

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT**

FILE NAME: Component of the Pacific Development Project—rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N. (New Hotel).

DATE OF APPLICATION: Determined to be complete on 10/11/06.

APPLICANT: Walter H. Rockenstein II, attorney for the Developer, Pacific Flats, LLC; Faegre and Benson LLP, 2200 Wells Fargo Center, 90 S. 7th St., Mpls., MN 55402-3901; voice: 612-766-7208, fax: 612-766-1600, email: wrockenstein@faegre.com

DATE OF HEARING: 11/14/06, continued to the 11/28/06 hearing

HPC SITE/DISTRICT: Local district: North Loop Warehouse Local District (established, 9/19/78); National Register of Historic Places District: Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District (established in 1989)

CATEGORY:

• **North Loop Local Warehouse District:**

1. Linkage of building, structures, lands and space, a majority of which continue to exist in their original location and are distinguished by architectural quality and aesthetic appeal.
2. Arouses a sense of time (history) and space (attractive special quality)
- 3a. Contains a concentration of structures of superior workmanship.
- 3b. Contains a number of structures which display the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type reflective of a style and method of construction.
5. Has a sense of visual cohesion expressed through a harmony of related details, architectural or otherwise, based upon elements of quality (aesthetic) as:
 - a. Continuity of architectural factors (style, proportion, color, size, scale and materials);
 - b. Concentration or clustering of structures.

- **National Register of Historic Places Registration Form:** Categories are Event and Architecture/Engineering. Areas of Significance are Architecture, Commerce, and Transportation. Historic Functions are Commerce/Trade, Industry/Processing/Extraction, Manufacturing Facility, Specialty Store, and Warehouse. The area is historically significant as the area of early commercial growth during the development of the City that established Minneapolis as the trade center for the Upper Midwest and includes some of the oldest extant buildings in Minneapolis.

PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE: National Register District: 1850-1874, 1875-1899, 1900-1924, 1925-1949. Northwestern Building was built in 1912 and 1923

CLASSIFICATION: Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction, Rehabilitation, and Demolition

STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: J. Michael Orange (voice: 612-673-2347; facsimile: 673-2728; TDD: 673-2157; e-mail: michael.orange@ci.minneapolis.mn.us)

PRINT DATE: 11/21/06

1.0 PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Attention: If you want help translating this information, call - **Hmong** - Ceeb toom. Yog koj xav tau kev pab txhais cov xov no rau koj dawb, hu 612-673-2800; **Spanish** - Atención. Si desea recibir asistencia gratuita para traducir esta información, llama 612-673-2700; **Somali** - Ogow. Haddii aad dooneyso in lagaa kaalmeeyo tarjamadda macluumaadkani oo lacag la' aan wac 612-673-3500

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

1.1 Summary of the entire Pacific Development Project: The following is a summary of the description of the entire Pacific Development Project (PD Project) and its three phases. The applicant submitted seven separate applications to the Minneapolis Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC) listed below. As a part of the staff reports for all seven of these applications is a separately printed collection of attachments that apply to all or most of the Project components. A glance at the list of attachments at the end of this report will aid in locating the appropriate attachment.

There are four contributing historic buildings on the Pacific Block, one of which has already been rehabilitated—the Pacific Flats Building. The developer proposes to rehabilitate two other historic buildings on the block—the Monte Carlo building and the Lowry-Morrison Building. Major modifications and reconstruction are proposed to the fourth historic building on the block—the Northwestern Building. The developer also proposes to demolish noncontributing buildings and replace those sites with new construction. In addition, new construction is also proposed for the existing surface parking lots on the block.

The Project will encompass approximately 595,000 square feet of developed floor space, with an additional area of approximately 258,000 sq. ft. of structured parking. The Project will include approximately 327 condominium units; a ten-story, 133-room hotel (New Hotel); and space devoted to neighborhood retail and destination office tenants. The retail and office uses are expected to include a health and fitness club, at least two restaurants, including the existing Monte Carlo Club, and a medical clinic. The proposed residential component comprises two residential condominium towers—the 18-Story Condo Building on Washington Avenue North, and the 28-Story Condo Building whose major axis parallels 2nd Street N. with an eight-story wing along 2nd Avenue North. Both buildings will have retail uses at the street level.

A structured parking ramp is proposed to be located in the interior of the Pacific Block in the location of an existing alley and existing surface parking lots. A parking ramp located in the interior of the Pacific Block will provide off-street parking for approximately 734 vehicles (Parking Ramp). The Parking Ramp will comprise eight parking levels—three parking levels below grade; an access, parking, and service level at grade; and four structured parking levels above grade (including a mezzanine level). A roof terrace will cover the eighth parking level. There will also be a roof terrace over the portion of the structured parking behind the Monte Carlo Club between the New Hotel and the Pacific Flats Building.

The following describes the components of the PD Project and identifies the applicable HPC applications (identified as PD 1 through 7):

- **PD1—Monte Carlo Pocket Park:** Construct the Monte Carlo Club Pocket Park on the vacant northern portion of the Pacific Flats building parcel at 218-228 Washington Ave. N.

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION**

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

**Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.**

- **PD2—Lowry-Morrison Rehab:** Rehabilitate the deteriorating Lowry-Morrison Building, a contributing building at 200-204 Washington Ave. N.
- **PD3—Northwestern Building Rehab and Expansion for Hotel:** Rehabilitate and add new construction to adaptively reuse the Northwestern Glass Company Building, a contributing building located at 215-223 2nd St. N, as a boutique hotel.
- **PD4—28-Story Condo:** Demolish the Gehl-Dolphin Building—a non-contributing building located outside of the local district but within the national district at 212-216 2nd Ave. N. and part of 219 2nd St. N.—and construct the 28-Story Condo Building on the site.
- **PD5—Auto Repair Garage Demo:** Demolish the Carriage House Building/Auto Repair Garage, a non-contributing building at 206-208 Washington Ave. N.
- **PD6—18-Story Condo:** Construct the 18-Story Condo Building at 206-214 ½ Washington Ave. N. and the northwesterly half of 216 2nd Ave. N. The project includes the demolition of the Auto Repair Garage (the subject of a separate application, PD5), a non-contributing building at 206-208 Washington Ave. N.
- **PD7—Parking Ramp:** Construct a parking ramp and vehicle access on parts of Lots 1-5, 7 and 8, Block 34, Town of Minneapolis.

