

COMPARISON OF MADISON AND MINNEAPOLIS STREETCAR FEASIBILITY STUDIES

(prepared by Charleen Zimmer at request of Council Member Schiff - 03/06/06)

MADISON RFP TASK	MADISON PROPOSAL (HDR)	MINNEAPOLIS SCOPE OF SERVICES	COMMENTS
Project Purpose	Encourage urban infill development	Improve transit service on Primary Transit Network	
Previous and ongoing planning activities	Transport 2020 - citywide transportation plan that identified streetcars as component of "Full System Vision" PE/EIS for commuter rail (includes urban circulator streetcar system)	Ten-Year Transportation Action Plan - underway; Midtown Greenway Streetcar Feasibility Study and related work included in SW Corridor Study	
Budget	\$300,000	\$250,000 (+\$50,000 contingency fund)	
FTA Process	"Not intended to be a federally-guided Alternatives Analysis"	Determine opportunity for federal funding and steps required	
Schedule	One Year	10 Months	
Number of Corridors	Up to 3	Initially 14, narrowed to 5-8, then narrowed to 5 or less	
Proposed Committee Structure	Streetcar Study Committee Technical Advisory Committee	Project Management Team Project Steering Committee (10-Year Action Plan)	
Project Management Plan	Roles, responsibilities, schedule, work scope, review points	Roles, responsibilities, schedule, work scope, review points	Needs to be coordinated with schedule, process and scope of 10-Year Action Plan and SW LRT study
Public Participation Plan	Focus groups and interviews (number constrained by budget) - representatives of key stakeholder groups - maximum 30 hours. 3 community meetings: (1) public meeting with small break-out groups - city does meeting arrangements and supplies small group facilitators; (2) open house on routes, evaluation, etc., (3) presentation of draft report. Two meetings with "project sponsors and public leaders". Materials for city website.	Community meetings: (1) Coordination with 10-year action plan meetings (two sets of six public meetings in sub-areas of the city)-consultant does meeting arrangements and provides small group facilitators, (2) citywide meeting to present results of streetcar study, (3) two presentations at Council Study Sessions. Group meetings with business representatives in 5 short-listed corridors. Materials for city website and Action Plan newsletters.	Meetings held at three points in both projects. Mpls plan includes two series of six meetings and one citywide meeting rather than three single meetings. Both include focus group interviews and presentations to elected officials. Both include website. Mpls includes newsletter.
Establish Project Purpose/Identify Initial Concepts	Statement of streetcar purpose; goals and objectives for streetcar project	Objectives of streetcar system and evaluation criteria (objectives). Also background material and presentation on other modern streetcar applications in North America.	Minneapolis scope more detailed regarding evaluation criteria - may be able to eliminate the background materials on modern streetcar operations

MADISON RFP TASK	MADISON PROPOSAL (HDR)	MINNEAPOLIS SCOPE OF SERVICES	COMMENTS
Identify/Confirm Initial Corridor Concepts	Review and confirm streetcar recommendations (field review) from Transport 2020, make modifications and confirm agreement on Streetcar "Full System" Plan . Identify at least 3 Phase I corridors to be evaluated in more detail (not longer than 2-3 miles)	Evaluate/screen 14 PTN corridors for feasibility of streetcar operations (field visits) - identify technical "fatal flaws" and other issues that may prevent reasonable streetcar development. Reduce to 5-8 primary candidates, identifying initial segment terminus, and preliminary list of constraints. Uses both qualitative and quantitative data.	Minneapolis scope has much more detail in this step as 14 PTN corridors are to be evaluated for streetcar feasibility and narrowed to 5-8 corridors with streetcar potential. Madison has already completed this step.
Identify Range of Streetcar Vehicles and Infrastructure	Review of vehicle technology including costs, procurement options, Buy America options, and recommend vehicle type for City.	Not included in scope	This task could be added to Mpls scope if desired.
Develop Conceptual Streetcar System Alignment Plans	Conceptual alignment plans for 3 corridors (On 100 scale aerials) including station stops, maintenance/operation facility, pole/substation locations, utility impact locations, typical sections.	Analyze technical constraints to street car construction and/or operation in 5-8 corridors including utility conflicts, traffic conflicts, right-of-way constraints. Develop a conceptual operating plan for each corridor to determine number of cars and other capital cost factors. Do a preliminary estimate of capital costs and narrow corridors to no more than 5 based on construction, operating and cost comparison.	More engineering detail provided for 3 corridors in Madison project. Minneapolis scope provides information for 5-8 corridors. Maintenance and operations facility could be added to Minneapolis scope.
Review Major Utility and Freight Rail Corridor Impacts	Review issues, constraints and opportunities with public and private utilities and railroads, working with city staff.	Utility constraints identified in previous task - no railroad issues expected at this time so not included in scope of services.	
Develop Traffic Parking and Transit Impact Assessment	Based on traffic and parking information provided by the city, identify significant traffic and parking issues resulting from streetcar operation. Impacts to transit system operations analyzed based on existing data - reconfiguration options for transit service.	Traffic and parking impacts identified in earlier tasks and based on analysis done in 10-year action plan for PTN corridors. Logical minimum segments identified. Initial operating plan developed and opportunities for reconfiguring transit services identified.	Basically same scope in both projects.

