrade complements the existing building by utilizing a muted color and material (metal) available during the district's period of significance. This balustrade distinguishes itself from the historic portions of the building by being thin metal, rather than the thick masonry exhibited in the third-story rooftop balustrade evident on the front of the building (Attachment 2).

Ninth Street South Historic District Design Guidelines

The Ninth Street South Historic District Design Guidelines (“Additional Guidelines For Rehabilitation of Buildings - Roofing”) state that roof-top additions which project above parapet walls such as decks shall be set back from the primary building so they are not visible from opposite sides of the street. As indicated in Attachment 2, the proposed deck (highlighted in yellow) shall only be visible from the alley behind the building and to northbound vehicular traffic along Park Avenue. Currently, travel along Park Avenue is restricted to southbound traffic for vehicle and bicycles, though pedestrians may legally travel north.

D. FINDINGS:

1. 620 9th Street South, a portion of the Mayhew Building, is a contributing resource in the South Ninth Street Historic District.
2. As conditioned, the proposed project will not materially impair the integrity of the subject property.
3. As conditioned, the proposed project complies with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the Ninth Street South Historic District Design Guidelines.
4. The proposed deck will have a positive effect on the surrounding properties and remainder of the district. By increasing the perceived and actual visibility of the space in the alley and parking lot behind the subject property, this deck will decrease crime in the space in accordance with the principles of crime prevention through environmental design (CPTED).

E. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the Heritage Preservation Commission adopt staff findings and **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed deck subject to the following conditions:

1. The proposed balustrade, decking and joists shall not obscure, damage, or destroy historic building materials.
2. CPED-Planning Preservation Staff shall review and approve the final plans and elevations prior to building permit issuance.

Attachments

- A. Vicinity Map
- B. Application
- C. Article VI, City of Minneapolis Heritage Preservation Regulations
- D. Ninth Street South Historic District Design Guidelines
- E. Contemporary Photos
- F. Plans
- G. Public Comment