The applicant proposes to build the Project in three phases:

Phase 1:

- Construction of the pocket park between the Monte Carlo Club and Pacific Flats Building
- Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building into the New Hotel
- Construction of the parking and retail bases of the 18-Story Condo Building and of the 28-Story Condo Building
- Interior build-out of the upper two floors of the Pacific Flats Building (not part of this HPC application)

Phase 2:

- Construction of the residential portion of the 18-Story Condo Building (floors six through 18).

Phase 3:

- Rehabilitation of the Lowry-Morrison Building
- Construction of the residential portion of the 28-Story Condo Building (floors five through 28)
- Construction of the second pocket park behind the Lowry-Morrison Building

1.2 Summary of the Northwestern Building rehabilitation project (PD #3): The following is based on the applicant’s submission and it focuses on the rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building for a new use as the New Hotel. The Hotel includes the redesign of the west elevation, which is now a secondary facade, and the construction of six additional stories above the western half of the Northwestern Building (Attachment H

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

includes photos of the building and Attachment G includes photos of other historic buildings in the area). The Hotel will have 133 guest rooms and a host of other guest amenities including lobby, lounges, restaurant, spa and pool facilities, special events space, meeting rooms, an interior courtyard, and green roof terrace space.

Under the Minneapolis Zoning Code, the first story, which is 21 feet, 10 inches high to match the second floor level in the historic Northwestern Building, exceeds 14 feet in height, which is the Zoning Code definition of a story, and is counted as two stories. On the other hand, the 10th level is a penthouse lounge space that comprises approximately 18% of the available floor space, which is less than the Zoning Code's definition of a floor. However, this 10th level appears as a full story due to the roof cornice that encircles the entire perimeter of the building at the height of 136 ft.

The hotel will have its primary entrance on 3rd Avenue N. between the Monte Carlo Club and 2nd Street N. via a landscaped, exterior open space that will replace the existing valet parking lot on the corner. This public space will be privately owned and managed by the hotel for the hotel entrance, restaurant dining, and public seating. City building records indicate that Minneapolis Fire Station #3 on this site was torn down in 1938. Attachment 3 includes the 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance map that shows the location of the fire station and small buildings at 215 and 217 3rd Ave. N. The 1951 Sanborn map shows these parcels to be vacant as they are today.

Public access to the Northwestern Building will be preserved at the two existing arched entrances on 2nd Street N. The westerly entry will access the hotel's restaurant and the easterly entry will access a leaseable, first-level retail space. Vehicular service access for all components of the hotel operation will be from the interior-block Parking Ramp, which will provide loading areas with direct access to "back of house" functions.

The New Hotel will consist of four components that are detailed in the following sections of this report: 1) the rehabilitated Northwestern Building, 2) a new adjacent four-story building envelop and entry on the 3rd Avenue N. side of the Northwestern Building, 3) a new six-story upper volume built over the preserved Northwestern Building, and 4) the developed exterior landscape space along 3rd Avenue N.

2.0 CONTEXT

The following primary sources of information were consulted for this report:

- National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) Nomination Form and Registration Form (1989).
- "Warehouse Area Preservation Study," Minneapolis Planning Department, January 1978
- "Minneapolis Warehouse Preservation Action Plan," City of Minneapolis, September 1998.
- Warehouse Historic District Design Guidelines.
- Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

- Environmental Assessment Worksheet for the Pacific Block Development Project, approved by the City of Minneapolis, 9/1/06

2.1 Minneapolis Warehouse National Register District: The Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District, covering 150 buildings, was added to the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) in 1989 (see Exhibit 2 in Attachment A). The NRHP Nomination Form states the following:

“The District is characterized by its historic 6-8 story warehouses which once formed a thriving and prosperous commercial neighborhood adjacent to the central business district of Minneapolis. Consisting of some 62 structures, covering about 7 square blocks the District is notable for its cohesiveness of architectural styles well as for the extent to which the structures have remained unaltered. Most of the warehouses in the District were built in the Chicago Commercial Style. The exterior facades reflect the structural support system within and the ornamentation is usually minimal. The warehouses are rectangular, built up to the property line, and built of brick and stone. . . .”

“The district is historically significant for its association with the burgeoning railroad transportation network, which in the late nineteenth century, connected Minneapolis with the upper Midwest and the rest of the country. During this period, the area north of Minneapolis’ central business district was established as an area of concentrated warehouse activity for the wholesale storage and shipment related to milling and manufacturing. In addition, the district is architecturally significant for its concentration of commercial warehouse buildings designed by the city’s most prominent architects in styles ranging from late nineteenth century Romanesque to the Chicago Commercial Style of the early twentieth century.”

“The district has more than individually significant buildings. It has contributing buildings that, combined with the individually significant structures, create a landscape of buildings having a common history of age and original use and a common physical appearance of materials, design, siting and mass. These various factors combine to form a cohesive district of similar buildings, many of which are of superior design and appearance.”

The NRHP Registration Form (1989) adds the following information:

“The oldest buildings constructed in the warehouse district were small commercial structures, typically three stories tall. Many were built with storefronts on the first floor and hotels or manufacturing space above. As the area developed into the city’s warehouse and wholesale district in the late 1880s, the size of the buildings dramatically increased and was normally 5- to 7 stories with mill or semi-mill construction. After the turn of the century, massive utilitarian structures were built employing reinforced concrete and structural steel. The

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.**

Warehouse District has retained its original sense of time and place with four steel bridges still in place, many streets paved with bricks or cobblestones, and with trains passing through daily on original track beds around which the area first developed. Architecturally the buildings include every major architectural style popular during the period of significance including Italianate, Queen Ann and Richardsonian Romanesque to the Classical Revivals and early 20th century Commercial Styles.”

The periods of significance for the District are as follows: 1850-1874, 1875-1899, 1900-1924, and 1925-1949. Washington Avenue North, from First Avenue North to Ninth Avenue North., is the spine of this 30-block district. This National Register district includes the so-called Pacific Block except for two parcels in the block immediately south that are the access to Interstate 394.

The following chart lists the buildings in the block and their status as regards the National Register District and the North Loop Warehouse Local District (refer to section 2.2).

