

Minneapolis Planning Department
Minneapolis Heritage Preservation Commission
350 South Fifth Street, Room 210
Minneapolis, MN 55415-1385
(612) 673-2422 Phone
(612) 673-2728 Fax
(612) 673-2157 TDD

MEMORANDUM

DATE: October 25, 2002

TO: The Honorable Gary Schiff, Chair
Zoning and Planning Committee
Members of the City Council

FROM: Greg Mathis

RE: Dorglass, Inc. appeal of a decision of the Heritage Preservation Commission
(HPC) regarding 10-20 East 19th Street

The matter before you is an appeal by Dorglass, Inc. of a decision made by the HPC at its public hearing of September 17, 2002. The appeal affects the property at 10-20 East 19th Street, in the Stevens Square Historic District.

A. BACKGROUND

The Minneapolis City Council created the Stevens Square Historic District in 1989. The district is generally bounded by 17th Street on the north, Third Avenue South on the east, an irregular line between 19th Street and Franklin Avenue on the south, and First Avenue on the west. The district is centered around Stevens Square, and is comprised almost entirely of 3½-story, brown brick apartment buildings dating from the 1910s and 1920s.

The building located at 10-20 East 19th Street is historically known as the Gladstone Apartments. The Gladstone is a three-story, 40-unit, U-shaped brick building constructed in 1915. The building retains a relatively high degree of integrity and is a contributing property to the Stevens Square Historic District.

B. HPC DECISION

In August 2002, Dorglass, Inc. applied to the Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC) for a Certificate of Appropriateness (C of A) to replace the original wood windows in the building with sand beige colored aluminum windows and to wrap the wood mouldings around the windows with break metal (panning). The proposed break metal had a rectangular profile that did not match the profile of the historic mouldings.

The HPC reviewed the application at a public hearing on September 17, 2002. After listening to the staff report and all public testimony, the HPC adopted the following findings and approved a C of A for the proposed work, subject to a number of conditions.

1. The Gladstone Apartments, located at 10-16-20 East 19th Street, is a contributing property to the Stevens Square Historic District.
2. The window trim on the building is currently painted brown, although physical evidence clearly shows that the windows were originally painted a light beige color.
3. The proposed window color and finish complies with the guideline that states “window frames shall be wood or metal painted in a contrasting color to the brick.”
4. The proposed window selection complies with the guideline stating that “replacement windows shall replicate original window operation.”
5. The mullion pattern proposed for the basement windows complies with the requirement that “mullion patterns will match original.”
6. The break metal window wrap (panning) that is proposed for covering the wood window mouldings will not match the profile of the existing mouldings; therefore, it will compromise the historic character of the building. Metal panning that matches the profile of the existing wood mouldings is a more appropriate treatment for the building.

The C of A was approved subject to the following conditions:

1. The window glazing must be clear, non-tinted, non-reflective glass.
2. The proposed break metal window wrap is not approved. Metal panning that matches the profile of the original, wood window mouldings must be installed around the windows and HPC staff must approve the profile of the panning.
3. Sand Beige is the approved color for the windows and panning.
4. The glazing pattern on the replacement windows must match the glazing pattern of the existing windows.

The HPC decision is consistent with its adopted design guidelines for the district and with the Sixth Goal of the City, as stated in *The Minneapolis Plan*, which is to “preserve, enhance and create a sustainable natural and historic environment city-wide.”

C. APPEAL:

Dorglass, Inc. is appealing the following decisions of the HPC:

1. To require panning that matches the curving profile of the original, wood window mouldings. The appellant originally requested permission to install break metal that had a square profile.

The appellant is now proposing to install break metal that has a slight bend in it. However, the current proposal still does not match the curving profile of the historic wood mouldings.

2. The appellant originally applied to the HPC for approval to install sand beige colored windows in the building. The sand beige color complies with the design guidelines for the district, so staff recommended approval. At the public hearing, the appellant changed their request and asked the HPC to approve brown colored windows. The brown color does not comply with the design guidelines for the district. The HPC approved the sand beige colored windows, so the appellant is asking the City Council to approve the brown colored windows that do not comply with the design guidelines for the district.

D. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the Zoning and Planning Committee adopt the HPC findings plus the following additional findings, and **deny** the appeal.

Additional Findings:

1. The goal of the City and the HPC is to preserve the historic character of the Stevens Square Historic District by approving alterations that improve the architectural and historic character of the buildings in the district, as well as the usefulness of the buildings.
2. The enameled metal cladding on the approved windows has a very durable finish that typically never needs to be painted. This type of finish will outlast the paint on the cornice of the building, which was sprayed or brushed on to the metal. Consequently, the cornice will need to be repainted before the windows need to be replaced. When the cornice needs to be repainted, the HPC would request that it be painted its historic color, which appears to be beige, not its current color. This color change would bring return the building to a more historic appearance and bring it into compliance with the design guidelines for the district.
3. The intent of the proposed break metal window wrap is to eliminate the need to paint the historic wood window trim. While the proposed break metal may eliminate the need to paint the trim every five to twenty years, it is not needed to make the building useful and viable.
4. No evidence of a hardship has been clearly demonstrated to justify the proposed alterations (dark brown colored windows and break metal window wrap) that do not comply with the design guidelines for the district.

E. ATTACHMENTS:

- A. Appeal of the Decision of the Heritage Preservation Commission Application
- B. Minutes from the September 17, 2002 HPC meeting
- C. HPC Staff Report, dated September 9, 2002
- D. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness