

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT**

FILE NAME: 708 1st Street North (Itasca Warehouses)

CATEGORY/DISTRICT: Contributing structure to the St. Anthony Falls Historic District

CLASSIFICATION: Certificate of Appropriateness

APPLICANT: Judd Peterson, (952) 224-5050

DATE OF APPLICATION: April 21, 2008

PUBLICATION DATE: May 13, 2008

DATE OF HEARING: May 20, 2008

APPEAL PERIOD EXPIRATION : May 30, 2008

STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: Brian Schaffer (612) 673-2670

REQUEST: Window Replacement through a Master Window Plan

A. SITE DESCRIPTION AND BACKGROUND:

The Itasca Warehouse site contains four buildings: buildings 1, 2, 3, and 4. The Itasca Warehouse buildings are contributing structures to the St. Anthony Falls Historic District, and are located in the St. Anthony Falls North First Street Warehouse Sub-area.

Buildings 3 and 4 are modest in architectural detail compared to the Itasca 1 and 2 Warehouses to the east and the Security Warehouse to the west. These buildings, which are connected, are six-story buildings built in 1906 by the architectural firm of Edwin and Halden. The less ornate buildings' front façades contain red brick and cream colored widow sills. The first floors posses six commercial store front windows and three entrances. Below the second and sixth story windows are belt courses. At the top of the building, a brick corbelling runs along the cornice line.

Buildings 1 and 2 of the Itasca Warehouse are designed in the Romanesque Revival Style with arched windows over the fourth story windows. The façade of each of the two buildings is defined by a centered arch brick detail. A belt course separates the first floor from the second floor. Another well defined belt course separates the arched windows of the fourth floor from the fifth floor.

Between 1981 and 1985 the HPC approved a rehabilitation plan for the four buildings, which included converting the buildings into condominiums. The result of the approved work included replacement windows on the front, 1st Street North, façade and new openings in the rear of the buildings for windows and French doors which opened up onto balconies. The replacement windows were made of teak and mahogany.

B. PROPOSED CHANGES & ANALYSIS

The applicant has presented a master window plan for the replacement of the windows on Buildings 1, 2, 3 and 4 of the Itasca Warehouse. The current windows are not original and were installed during the rehabilitation of the buildings in 1981. The window types differ from one façade to another and from floor to floor. The following is a summary and evaluation of the proposed master window plan.

The purpose of a Master Window Plan is to have a comprehensive plan for the window replacement of the buildings. The window replacement can be completed in phases as the applicant has the resources. Future window replacement applications that match the approved Master Window Plan can be approved administratively through a Certificate of No Change.

Buildings 1 and 2: Front Façade- First Street North Facade

The applicant is proposing to replace the non-original windows on the second through the fifth stories of the structures. There are four types of windows on this façade:

- One over one awning style windows
- Two over two awning style windows
- Half arch top one over one awning style windows
- Full arched top two over two awning style windows

All of the current windows are awning style windows with only the lower half of the windows operable. The upper portions of the windows are fixed. The operation of the windows can be seen in the photographs on page 3-7 of the attachments. The proposed windows will match the current windows in operation, detail and in color; the proposed color is cappuccino. The proposed windows will be aluminum clad instead of the current wood windows.

Buildings 3 and 4: Front Façade- First Street North Facade

The applicant is proposing to replace the non-original windows on the fourth through the sixth stories of the structures. The applicant is proposing a six over six double hung window to replace the current six over six double hung windows. The proposed windows will match the current windows in operation, detail and in color; the proposed color is cappuccino. The proposed windows will be aluminum clad instead of the current wood windows. The proposed windows have an integrated screen over the lower half of the window. The current windows do not have an integrated screen; they have an exteriorly mounted screen. The screens can be seen in the photographs on page 3-2 of the attachments.

Buildings 1, 2, 3 and 4: Rear, East and West Façades- Facing West River Road

The applicant is proposing to replace the non-original windows and French double doors on the rear façade. The proposed window will be a one over one awning style window to match the existing windows in detail and operation. The operation of the window will have the upper half fixed with the lower portion of the window operable. The French double doors will also match the operation and detail of the current doors. The proposed color of the windows and French doors is Clay Canyon which is similar in color to the

existing color. Both the windows and the French doors will aluminum clad instead of the current wood doors and windows.

Analysis

The proposed windows and doors are an exact match of the styles, details, and operation of the existing non-original windows doors. The guidelines for windows in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation state the following for designing for missing historic features: "The replacement windows may be an accurate restoration using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation; or be a new design that is compatible with the window openings and the historic character of the building." Staff was unable to find historic photographs to compare the proposed windows to the original windows of the buildings. The permit information from the HPC approval of the current windows in 1981 suggests that the existing window types and design are comparable to the original window types and design.

The *Standards* recommend against "using a substitute material for the replacement part that does not convey the visual appearance of the surviving parts of the windows." The applicant is replacing the entire non-original wooden windows with an aluminum clad wood window. The difference in the exterior material between the existing wood windows and the proposed aluminum clad window is not visually evident based on the photographs in page 3-2 of the attachments, which shows a test window installed with the existing windows.

The St. Anthony Falls North First Street Warehouse Sub-area guidelines do not offer guidance on the material of windows.

C. GUIDELINE CITATIONS:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (1990) Windows

Recommended:

- Identifying, retaining, and preserving windows - and their functional and decorative features - that are important in defining the overall historic character of the building. Such features can include frames, sash, muntins, glazing, sills, heads, hoodmolds, paneled or decorated jambs and moldings, and interior and exterior shutters and blinds.