Building	Address	Built	Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District	North Loop Warehouse Local District
The Pacific Building	218-228 Washington Ave. N.	1865-1866	Contributing	Contributing
The Gluek Brewing Company Building, now known as the Monte Carlo	217 3rd Ave. N.	1910	Contributing	Contributing
Northwestern Glass Company Building	219 2nd St. N.	1912	Contributing	Contributing
	215 2nd St. N.	1918 & 1923	Contributing	Contributing
The Lowry Morrison Building	200 Washington	1879	Contributing	Contributing
Carriage House Building, also known as the Auto Repair Garage	206-208 Washington Ave. N.	1875	Noncontributing	Noncontributing
The Gehl-Dolphin Building	212 2nd Avenue N.	1951	Noncontributing	Not in District

2.2 North Loop Warehouse Local District: In 1978, the City established a local preservation district, the North Loop Warehouse Local District under the guidelines of the Minneapolis Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC). (See map, Exhibit 1 in Attachment A.) The Pacific Block is included in the local district except for the site of the Gehl-Dolphin Building and the lot at 212 2nd Avenue North. are excluded from the boundaries. The “Warehouse Area Preservation Study” of 1978 described the individually significant buildings and included the following comment on the importance of the local district (p. 4). The language parallels that of the NRHP Nomination text cited above: “An area to be considered for heritage preservation must have more than individually significant buildings. It should have, among other things, connecting tissue to unite and tie the individual buildings together. This Warehouse Area has such

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

connections in abundance. It has contributing buildings that, combined with individually significant buildings create a streetscape of buildings that have a common history in terms of age and original use and that have a common physical appearance in terms of material, design, siting and mass. These various factors combine to form a cohesive district of similar buildings, many of which are of superior design and appearance.”

2.3 Minneapolis Warehouse Preservation Action Plan (adopted by the City Council, 2000): The following excerpt from the plan applies to the project (pp. 1, 10-11):

“A Vision for the Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District: The Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District is one of our nation’s premiere historic warehousing districts. Developed between 1865-1930, the warehouse district contains a diverse and handsome selection of late 19th- and early 20th-century commercial style buildings that reflect significant warehousing, jobbing and commercial activities that made Minneapolis a regional trade center. A large part of the warehouse district’s appeal is its unique historic environment. The district’s renaissance as an arts, cultural and entertainment community in the 1970s continues to draw tenants, residents and visitors to the area. Creating an appropriate balance between old and new structures is encouraged and critical for the economic vitality of the district. The buildings of substantial character create a district that is one of Minneapolis’ competitive advantages. Whenever an historic building is demolished or altered or a new structure is inappropriately designed, the district becomes a lesser place. With care and guidance, the continued development and preservation of the warehouse district as a recreation, entertainment and creative community will enrich the lives of residents and visitors to Minneapolis into the next millennium.

“Physical Environment: Enhance the historic character of the Warehouse District, guide new development and support the unique public realm in the plan area. The historic and cultural resources in the Warehouse District are one of Minneapolis’ greatest assets. The uniqueness that other cities are searching for and trying to create, and that even the core of downtown Minneapolis is trying to enhance, is already in place in the Warehouse District.

“The goal, then, is to ensure the future preservation of this resource by establishing guidelines for sensitive and compatible alterations to the historic resources in the district, guiding new development in the district that is compatible with the historic character of the district, and enhancing streetscapes that foster pedestrian movement, encourage sidewalk cafes, create a safer atmosphere, and benefit continued reinvestment in the area.”

When the plan was adopted, the following criteria were established for all new development projects in the plan area:

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

- Encourage high quality design, architectural diversity, and the use of high quality materials that reinforces the historic character and integrity of the Warehouse Historic District and St. Anthony Falls Historic District.
- Maximize pedestrian activity through interactive building design, and enhanced streetscape and parking lot design.
- Provide opportunities for a variety of neighborhood services.
- Encourage a high quality urban environment that clearly establishes the public realm and incorporates gathering spaces.
- Accommodate and provide access to alternative modes of transportation, such as transit stops and bicycle paths.
- Discourage the demolition of historic resources for new construction or surface parking and encourage adaptive reuse.
- Emphasizes consistency with the policies of the City's Comprehensive Plan, including the Downtown 2010 component.
- Initiate the Development Objectives Process to be coordinated by the Planning Department and the Minneapolis Community Development Agency for all developments requesting public assistance or subsidy, including the sales of public land at market rate."

2.4 The Environmental Assessment Worksheet: On June 31, 2006, the City published and distributed a Mandatory Environmental Assessment Worksheet (EAW) for the Pacific Block Development Project according to the Environmental Review Rules of the Minnesota Environmental Quality Board (EQB) under Rule 4410.4300 Subpart 19 Residential Development (it exceeds the 375-unit threshold) and Subpart 31, Historical Places (it includes the demolition of structures within the National Register of Historic Places District). On September 1, 2006, the City concluded that the EAW was adequate and that no Environmental Impact Statement was required. All documents associated with the EAW, including 66 pages of comment letters, are available on the City's web site: (<http://www.ci.minneapolis.mn.us/planning/pacific-block.asp>)

2.5 Archeological and historic resources analysis in the EAW: State rules for preparing an EAW require the applicant to provide the City the data needed for the EAW. As such, Pacific Flats LLC hired the Hess, Roise and Company to prepare the required response to EAW Question 25 that addressed historic resources. The following excerpts from the EAW summarize the findings and conclusions as regards effects on contributing resources:

Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District (National Register): The Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District, covering 150 buildings, was designated in 1989. Washington Avenue North, from 1st to 9th Avenues N., is the spine of this 30-block district. This National Register district includes the Pacific Block, as well the adjacent blocks, with the exception of the I-394 access at the southwest corner of Washington and 3rd Avenues North. and the far (1st Avenue North.) side of

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

the block between 2nd Street N. and Washington Avenue North, which contains a printing company and parking lots.

On the Pacific Block, the Carriage House Buildings at 208 Washington Avenue North and the Gehl-Dolphin building at 212 2nd Avenue North are considered noncontributing; the rest of the buildings on the block contribute to the district. See Attachments N: Map of Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District (National Register), B: Project Site, and P: Photos of Present Development of the Pacific Flats Block.