MADISON RFP TASK	MADISON PROPOSAL (HDR)	MINNEAPOLIS SCOPE OF SERVICES	COMMENTS
Evaluate and Quantify Development Impacts	Map and quantify infill development impacts - identify redevelopment sites, build-out plans based on existing plans, market assessment, density of development occurring in other cities. Estimate tax increment revenues and potential absorption. Review of how proposed plans would be affected by streetcar. Assessment of neighborhood acceptability of development opportunities	Identify opportunities for infill development, existing and pipeline projects - work done in close coordination with CPED. Determine business interest in streetcar development and potential for private funding support. Each corridor rated on ability to generate private funding through a variety of funding mechanisms.	Madison scope has more emphasis on quantifying development potential. Minneapolis scope has more emphasis on private financing options and work with local businesses in priority corridors.
Recommended Phase I Streetcar Alignment/System Plan	Identify appropriate site(s) for maintenance/operations facility. Plan views (100 scale aerial photographs) of alignments including station stops and other key factors. Typical cross-sections. Same as described in earlier task. Recommendation on Phase I segment.	Identify priorities (routes and segment lengths) for streetcar implementation.	Both scopes identify top priority corridor and shortest feasible segments. Madison scope has more engineering emphasis (plan views, typical sections). Minneapolis scope has more operations emphasis (coordination with bus and LRT service, operating cost savings, etc.)
Conceptual Operations and Maintenance Plan	Conceptual operations and maintenance plan and costs (operational capacity, headways, single vs. multiple track operations, stops, vehicle servicing requirements, staffing levels, etc.	Conceptual operations plan and costs based on same operating criteria.	Both scopes include conceptual operations and maintenance plan and cost.
Provide Streetcar System Ridership Estimates	Using existing data, sketch-level ridership estimate for Phase I segment.	Ridership estimates based on regional modeling done for 10-year action plan.	Minneapolis plan has more detailed ridership estimates - based on work done in 10-year action plan
Develop Capital and Operating Cost Estimates	Planning level capital and operating cost estimates	Planning level capital and operating cost estimates	Both scopes include planning level capital and operating cost estimates
Develop a Project Organizational and Institutional Plan	Conceptual organizational structure for streetcar construction and operation	Included in implementation strategies - general	Could be specified in Minneapolis scope
Develop a Project Financial Plan	Identify candidate funding sources and develop two or more funding scenarios for capital and operating costs	Identify candidate funding sources and funding potential for short-list corridors	Both scopes include project financial plan (funding scenarios)
Develop a Project Implementation Plan	Implementation steps and project delivery strategies	Implementation steps	Both scopes include implementation steps/issues
Draft and Final Report	Draft and final report	Draft and final report	Both scopes include report

NELSON-NYGAARD STREETCAR EXPERIENCE

Seattle – South Lake Union Streetcar Feasibility Study (3 phases)

- Lead role
- Comparative evaluation of costs and benefits of streetcar
- Ridership projections
- Operating and maintenance costs
- Financing alternatives
- Conceptual engineering study (alignment, right-of-way, etc.)
- Detailed operating plan
- Feasibility of streetcar line extensions

Spokane

- Teamed with URS
- Preliminary alignments
- Ridership estimates
- Operating and capital cost estimates
- Market analysis

Boise

- Teamed with Arup
- Capital and operating costs
- Financing alternatives

Lincoln

- Lead role
- Development of alternatives
- Definition and evaluation of streetcar system