

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT**

FILE NAME: 708 1st Street North (Itasca C and D Warehouses)

CATEGORY/DISTRICT: Contributing structure to the St. Anthony Falls Historic District

CLASSIFICATION: Certificate of Appropriateness

APPLICANT: Ann Kincaid, (612) 343-0389

DATE OF APPLICATION: March 12, 2008

PUBLICATION DATE: April 15, 2008

DATE OF HEARING: April 22, 2008

APPEAL PERIOD EXPIRATION : May 2, 2008

STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: Aaron Hanauer (612) 673-2494

REQUEST: Addition of a roof-top deck and sunroom

A. SITE DESCRIPTION AND BACKGROUND:

The subject property contains the Itasca C and D Warehouse Buildings located at 708 First Street North. The Itasca C and D Warehouses are contributing structures to the St. Anthony Falls Historic District, and are located in the St. Anthony Falls North First Street Warehouse Sub-areas. These buildings, which are connected, are six-story buildings built in 1906 by the architectural firm of Edwin and Halden.

The Itasca C and D Warehouses are modest in architectural detail compared to the Itasca A and B Warehouses to the east and the Security Warehouse to the west. The less ornate buildings' front façades contain red brick and cream colored widow sills. The first floors possess six commercial store front windows and three entrances. Below the second and sixth story windows are belt courses. At the top of the building, a brick corbelling runs along the cornice line.

B. PROPOSAL:

The applicant, Ms. Kincaid, is proposing the construction of a roof-top addition on the Itasca D Building that includes two parts: a deck and sunroom (see Appendix A). The open deck is proposed to be approximately 200 square feet and extend to the northern parapet wall. In order for this open deck to meet building code, the applicant is proposing a cable rail that is 42 inch tall and would extend the length of the deck; 24 inches of the rail would be exposed since the parapet wall is 18 inches high (see Appendix A8).

The second part of the project is a sunroom that would include three parts: a rain-water collecting pergola, vegetated roof, and solar panels. The entire structure would not be visible from the primary façade along 1st Street North; however, it will be visible from West River Parkway North and the Mississippi River (see Appendix C). The first part of the structure, the rain-water collecting pergola, would be built to a height of 10 feet and setback 18 feet from the north parapet. Precipitation that runs off this structure would be directed to a rain barrel on the eastern side of the pergola. The second part, the vegetated roof, is set behind the pergola. The tallest point of this element, 14.25 feet high, is 35.5 feet from the northern parapet. The third part, the solar panels, are set behind the vegetated roof and are shorter in height than the vegetated roof.

C. ANALYSIS:

The Saint-Anthony Falls Historic District Guidelines for the North First Street Warehouse area does not address proposed additions to historic buildings. However, the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation does. The applicant's proposal does meet the Secretary of Interior Standards for design, location, size, and scale. Below are the recommended guidelines from the Secretary of Interior Standards for design, location, size, and scale, and an analysis of how the proposal meets these guidelines.

Design

Guidelines

1. Designing new additions in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new
2. Considering the attached exterior addition both in terms of the new use and the appearance of other buildings in the historic district or neighborhood. Design for the new work may be contemporary or may reference design motifs from the historic building. In either case, it should always be clearly differentiated from the historic building and be compatible in terms of mass, materials, relationship of solids to voids, and color.

Analysis

The proposed addition does make clear what is historic and what is new by using a contemporary design with low-roof pitch rather than the flat roof of the building. In addition, the design does not detract from the building by having a dark brown color that blends in with the existing roof-top addition.

Location

Guidelines

1. Locating the attached exterior addition at the rear or on an inconspicuous side of a historic building

Analysis

The proposed addition meets the location guideline since it will not be visible from the primary façade, 1st Street North. In addition, the proposed addition is located at the rear of the building and setback 18 feet from the northern parapet which further reduces its visibility from West River Parkway North and the Mississippi River.

Size and Scale

Guidelines

1. Limiting its size and scale in relationship to the historic building.

Analysis

The size of the structure is in line with the other roof-top additions on the building. It is only three inches higher than the existing roof-top addition to the north (see Appendix A9).