North Loop Warehouse Area (Local District: The City has established a local district, the North Loop Warehouse Area (Local District) in the area under the guidelines of the Minneapolis Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC). The north end of this district is irregular in shape, including most of the buildings southwest of 2nd Street North between the railroad corridor, 2nd Avenue North, and Washington Avenue N. However, on the Pacific Block, the Gehl-Dolphin Building and lot at 212 2nd Avenue North are excluded from the boundaries. The district also includes the southwest half of the block fronting on Washington that is edged by 1st and 2nd Avenues North and 2nd Street North. The district jumps across 3rd Avenue to pick up the Moline, Milburn and Stoddard Company Building (a.k.a. Appliance Parts Building/Traffic Zone) at 250 3rd Avenue North. The rest of the district is mostly contained between 2nd Avenue North, 6th Street North, and 1st Avenue North, including the buildings fronting on the southeast side of 1st Avenue North. The modern building at the southeast corner of 1st Ave North and Washington Avenues is outside the boundaries of the local district. See Attachments O: Map of North Loop Warehouse Area (Local District), B: Project Site, and P: Photos of Present Development of the Pacific Flats Block.

The proposed renovation of the Lowry-Morrison Building, the demolition of back portion of the Northwestern Building, and the construction of new structures in the North Loop Warehouse Area (Local District) will initiate a Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC) review for appropriateness of the proposed renovation, demolition, and new construction. The HPC has adopted district specific guidelines to assist them and proposers in determining the appropriateness of elements of the proposed renovation, demolition, and new construction. The guidelines for the North Loop Warehouse Area (Local District) touch on topics such as masonry repair, storefronts, window replacement, roofing, dropped interior ceilings, removal of historical fabric, health and safety code requirements, building entrances, accent banding, and treatment of side or rear walls. . . .

The HPC guidelines for the adjacent St. Anthony Falls Historic District limits the height of new buildings to fit within the range of heights for existing buildings, typically 4 to 6 stories high. At this stage in the planning and design process,

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

design details for the 28-Story Condo Building Alternative and the 40-Story Condo Building Alternative project are not known.

(a) 28-Story Condo Building Alternative and Guidelines: Both condominium buildings in the 28-Story Condo Building Alternative will be constructed partly or wholly within the North Loop Warehouse Historic District. The proposed design is not within conformance of the adopted Warehouse Historic District Guidelines. All rehabilitation and infill construction will require approvals by the HPC.

(b) 40 Story Condo Building Alternative And Guidelines: In this 40-story Condo Building Alternative, the 40-Story part of the Condo Building will be constructed entirely on the lot on where the Gehl-Dolphin Building is located. That lot is not within the North Loop Warehouse Area (Local District) though it is within the national district. All rehabilitation and infill construction will require approvals by the HPC. After a report by CPED-Planning staff and hearing from the public, the HPC will determine the appropriateness of the design of all the elements of either alternative in the North Loop Warehouse Area (Local District). The decision of the HPC can be appealed to the City Council.

2.6 Comments on the EAW from the Minnesota Historical Society: The Minnesota Historic Society comment letter on the EAW included the following comment (Attachment J): “Rehabilitation of historic buildings in the block should be done in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation. In this respect, demolition of the rear portion of the Northwestern Building would not meet the Standards.”

3.0 PROPOSED CHANGES

The following is a summary of the information submitted by the applicant, which is available in Attachment 1:

3.1 Changes to the existing Northwestern Building:

3.1.1 2nd Street N. façade (north): The applicant has committed to rehabilitate the exterior building face along 2nd Street N. in accordance with the Warehouse Historic District Design Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation. The existing replacement windows will be maintained. Inappropriate additions to the facade such as highway-type lighting fixtures, small banners, and a fabric canopy at the east entry will be removed and original materials will be patched. Brick repair and repointing will be executed as necessary.

3.1.2 3rd Avenue N. façade (west): Several changes are proposed for the west façade:

- **Removal of existing brick and windows:** Existing windows and brick is proposed to be removed down to the raw structural concrete frame on all

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

four floors with one exception. The original construction infill brick of the first bay of all four floors on the northwest corner of the building nearest to 2nd Street N. is proposed to remain and be cleaned using the gentlest means possible to remove subsequent layers of brown paint.

- **New structural frame:** A new structural frame are proposed to be positioned to the west in front of the original side of the building.. The large frame-like nature of this new building envelope is proposed to be set back approximately 50 feet from 3rd Ave. N. The new frame and building envelope will relate directly to the height and floor alignment of the Northwestern Building and it will create a thin edge element along 2nd Street N. that will turn the corner and form the new building face along 3rd Avenue N. There will be a slight separation between old and new construction. The new frame and building envelope will angle and widen from about 2 to 10 feet over the 162-foot length of the Northwestern Building.

According to the applicant, “The massing design of the new building face coupled with the site setback is intended to invoke an architectural dialogue between the hotel and the existing Colonial Warehouse Building directly across 3rd Avenue N. and to embolden a new urban space in between (Attachment G includes pictures of the Colonial Warehouse). The 220-foot long, five-story, yellow brick Colonial Warehouse, with its nine, super-arched bays will be matched with a non-identical yet responsive foil in the hotel facade. The proposed 162-foot long hotel will be divided into nine smaller bays. Each bay will be approximately 50% brick and 50% window aperture to advance an architecture of solid masonry with punched openings consistent with the traditional language of the North Loop neighborhood. At the street level, the openings will be arched with the spring line at 12 feet above typical grade.”

- **First floor changes on existing building and on the new frame structure:** There will be no glass in the first floor arches of the new angled wall so that access will be clear to the five first floor entrances to the hotel. The first floor façade of the hotel will be flush with the existing wall (the upper three floors extend to the west out to the new angled wall) and it will be floor-to-ceiling glass with 5 double-door entrances. Thus, the open arches on the first floor will create an arcade.
- **Floors 2-4:** As stated above, the first structural bay of the new frame nearest to 2nd Street N. on all four floors will be open to reveal the existing Northwestern Building side behind it. The floors of the eight bays to the south on floors 2-4 will extend to the new frame wall to provide additional space and small balconies (3-5 ft.; balcony railings not shown on plans) at each guest room to continue the rhythm of the open frame.

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

The following table describes the effects on floor space. Were the rooms to be built within the existing building, the 24 rooms on the west side would average 438 sq. ft. each (approximately 27 X 16 on average). The proposed frame wall will increase the average room size by 69 sq. ft., a 16% expansion.

3.1.3 South side: Existing building elements – windows and brick, etc. – will be removed down to the raw structural concrete frame. The concrete structure will be cleaned using the gentlest means possible to remove paint. New operable metal window units will infill the structural frame.

