



**Request for City Council Committee Action  
From the Department of Community Planning & Economic Development**

Date: November 28, 2005

To: Council Member Gary Schiff, Chair of Zoning and Planning Committee

Prepared by: Amy Lucas, Senior Planner, CPED-Planning (612-673-2422)

Presenter(s) in Committee: Amy Lucas

Approved by: Barbara Sporlein, Director, Planning \_\_\_\_\_

Subject: Appeal from the October 25, 2005 Heritage Preservation Commission Hearing

**RECOMMENDATION:** To adopt Heritage Preservation Commission findings and deny the appeal to allow the construction of a 23-story tower at 110 East 18<sup>th</sup> Street in the Stevens Square Historic District.

**Financial Impact** (Check those that apply)

No financial impact

**Community Impact**

Ward: 6

Neighborhood Notification: Stevens Square Community Organization

City Goals: Consistent with "Preserve and enhance our natural and historic environment and promote a clean, sustainable Minneapolis."

Zoning Code: Section 599.120 authorizes the Heritage Preservation Commission to hear and decide applications for certificate of appropriateness" and Section 599.350 requires "the commission make findings that the alteration will not materially impair the integrity of the landmark, historic district."

**Background/Supporting Information:**

The attached report summarizes the actions taken at the Heritage Preservation Commission meeting held on October 25, 2005. The staff report, findings, public hearing testimony and recommendations are respectfully submitted for the consideration of your Committee.

Attachments:

1. Appeal of the Decision of the HPC Application, 11-4-05
2. HPC Staff Report, 10-17-05,
3. Application for C of A, 7-5-05
4. Draft minutes from HPC public hearing of 10-25-05
5. Stevens Square Community Organization letter, 10-20-05
6. EAW-City of Lakes Condominiums, August 2005
7. State Historic Preservation Office comments on EAW, 9-30-05

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS  
CPED PLANNING DIVISION  
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT**

---

---

FILE NAME: 110 East 18<sup>th</sup> Street

DATE OF APPLICATION: 10-4-05

APPLICANT: Gateway Commons, LLC

DATE OF HEARING: 10-25-05

HPC SITE/DISTRICT: Stevens Square Historic District

CATEGORY: non-contributing

CLASSIFICATION: Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction of tower

STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: Amy Lucas

DATE: 10-17-05

---

---

**A. SITE DESCRIPTION:**

The Abbott Hospital Dunwoody Building sits on the block bounded by First Avenue South to the west, East 18<sup>th</sup> Street to the south, Stevens Avenue South to the east and East 17<sup>th</sup> Street to the north.

The original Abbott Hospital was constructed in the Renaissance Revival style that predominates in the district and was completed in 1910 at 1717 First Avenue South. The National Register nomination describes the original building, commonly referred to as the Dunwoody Building, as “three stories, with a hipped-roof, a hipped-roof dormer, and broad overhanging eaves. The basement story of this section has a rusticated treatment repeated in the two story portico. The portico, which sets off the original portion of the building from later additions, has a rusticated arcade at the first story supported by a colonnade of four Doric piers at the second story. The piers are brick, with stone bases. The classical balustrade is also executed in stone. A portion of the southern wing of this building, which had a hipped roof and a two-story sun porch, was demolished ca. 1960 for the construction of an addition. The result is a somewhat abbreviated building, but one which maintains much of its original integrity.”

Later brick additions were constructed around the original 1910 Abbott Hospital/Dunwoody building. A rear four-story wing was constructed in 1938; only a small portion of this wing is visible today. The 1938 wing was wrapped with a brick addition in 1957. The 1957 addition is a four-story brick building along Stevens Avenue and a one-story metal addition along East 18<sup>th</sup> Street. Besides the rear addition, the Abbott Hospital also received side additions ca. 1951 (nomination notes ca. 1960). The southern addition changed part of the hipped roof and removed the two story sun porch; in place of the sun porch a three story, flat roof addition was constructed. A three-story brick addition that is one bay wide was constructed at the northern side of the Abbott Hospital building. This addition connects the hipped roofed 1910 building to

the 1919 Janney Building. The Janney Building is a three-story, brick building, designed in the Renaissance Revival Style and built as the children's wing.