D. GUIDELINE CITATIONS:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (1990)

New Additions to Historic Buildings

Recommended:

Placing functions and services required for the new use in non-character defining interior spaces rather than installing a new addition.

Constructing a new addition so that there is the least possible loss of historic materials and so that character-defining features are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed.

Locating the attached exterior addition at the rear or on an inconspicuous side of a historic building; and limiting its size and scale in relationship to the historic building.

Designing new additions in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new.

Considering the attached exterior addition both in terms of the new use and the appearance of other buildings in the historic district or neighborhood. Design for the new work may be contemporary or may reference design motifs from the historic building. In either case, it should always be clearly differentiated from the historic building and be compatible in terms of mass, materials, relationship of solids to voids, and color.

Placing new additions such as balconies and greenhouses on non-character defining elevations and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic building.

Designing additional stories, when required for the new use, that are set back from the wall plane and are as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street.

Not Recommended:

Expanding the size of the historic building by constructing a new addition when the new use could be met by altering non-character-defining interior spaces.

Attaching a new addition so that the character-defining features of the historic building are obscured, damaged, or destroyed.

Designing a new addition so that its size and scale in relation to the historic building are out of proportion, thus diminishing the historic character.

Duplicating the exact form, material, style, and detailing of the historic building in the new addition so that the new work appears to be part of the historic building.

Imitating a historic style or period of architecture in new additions, especially for contemporary uses such as drive-in banks or garages.

Designing and constructing new additions that result in the diminution or loss of the historic character of the resource, including its design, materials, workmanship, location, or setting.

Using the same wall plane, roof line, cornice height, materials, siding lap or window type to make additions appear to be a part of the historic building.

Designing new additions such as multistory greenhouse additions that obscure, damage, or destroy character-defining features of the historic building.

Constructing additional stories so that the historic appearance of the building is radically changed.

ST. ANTHONY FALLS HISTORIC DISTRICT GUIDELINES

North First Street Warehouses

This area extends along North First Street from Third Avenue North to Eighth Avenue North

1. Siting: New buildings shall be constructed with principal facades in the same plan as the facades of adjacent buildings. Structures shall extend the full width of the lot. New construction shall continue the visual wall formed by the existing buildings.
2. Height: New buildings shall be four to six stories high.
3. Rhythm of Projections: There shall be no major projections on the principal facades.
4. Directional Emphasis: New buildings shall have a generally vertical emphasis, at least above the first floor.
5. Materials: New buildings shall be constructed of brick or shall have a brick veneer.
6. Nature of Openings: Openings should appear in a consistent and repeated pattern across the principal facades. Window openings should be approximately 1-1/2 to 2-1/2 times as tall as they are wide. Doors and windows should be set toward the front of the openings but should not be flush with the masonry surface.
7. Roof Shapes: New buildings should have flat or nearly flat roofs.
8. Details: New buildings should have some emphasis given to the upper termination of the building. Surface treatment should divide the building into vertical bays. Where other surface treatment is used, it should reflect details from other buildings in the area.
9. Color: The primary surfaces of new buildings should be deep red, brown, or buff. Trim should be subdued earth tones or flat black.

E. FINDINGS:

1. 702 1st Street North is a contributing structure to the St. Anthony Falls Historic District.
2. The proposed roof top additions' design, location, size, and scale are in compliance with the Secretary of Interior Standards for *New Additions to Historic Buildings*.
3. The St. Anthony Falls Historic District Guidelines address infill development and do not address roof top additions.
4. The proposed construction is not visible from along 1st Street North, which is the location of the primary facade. The addition will be visible along West River Parkway, which is the location of the rear facade.

F. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the HPC **adopt** staff findings and **approve** the Certificate of Appropriateness subject to the following conditions.

1. The applicant shall submit a structural plan signed by an engineer that the load bearing potential of the roof will support proposed construction.
2. The applicant shall submit plans showing where overflow water collected by the pergola and rain barrel will be diverted to.
3. The cable rail shall be visually consistent with the cable rails present on the Itasca B Warehouse Building.
4. All work shall be performed in accordance with the Secretary of Interior Standards.
5. CPED-Planning review and approve final site plan, floor plans, and elevations.

G. ATTACHMENTS

Appendix A: Application

Appendix B: Aerials

Appendix C: Staff Photos