3.1.4 Proposed demolition: The proposed reuse of the Northwestern Building intends to incorporate a narrower floor plate width than exists in the building. According to the applicant, an optimal hotel guestroom layout will be accomplished by creating an interior atrium in the middle of the Building. Twelve bays from the east half of the building will be removed while leaving the east exterior wall frame and brick infill exposed to the new atrium. (The Northwestern Building floor plate comprises 72 structural bays.) This configuration will create a depth for a U-shaped, double-loaded, corridor hotel layout with natural light penetration into the building on three sides, both at the building’s interior and its exterior.

The applicant points out that the City has acknowledged the difficulty of redeveloping large floor plates in certain historic warehouse buildings. The Minneapolis Warehouse Preservation Action Plan (p. 21-22) specifically mentions the Northwestern Building when discussing how structures with extra large floor plates are difficult to adapt for office or residential use.

Hotel guest rooms in the Northwestern Building portion of the hotel will be characterized by high ceilings, exposed bell columns, and combined operable and large, fixed picture windows in keeping with the current fenestration pattern. The hotel lobby and restaurant at the street level will also feature the tall ceilings and historic, structural concrete bell columns in its design, but do not propose to use the current fenestration in most cases.

3.1.5 Integration with new construction: Architectural integration with additional new hotel construction will require several interventions inside the Northwestern Building. First, ten new structural concrete columns will be introduced to support six floor plates stacked above the west half of the Northwestern Building. The new concrete columns will penetrate the existing concrete floor plates and will be differentiated from existing columns as simple smooth rounds with no cap expression. Second, several new or revised vertical cores will be required for stairways, elevator shafts, and mechanical and electrical chases.

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.**

4.1.6 Exterior materials: The following chart lists the materials and how they are used in the various components of the PD Project. As shown, Brick Type 3 and 4 will be used on the new hotel facades.

Item	Color	Texture and Finish	Color Name	Mortar	Use	Manufacturer
Brick, Type 1	Yellow	Smooth and dull	Butternut Velour		Rehab of the Lowry-Morrison Building	Sioux City Brick
Brick, Type 2	Reddish-brown	Smooth and dull	Cabernet	Same color	18-Story and 28-Story Condo Buildings	Robinson Brick Company
Brick, Type 3	Light yellow	Rough and dull	Modular Glasgow Blend 8X A	Dark buff	Floors 1-4 of the New Hotel Building	Belden Brick Company
Brick, Type 4	Grayish-brown	Smooth and lightly glazed	Mountain Shadow Smooth	Portland and lime	Floors 5-10 of the New Hotel Building	Sioux City Brick
Stone	Reddish-tan	Polished	Minnesota Travernelle	White	18-Story and 28-Story Condo Buildings	Vetter Stone

Also, a large metal entry canopy will be over the hotel entrances on the west side.

3.1.6 Windows and doors: All door and window glazing will be clear, non-tinted, non-reflective glass. Window operation may either be sliding or casement style; the selection is yet to be determined. Frames will be as minimal in thickness as possible to heighten elegance and increase the light available to the interior spaces beyond. Frames will be either black anodized or black powder-coated in finish. Since window design and details and designs are not yet finalized and submitted, it is not possible to determine if the windows on this proposed project will meet applicable guidelines and standards.

Attachment D lists the window sizes and height-to-width ratios for the primary facades in the PD Project. The following table summarizes these ratios:

Building	Windows per Total Window Opening/Average Height-to-Width Ratio*		
	First Floor	Floors 2-4	Upper floors
Northwestern (north facade)	3/3.0	3/1.8	
Hotel (new west facade)	4/3.4	3/2.9	
Hotel (new construction)**			1/1.9
Lowry-Morrison	3/1.3	2/1.6	
Pacific Flats	2.5/4.8	1/2.7	
18-Story Condo	4/4.6	3/3.0	3/2.9
28-Story Condo	4/3.7	3/2.9	3/2.9
*HPC Guideline for height-to width ratio is 3.0			
** Does not include floor 5, which is a glass curtain wall on all 4 sides			

The rehabilitation of the existing building to be the four-story base of the hotel will result in four distinct façade treatments:

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

- **North façade:** As stated above in Section 4.1.1, the existing replacement windows will be maintained. Brick repair and repointing will be executed as necessary. The height-to-width ratio of the 3-paned window openings on the first floor is 3.0, the same ratio called for in the Guidelines for the historic district. The ratio for floors 2-4 is 1.8 for these three-paned, Chicago Style windows.
- **West façade:** The proposed, new angled wall of this façade will be built with brick to match the texture and feel of the Colonial Warehouse across the street. The brick will be a yellow-hued, rough-faced, unglazed, Modular Glasgow Blend by Belden Brick or equal. Mortar will be matched to the brick color and joint width may be minimized or struck flush. The first floor façade of the hotel will be flush with the existing wall and it will be floor-to-ceiling glass with 5 double-door entrances. Windows at the guest room levels (floors 2-4) will run full length from floor to ceiling and will be set back from the front of the new angled frame wall by 3 to 5 ft. in the balcony area. The height-to-width ratio of the 4-paned arched window openings on the first floor will be 3.4, and for floors 2-4 it will be 2.9 for the three-paned Chicago Style windows.
- **South façade:** Existing building elements – windows and brick, etc. – will be removed down to the raw structural concrete frame. The concrete structure will be cleaned using the gentlest means possible to remove paint and new operable metal window units will infill the structural frame. Windows at the guest room levels (floors 2-4) will run full length from floor to ceiling.
- **East courtyard facades:** Like the west façade, the three walls that form the courtyard will be built with a yellow-hued, rough-faced, unglazed, Modular Glasgow Blend by Belden Brick or equal. Mortar will be matched to the brick color and joint width may be minimized or struck flush. Windows at the guest room levels (floors 2-4) will run full length from floor to ceiling.

3.1.8 Roof: The roof of the four-story base will be flat and incorporate a parapet at guardrail height to allow rooftop occupancy. The parapet edge will be simple capped brick..

3.2 Design of upper six-stories: The upper six stories and the penthouse level of the hotel will be set back approximately 12 feet from the 3rd Avenue N. frontage of the four-story base and 42 feet from the curb on 3rd Ave. N. Its 64-foot by 128-foot floor plate will sit on ten concrete columns that extend through the structure of the west half of the Northwestern Building. According to the applicant, this gives the upper floors the impression of being a special building element poised on top of a plinth that is more contextually part of the neighborhood fabric – a difference that allows the upper floors to be handled with more architectural abstraction. To push this difference, a definite change will be made in material color, texture, and window pattern, moving from the context-

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

matching color and coarser texture of the base toward a more obscure expression closer to the sky.