The applicant retained the services of The 106 Group for historic survey and attached the report, City of Lakes Development (Abbott Hospital) Review of Development Proposal (Feb. 2005), with the application. This report notes that all of these alterations were present at the time of historic designation. The 1993 National Register designation notes that the 1910 Dunwoody portion of the Abbott Hospital and the 1919 Janney building addition to the Abbott Hospital building are contributing to the historic district; later additions to the hospital are non-contributing. The 1988 local designation study did not list the Janney building as a contributing building, but the 1993 National Register nomination indicates the significance and supercedes the older nomination.

## **B. BACKGROUND:**

This property sits within the Stevens Square Historic District. The City of Minneapolis designated the Stevens Square Historic District in 1986 and the district was placed in the National Register of Historic Places in 1993. The historic district nomination states: "The Stevens Square Historic District is a high-density residential area at the southern edge of downtown Minneapolis. The primary building type is a 3 and ½-story dark red or dark brown brick apartment constructed between 1912 and 1936" and "The Stevens Square Historic District provides an overview of apartment designs popular in Minneapolis...a standard Renaissance Revival formula is evident on the exterior of most apartment buildings in the District. There is great uniformity in the treatment of the flat-roofed building mass, which is usually rectangular, the exterior material, which is usually brick, sometimes with stone trim, and of windows, which are usually rectangular with double hung sash."

The City of Minneapolis accepted the Environmental Assessment Worksheet (EAW) for this development in September of 2005. The Minnesota Historical Society/MN State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) commented on the EAW on August 30, 2005. The SHPO noted that "there are two primary aspects of the project proposal that could adversely affect the character of this historic district. First, the project calls for the demolition of the Janney Building portion of the Abbott Hospital complex. This building is a contributing element of the district, and its preservation and rehabilitation would reinforce the area's historic character. Second, some aspects of the proposed new construction-height, massing, materials, and setback for example-may not be compatible with the historic character. If the district is to retain its historic value, it is important that these issues be addressed." (See attached letter)

## **C. PROPOSED CHANGES:**

The applicant is proposing the construction of a 23-story (257') tower on the corner of First Avenue South and East 17<sup>th</sup> Street within the Stevens Square Historic District. The construction proposes the demolition of the contributing Janney Building; demolition is handled in a separate staff report. The tower will hold 199 housing units and 200 enclosed parking spaces. The parking is accessed through a curb cut on East 17<sup>th</sup> Street. The plans show only two levels of

parking that add up to 73 parking spaces. The tower sits on a four-story (50') tall base and is setback approximately 4' before it rises the addition 19 stories. The four-story base materials are noted in the drawings as brick, "trespa panels" around the openings and balconies with "translucent panels." Colors of these materials were not submitted. It is unclear how far out the balconies project because the drawings do not reflect that level of detail. The balcony door system was not submitted. Some windows on the base appear to be sliding windows but specifications and colors were not submitted. The materials of the upper section of the tower (17 stories) will be centria forma (concrete?) wall panel and glass and metal balconies. The base and the tower will be finished with a precast concrete cornice.

**Zoning:** The following is an excerpt from the EAW for the City of Lakes Condominium Development regarding the zoning issues:

"The present zoning designation at this site and of neighborhood is OR3 Institutional Office Residence District. It permits the highest residential densities, and the largest and tallest building outside of the downtown zoning districts. The project as proposed has 47 more housing units than would be permitted by the OR3 District, 42,974 sq. ft. more floor area than would be permitted in the OR3 District, and the Phase Two building would be 17 more stories and 173 ft. taller than would be permitted by the Zoning Code on a site of this size and this zoning designation. The proposed density, 173 units per acre, is greater than the estimated 125 units per acre of the historic development, and exceeds the basic density of 145 housing units per acre standard of the very intense OR3 District...The City's code requires a minimum site size of tow acres to qualify for a Planned Unit Development. It is unclear how this project will be approved for this 1.7 acre site. The proposed level of development (in terms of building height, number of housing units, bulk, and arrangement) may not be able to be accomplished with the proposed plan at the proposed site."