- Protecting and maintaining the wood and architectural metal which comprise the window frame, sash, muntins, and surrounds through appropriate surface treatments such as cleaning, rust removal, limited paint removal, and re-application of protective coating systems.

- Making windows weather tight by recaulking and replacing or installing weather-stripping. These actions also improve thermal efficiency.

-Evaluating the overall condition of materials to determine whether more than protection and maintenance are required, i.e. if repairs to windows and window features will be required.

-Repairing window frames and sash by patching, splicing, consolidating or otherwise reinforcing. Such repair may also include replacement in kind of those parts that are either extensively deteriorated or are missing when there are surviving prototypes such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds.

-Replacing in kind an entire window that is too deteriorated to repair - if the overall form and detailing are still evident - using the physical evidence to guide the new work. If using the same kind of materials is not technically or economically feasible, then a compatible substitute material may be considered.

Design for Missing Historic Features

-Designing and installing new windows when the historic windows (frame, sash and glazing) are completely missing. The replacement windows may be an accurate restoration using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation; or be a new design that is compatible with the window openings and the historic character of the building.

Alterations/Additions for the New Use

-Designing and installing additional windows on rear or other non-character-defining elevations if required by the new use. New window openings may also be cut into exposed party walls. Such design should be compatible with the overall design of the building, but not duplicate the fenestration pattern and detailing of a character-defining elevation.

-Providing a setback in the design of dropped ceilings when they are required for the new use to allow for the full height of the window openings.

Not Recommended:

-Removing or radically changing windows which are important in defining the overall historic character of the building so that, as a result, the character is diminished.

-Changing the number, location, size or glazing pattern of windows, through cutting new openings, blocking-in windows, and installing replacement sash which does not fit the historic window opening.

-Changing the historic appearance of windows through the use of inappropriate designs, materials, finishes, or colors which radically change the sash, depth of reveal, and muntin configuration; the reflectivity and color of the glazing; or the appearance of the frame.

-Obscuring historic window trim with metal or other material.

-Stripping windows of historic material such as wood, iron, cast iron, and bronze.

- Failing to provide adequate protection of materials on a cyclical basis so that deterioration of the windows results.
- Retrofitting or replacing windows rather than maintaining the sash, frame, and glazing.
- Failing to undertake adequate measures to assure the preservation of historic windows.
- Replacing an entire window when repair of materials and limited replacement of deteriorated or missing parts are appropriate.
- Failing to reuse serviceable window hardware such as brass lifts and sash locks.
- Using a substitute material for the replacement part that does not convey the visual appearance of the surviving parts of the window or that is physically or chemically incompatible.
- Removing a character-defining window that is unrepairable and blocking it in; or replacing it with a new window that does not convey the same visual appearance.

Design for Missing Historic Features

- Creating a false historical appearance because the replaced window is based on insufficient historical, pictorial, and physical documentation.
- Introducing a new design that is incompatible with the historic character of the building.

Alterations/Additions for the New Use

- Installing new windows, including frames, sash, and muntin configuration that are incompatible with the building's historic appearance or obscure, damage, or destroy character-defining features.
- Inserting new floors or furred-down ceilings which cut across the glazed areas of the windows so that the exterior form and appearance of the windows are changed.

ST. ANTHONY FALLS HISTORIC DISTRICT GUIDELINES

North First Street Warehouses

This area extends along North First Street from Third Avenue North to Eighth Avenue North

1. Siting: New buildings shall be constructed with principal facades in the same plan as the facades of adjacent buildings. Structures shall extend the full width of the lot. New construction shall continue the visual wall formed by the existing buildings.
2. Height: New buildings shall be four to six stories high.

3. Rhythm of Projections: There shall be no major projections on the principal facades.
4. Directional Emphasis: New buildings shall have a generally vertical emphasis, at least above the first floor.
5. Materials: New buildings shall be constructed of brick or shall have a brick veneer.
6. Nature of Openings: Openings should appear in a consistent and repeated pattern across the principal facades. Window openings should be approximately 1-1/2 to 2-1/2 times as tall as they are wide. Doors and windows should be set toward the front of the openings but should not be flush with the masonry surface.
7. Roof Shapes: New buildings should have flat or nearly flat roofs.
8. Details: New buildings should have some emphasis given to the upper termination of the building. Surface treatment should divide the building into vertical bays. Where other surface treatment is used, it should reflect details from other buildings in the area.
9. Color: The primary surfaces of new buildings should be deep red, brown, or buff. Trim should be subdued earth tones or flat black.

E. FINDINGS:

1. 700-722 1st Street North are contributing structures to the St. Anthony Falls Historic District.
2. The St. Anthony Falls Historic District Guidelines do not address the window materials.
3. The proposed windows are replacing non-original windows approved by the HPC in 1981. Staff was unable to find pictorial evidence of the original windows.
4. The permit information from the HPC approval of the current windows in 1981 suggests that the existing window types and design are comparable to the original window types and design.
5. The proposed aluminum clad wood windows and French doors match the details and design of the existing non-original wood windows.

F. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the HPC adopt staff findings and **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Master Window Plan with the following conditions:

1. Window replacement applications that match the specifications of this Master Window Plan can be approved administratively through a Certificate of No Change.
2. CPED-Planning Preservation Staff reviews and approves the final plans and elevations prior to building permit issuance.

Attachments:

1. Applicant's Statement
2. Map of District
3. Plans and Photographs