The first upper floor level (the fifth floor of the hotel) will be programmed as hotel common spaces: a special events space and a “club room” lounge. These spaces will access green roof terraces on top of the Northwestern Building. The next four levels will be hotel guest rooms. The tenth (top) level will be a rooftop lounge and pool space. Although some of the tenth level spaces will be open air, a continuous building cornice line will be maintained above this level. The rhythm of window apertures at this level will continue similar to levels below although several arched openings adjacent to the pool area will be open frames without glass.

Exterior materials: The six upper levels of the hotel will be built with a brownish, smooth-faced, flash fired brick that is common to the North Loop neighborhood alternated with clear glass windows (refer to the table in Section 4.1.5). Mortar will be matched to the brick color and joint width may be minimized – both techniques to increase the sense of monolithic wall frequently observed in historic buildings in this neighborhood. The arched openings at the topmost level will be actual brick-arched using centering false works. As the elevations indicate, the brick-faced piers and windows for floors 6-10 vary in width and placement to create an irregular vertical pattern on all four facades.

Windows and doors: The entire fifth level of common spaces will feature operable floor-to-ceiling glass panels allowing at least 50% of the wall to open to the exterior. The same rhythm of structural bays will be preserved, but the high concentration of glass is intended to address the open, more public program at this level, make greater connection to outdoor terrace space, and visually separate the upper floors from the more solid building base. Windows at the four guest room levels above will run full length from floor to ceiling. Window operation may either be sliding or casement style. Window and door frames will project beyond the brick face so as to cast a shadow line upon the solid brick surface in an inverse relationship to the traditional window aperture typology of the neighborhood. The height-to-width ratio for these windows on all four facades will be 1.9, which is considerably less than the 3.0 ratio called for in the Guidelines.

Windows and doorways at the topmost level will again be arched similar to those at the street level below in the existing building. Frames will be as thin as possible to heighten elegance and increase light available to the interior spaces beyond. Frames will be either black anodized or black powder-coated in finish. All door and window glazing will be clear, non-tinted, non-reflective glass.

Roof: The roof of the six upper floors will appear flat. However, it will extend over only that part of the sixth floor that holds a rooftop lounge and supporting spaces available to the public. Immediately adjacent will be an open-air pool and deck space enclosed by the full height parapet wall. The parapet wall will be punctuated with arched openings that

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

preserve the architectural rhythm of the top level. The parapet edge will be simple corbelled brick similar to several historic buildings in the neighborhood.

- 3.3 Design of Exterior Public Space:** The hotel will have its primary entrance on 3rd Avenue N. between the Monte Carlo Club and 2nd Street N. via a landscaped exterior open space that will replace the existing valet parking lot on the corner. As noted above, this will be a public space, privately owned and managed by the hotel for the New Hotel entrance, restaurant dining, and public seating. Attachment 1 includes more detail regarding this space.

4.0 GUIDELINE CITATIONS

4.1 Chapter 599, Heritage Preservation Regulations, Article VI: Certificate of Appropriateness

599.310. Purpose. Certificates of appropriateness are established to protect landmarks, historic districts and nominated properties under interim protection by providing the commission with authority to review and approve or deny all proposed alterations to a landmark, property in an historic district or nominated property under interim protection.

599.350. Required findings for certificate of appropriateness. (a) *In general.* Before approving a certificate of appropriateness, the commission shall make findings that the alteration will not materially impair the integrity of the landmark, historic district or nominated property under interim protection and is consistent with the applicable design guidelines adopted by the commission, or if design guidelines have not been adopted, is consistent with the recommendations contained in The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, except as otherwise provided in this section.

(b) *Destruction of any property.* Before approving a certificate of appropriateness that involves the destruction, in whole or in part, of any landmark property in an historic district or nominated property under interim protection, the commission shall make findings that the destruction is necessary to correct an unsafe or dangerous condition on the property, or that there are no reasonable alternatives to the destruction. In determining whether reasonable alternatives exist, the commission shall consider, but not be limited to, the significance of the property, the integrity of the property and the economic value or usefulness of the existing structure, including its current use, costs of renovation and feasible alternative uses. The commission may delay a final decision for a reasonable period of time to allow parties interested in preserving the property a reasonable opportunity to act to protect it.

599.360. Certificate of appropriateness conditions and guarantees. (b) *Mitigation plan.* The commission may require a mitigation plan as a condition of any approval for demolition or relocation of a landmark, property in an historic district or nominated property under interim protection. Such plan may include the documentation of the

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

property by measured drawings, photographic recording, historical research or other means appropriate to the significance of the property. Such plan also may include the salvage and preservation of specified building materials, architectural details, ornaments, fixtures and similar items for use in restoration elsewhere.

(c) *Additional conditions and guarantees.* The commission may impose such conditions on any certificate of appropriateness and require such guarantees as it deems reasonable and necessary to protect the public interest and to ensure compliance with the standards and purposes of this chapter.

4.2 Warehouse Historic District Design Guidelines: The guidelines and the staff analysis are included in the Analysis section of this report in Section 6.0.

4.2.1 Warehouse Historic District Design Guidelines for Rehabilitation:

1. Masonry repair:
 - A. No exterior sandblasting is permitted.
 - B. Chemical cleaning is not permitted on glazed brick, glazed terra cotta, limestone, marble or other masonry material susceptible to damage from chemical exposure.
 - C. Repointing of masonry joints shall be done with a mortar composition and color to match original mortar, joints shall be tooled to match original profile.
2. Storefronts:
 - A. Wherever existing storefronts remain, critical details shall be retained, e.g., cast iron columns, wood molding, trim, terra cotta ornament.
 - B. Modifications to entries shall be permitted as required for the adaptive reuse of the buildings. Modifications shall be constructed with materials to match original storefronts.
 - C. Handicap accessibility shall be done within the building where ramping with guard rails is required on street facades. Appropriate modifications to the facade will be permitted for on-grade access.
 - D. New storefronts will be permitted where original storefronts have been removed. New storefronts shall replicate original where historical photos exist or be designed in the spirit of the original buildings with characteristics as follows:
 - Clear glass
 - Transoms over storefront
 - Recessed entry doors
 - Raised panels below storefronts
 - Use of historic columns compatible with the buildings and era