Generally, the maximum height in the OR3 District is 6 stories not to exceed 84 feet which is still higher than the recommended 3.5 stories in the Stevens Square Historic District Design Guidelines.

#### **D. GUIDELINE CITATIONS:**

At the time of designation the HPC adopted *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* and added additional guidelines specific to Stevens Square Historic District which are noted below.

**STEVENS SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT GUIDELINES**  
**Minneapolis Heritage Preservation Commission**  
**(December 1988)**  
**(Revised January 1989)**

## **II. Guidelines For Rehabilitation of Buildings**

### **A. Masonry Repair.**

1. No exterior sandblasting is permitted.
2. Chemical cleaning is not permitted on glazed brick or terra-cotta, limestone, marble, or other masonry material susceptible to damage from chemical exposure.
3. Repointing of joints shall be done with a mortar design similar to the original. Joints shall be tooled to match original profile.

B. Window Replacement/Repair.

1. Windows shall have clear glass unless historical documentation is presented which shows patterned or opaque glass.
2. Anodized aluminum finished are not permitted.
3. Mullion patterns will match original. Replacement windows shall replicate original window operation.
4. Exterior windows should not be blocked or obscured from the interior. Exceptions may be granted for windows on secondary facades if a special case can be made for the necessity of such an alteration.

C. Wood trim and siding.

1. All exterior wood shall be painted, including decks, unless historical documentation demonstrates otherwise.
2. Deteriorated wood siding shall be replaced with wood siding. Aluminum, vinyl, and other synthetic siding will not be allowed.

D. Roofing materials.

1. Wherever possible the original roofing shall be replicated when replacement is required. Flat, hidden roofs may be replaced with any suitable material including membrane roofs. However, parapets and coping materials should be replaced to match the original materials.
2. Asphalt shingles may replace wood, but must be simple, square shingles. Timberline or other wood facsimile shingles are not allowed.
3. Clay tile shingles may be replaced with replica materials that are approved by the Commission.
4. Copper roofs shall be repaired or replaced with copper.

E. Removal of historic fabric.

Selective removal of original building materials are allowed when deterioration has occurred or for remodeling as part of an adaptive use. HPC approval is required for any removal of historic building materials.

F. Mechanical systems.

Exterior alterations for mechanical systems should be as inconspicuous as possible and should never occur on the street facades of the structure.

G. Health and safety code requirement.

Exterior alterations required by health and safety codes also require review by the Heritage Preservation Commission. when necessary, the HPC can argue for exceptions to the building codes when life-safety issues are not involved.

**III. Guidelines for infill (new) construction**

A. Building massing (General footprint and shape).

1. Setback from principle street

- a. The setback shall match existing buildings or predominate setback on the street.
- b. New construction shall not be set back further than existing buildings.

2. Building shape

- a. The building shall be rectangular in shape with the narrow end facing the street.
- b. New construction on corner lots may have a longer facade facing each street.

3. Building height

- a. Minimum height shall be 2-1/2 stories.
- b. Maximum height shall be 3-1/2 stories.
- c. Additions to existing buildings may be constructed to the height of the adjacent structure.

B. Street facade.

1. Building material

- a. Primary facing material shall be dark brown or red unglazed brick.
- b. Corner buildings shall have dark brick on both street facades.
- c. Brick shall be of modular size.

2. Windows

- a. Window opening shall be symmetrically placed to either side of doorway.