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

- Storefronts shall be divided into bays corresponding with the window bay pattern above. Bays may be divided with brick, cast iron, terra cotta panels or other historically compatible materials.
3. Window replacement:
 - A. Windows which have unique architectural or historically significant details which cannot be duplicated must be retained.
 - B. Window replacement other than item A shall be permitted if original windows are badly deteriorated or provide inadequate thermal performance. (Use of interior storm windows shall be encouraged.)
 - C. Replacement windows may be wood or aluminum. Window paning shall be provided to replicate existing wood moldings.
 - D. Replacement windows must have a true offset, single- or double-hung operation. (They need not be operable.)
 - E. Replacement windows will have a paint finish. (Anodized windows will not be permitted.)
 - F. Replacement windows shall have clear glass unless historical documentation suggests otherwise.
 4. Roofing.
 - A. Modern roofing materials will be permitted on flat roofs.
 - B. Original copings on street facings shall be retained or replaced. Metal coping with a paint finish will be permitted as replacement for brick copings on common walls.
 - C. Roof top additions which project above parapet walls such as deck, skylights, penthouses, and mechanical equipment shall be set back from the primary building or street facades at least one structural bay.
 5. Dropped interior ceilings.
 - A. Interior dropped ceilings shall be held away 5'0" from exterior window when they drop below the existing window head.
 6. Removal of historical fabric.
 - A. Selective removal of original building materials is allowed when deterioration has occurred or for remodeling as part of an adaptive reuse. HPC approval is required to remove any historic building materials.
 7. Health and safety code requirements.
 - A. Exterior alterations required by health and safety codes also require HPC review. When necessary, the HPC can argue for exceptions to the building code when life safety issues are not involved.

4.2.2 Warehouse Historic District Design Guidelines for Infill Construction:

1. Decision intent.

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

- A. The intent of these guidelines is for infill construction which characterize a masonry load bearing building and not a contemporary curtain wall structure. The existing warehouse buildings followed early commercial ideas for tall buildings which emulate the classic column with a defined base, shaft, and capital. Creative design concepts are not discouraged.
2. Building massing (General footprinting and shape).
 - A. Building outline.
 - a. New construction shall be built out to the property line on street frontage.
 - b. Corner lots: The building shall be built out to both property lines on street frontage.
 - c. Buildings which do not require a footprint as large as the site may utilize courtyards or atrium on the interior of the lot.
 - B. Building shape.
 - a. The building shall be rectangular in shape and volume. Step backs at the upper floors on street facades will not be allowed.
 - C. Building height.
 - a. Minimum height: 2 stories.
 - b. Maximum height: 10 stories.
 - c. A story shall be defined as follows:
 - (1) First story: 14-18'0" floor to floor.
 - (2) 2-10 story: 10-12'0" floor to floor.Deviation in story height will not allow additional stories.
3. Street facade.
 - A. Building material.
 - a. Primary facing material shall be dark brown or red unglazed brick.
 - b. Corner buildings shall have dark brown or red unglazed brick on both facades.
 - c. The brick shall be modular in size (3 courses per 8").
 - B. Criteria for storefront option.
 - a. The first story storefront shall be divided into bays by masonry piers which correspond with window openings above.
 - b. Storefront design shall be complimentary to existing buildings.
 - C. Windows.
 - a. Windows shall be a series of rectilinear openings separated by masonry piers. Window openings shall not exceed a single structural bay in width. These may be single or pairs of windows separated by masonry piers.

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

- b. Continuous horizontal or vertical bands of windows will not be permitted.
- c. Window height shall be three times its width as applied to a single window unit.
- d. Window frames shall have a paint finish.
- e. Window glass shall be clear.
- f. Windows shall be true single- or double-hung. (Operable windows are not required.)
- g. Windows will be set back from the brick face a minimum of one brick width.
- D. Building entrances.
 - a. Building entrances shall be incorporated into storefronts or may be a special design feature such as Butler Square.
- F. Accent banding.
 - a. The brick facade shall be articulated by horizontal accent bands of brick detail, stone, terra cotta pre-cast, cast iron, exposed steel, pressed metal, or other suitable materials.
- 4. Side or rear walls.
 - A. Building materials: Light common brick shall be the primary facing materials. (Simple unembellished designs will be encouraged.)
 - a. Window openings
 - (1) Window openings shall be of a punched nature.
 - (2) Window design shall be the same as 2-C.
 - (3) Windows within interior court and not visible from the street have no restrictions.
 - b. Interior court yards not viewed from the street will not have design restrictions.
- 5. Elevators.
 - A. Exterior glass enclosed elevators or other high tech design elements will not be permitted.
- 6. Roofs.
 - A. The roof shall be flat with parapet walls.
 - B. Roof top mechanical equipment shall be set back from front exterior walls a minimum of one structural bay.
 - C. Penthouses and stair towers will be set back one structural bay from a street facade.

4.3 U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service, National Register Criteria: National Register criteria define, for the nation as a whole, the scope and nature of historic and archeological properties that are to be considered eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.

Criteria for Evaluation: The quality of significance in American history, architecture, archeology, engineering, and culture is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures,

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

and objects that possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association and:

- a. That are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or
- b. That are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or
- c. That embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or
- d. That have yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

Criteria Considerations: Ordinary cemeteries, birthplaces, or graves of historical figures, properties owned by religious institutions or used for religious purposes, structures that have been moved from their original locations, reconstructed historic buildings, properties primarily commemorative in nature, and properties that have achieved significance within the past 50 years shall not be considered eligible for the National Register. However, such properties will qualify if they are integral parts of districts that do meet the criteria or if they fall within the following categories:

- a. A religious property deriving primary significance from architectural or artistic distinction or historical importance; or
- b. A building or structure removed from its original location but which is significant primarily for architectural value, or which is the surviving structure most importantly associated with a historic person or event; or
- c. A birthplace or grave of a historical figure of outstanding importance if there is no other appropriate site or building directly associated with his productive life; or
- d. A cemetery that derives its primary significance from graves of persons of transcendent importance, from age, from distinctive design features, or from association with historic events; or
- e. A reconstructed building, when accurately executed in a suitable environment and presented in a dignified manner as part of a restoration master plan, and when no other building or structure with the same association has survived; or
- f. A property primarily commemorative in intent if design, age, tradition, or symbolic value has invested it with its own historical significance; or
- g. A property achieving significance within the past 50 years if it is of exceptional importance.

4.4 National Park Service, Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation: The following are selected standards that are applicable to the Project. The next section examines Project consistency with these Standards.