- b. Window design shall be true single or double hung.
- c. Window height shall be three times the width.
- d. Window glass shall be clear.
- e. Window frames shall be wood or metal painted in a contrasting color to the brick.
- f. Windows shall have stone, brick, or cast concrete sill.
- g. Ground level windows shall have glass and will be protected by metal bars.

3. Entrance

- a. The entry shall be centered on the primary facade.
- b. Entry shall have a double door and shall be set off by special details.
- c. Windows over the entry will be at the 1/2-story.
- d. Balconies are permitted only at center bay over primary entry.

4. Cornice Line

The cornice line shall be set off with any of the following design elements: projecting eaves, brick corbeling, or contrasting horizontal banding of precast concrete, stone, etc.

5. Base

The base of the building between the basement 1/2-story and the first floor shall be defined from the upper stories. This can be done by brick detailing or a contrasting material such as stone, precast concrete, or rock-face block.

C. Side or rear wall.

1. Building materials

- a. Dark brick matching the primary facade shall be used in the first bay from the street facade.
- b. Remainder of facade shall be light colored brick.

2. Window fenestration

- a. Windows shall be true double- or single-hung and have a vertical orientation.
- b. Window glass shall be clear.
- c. Window frames shall be painted wood or painted metal.
- d. Ground level windows shall be glass and shall be protected by metal bars.

e. Balconies are not permitted on side or rear elevations.

3. Cornice line

The front cornice line shall carry back on side walls one bay.

D. Roof.

1. The roof shall be flat with parapet walls.

2. Mechanical equipment shall be set back from parapet and screened from street view.

E. Site.

1. No new curb cuts along Stevens Square frontage.

2. Brick gate posts and wrought iron fencing will be permitted where appropriate and shall be encouraged.

3. Chain link, wood picket, or contemporary redwood fencing not allowed.

**E. FINDINGS:**

1. The proposed building requires the demolition of a contributing building in the Stevens Square Historic District.
2. The Stevens Square Historic District Design Guidelines recommend that new construction in the district align with the historic setbacks in the district. This building proposes the demolition of the Janney Building. The new construction is 7 feet closer to the sidewalk than the remaining historic Abbott Hospital Dunwoody Building and therefore the design does not follow the guidelines.
3. The Stevens Square Historic District Design Guidelines recommend that new construction be rectangular in shape with the narrow end facing the street. The building plan is not rectangular in shape and the tower section is s curved or oval structure.
4. The Stevens Square Historic District Design Guidelines recommend that the building height be a maximum of 3.5 stories. The base of the building is four-stories but the setback is so minimal that the building still reads as a 23-story tower in the historic district.
5. The Stevens Square Historic District Design Guidelines recommend that new building materials be modular brick. There is a small amount of brick on the four-story base of the building but precast concrete panels (size unknown) and glass and steel dominate the building.

6. The Stevens Square Historic District Design Guidelines recommend that the windows be true single or double-hung, have clear glass and a stone, brick or cast concrete sill. The proposed windows appear to be sliding windows with aluminum sill structures. Specifications and colors of the windows were not provided but they appear to not follow the guidelines.
7. The Stevens Square Historic District Design Guidelines recommend that the base of the building be defined from the upper stories and this can be accomplished by brick, stone, precast concrete, or rock-face block. Not only does this new construction not have a distinguishable base, but in many parts of the elevation the building actually projects multiple feet over the base.

**F. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends that the HPC **adopt** staff findings and **deny** the Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:

1. If the City approves the new construction, the proposal must return to the HPC for review of materials and design details including specifications of doors, windows, railings.
2. If the City approves the new construction, final plans should attempt to work within the parameters of the Stevens Square Historic District Design Guidelines in order to preserve the integrity of the historic district.
3. If the City approves the new construction then the applicant must develop a mitigation plan for the demolition of the Janney Building and submit to HPC for approval.

**G. HPC MOTION:**

At the public hearing of October 25, 2005, the Minneapolis Heritage Preservation Commission voted to **adopt** staff findings and **deny** the Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of the 23-story tower.