4.4.1 Masonry: Brick, stone, terra cotta, concrete, adobe, stucco, and mortar:

Recommended:

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.**

- Identifying, retaining, and preserving masonry features that are important in defining the overall historic character of the building such as walls, brackets, railings, cornices, window architraves, door pediments, steps, and columns; and joint and unit size, tooling and bonding patterns, coatings, and color.

Not Recommended:

- Removing or radically changing masonry features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the building so that, as a result, the character is diminished.

Design for Missing Historic Features

- Introducing a new masonry feature that is incompatible in size, scale, material, and color.

4.4.2 Windows:

Recommended:

- Identifying, retaining, and preserving windows and their functional and decorative features that are important in defining the overall historic character of the building. Such features can include frames, sash, muntins, glazing, sills, heads, hoodmolds, paneled or decorated jambs and moldings, and interior and exterior shutters and blinds.

Design for Missing Historic Features

- Designing and installing new windows when the historic windows (frame, sash and glazing) are completely missing. The replacement windows may be an accurate restoration using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation; or be a new design that is compatible with the window openings and the historic character of the building.

Alterations/Additions for the New Use

- Designing and installing additional windows on rear on other non-character-defining elevations if required by the new use. New windows openings may also be cut into exposed party walls. Such design should be compatible with the overall design of the building, but not duplicate the fenestration pattern and detailing of a character-defining elevation.

Not Recommended:

- Removing or radically changing windows which are important in defining the overall historic character of the building so that, as a result, the character is diminished.
- Changing the historic appearance of windows through the use of inappropriate designs, materials, finishes, or colors which radically change

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.**

the sash, depth of reveal, and muntin configuration; the reflectivity and color of the glazing; or the appearance of the frame.

Design for Missing Historic Features

- Introducing a new design that is incompatible with the historic character of the building.

Alterations/Additions for the New Use

- Installing new windows, including frames, sash, and muntin configuration that are incompatible with the building's historic appearance or obscure, damage, or destroy character-defining features.

4.4.3 New Additions to Historic Buildings: Because such expansion has the capability to radically change the historic appearance, an exterior addition should be considered only after it has been determined that the new use cannot be successfully met by altering non-character-defining interior spaces. If the new use cannot be met in this way, then an attached exterior addition is usually an acceptable alternative. New additions should be designed and constructed so that the character-defining features of the historic building are not radically changed, obscured, damaged, or destroyed in the process of rehabilitation. New design should always be clearly differentiated so that the addition does not appear to be part of the historic resource.

Recommended:

- Constructing a new addition so that there is the least possible loss of historic materials and so that character-defining features are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed.
- Locating the attached exterior addition at the rear or on an inconspicuous side of a historic building; and limiting its size and scale in relationship to the historic building.
- Designing new additions in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new.
- Considering the attached exterior addition both in terms of the new use and the appearance of other buildings in the historic district or neighborhood, design for the new work may be contemporary or may reference design motifs from the historic building. In either case, it should always be clearly differentiated from the historic building and be compatible in terms of mass, materials, relationship of solids to voids, and color.
- Designing additional stories, when required for the new use, that are set back from the wall plane and are as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street.

Not Recommended:

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

- Expanding the size of the historic building by constructing a new addition when the new use could be met by altering non-character-defining interior spaces.
- Attaching a new addition so that the character-defining features of the historic building are obscured, damaged, or destroyed.
- Designing a new addition so that its size and scale in relation to the historic building are out of proportion, thus diminishing the historic character.
- Duplicating the exact form, material, style, and detailing of the historic building in the new addition so that the new work appears to be part of the historic building.
- Imitating a historic style or period of architecture in new additions, especially for contemporary uses such as drive-in banks or garages.
- Designing and constructing new additions that result in the diminution or loss of the historic character of the resource, including its design, materials, workmanship, location, or setting.
- Using the same wall plane, roof line, cornice height, materials, siding lap or window type to make additions appear to be a part of the historic building.
- Designing new additions such as multistory greenhouse additions that obscure, damage, or destroy character-defining features of the historic building.
- Constructing additional stories so that the historic appearance of the building is radically changed.

4.4.4 Building Site

Recommended:

- Identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings and their features as well as features of the site that are important in defining its overall historic character. Site features can include driveways, walkways, lighting, fencing, signs, benches, fountains, wells, terraces, canal systems, plants and trees, berms, and drainage or irrigation ditches; and archeological features that are important in defining the history of the site.
- Retaining the historic relationship between buildings, landscape features, and open space.

Alterations/Additions for the New Use

- Designing new onsite parking, loading docks, or ramps when required by the new use so that they are as unobtrusive as possible and assure the preservation of character-defining features of the site.

Not Recommended:

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.**

- Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the building site so that, as a result, the character is diminished.

5.0 FINDINGS

1. **Historic designation:** The Pacific Development Project (PD Project), including the subject application, is located within the North Loop Warehouse Local District (established in 1978) and the Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District (National Register of Historic Places District established in 1989). The area is historically significant as the area of early commercial growth during the development of the City that established Minneapolis as the trade center for the Upper Midwest. In recognition of this heritage, and to preserve this resource that focuses on some of the oldest standing buildings in the City, the area has been designated both locally and nationally as a historic district. The periods of significance for the National Register District are as follows: 1850-1874, 1875-1899, 1900-1924, and 1925-1949.
2. **The Pacific Development Project application:** The Pacific Flats LLC has filed seven Certificate of Appropriateness applications for the various components of the PD Project. The subject application is for New Construction, Rehabilitation, and Demolition for the rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building, located at 215-223 2nd St. N., as a new hotel.
3. **Historical and archeological significance:** The National Register nomination concludes that the Northwestern Building (Northwestern Glass Company) is a contributing structure to the District. The Planning Division prepared the historical and archeological assessments contained in the Environmental Assessment Worksheet (EAW) for the project, which states that the building is a contributing building to both the national and to the local district and that no significant prehistoric or historic artifacts survive on this totally built site.
4. **Rehabilitation commitment:** The applicant has committed to rehabilitate the exterior building face along 2nd Street N. in accordance with the Warehouse Historic District Design Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The existing replacement windows will be maintained. Inappropriate additions to the facade such as highway-type lighting fixtures, small banners, and a fabric canopy at the east entry will be removed and original materials will be patched. Brick repair and repointing will be executed as necessary. All repair work to the north faced (along North 2nd Street) should be in accordance with the Secretary of Interior Standards.
5. **New construction:** The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards) call for new construction to "make clear what is historic and what is new," and recommends against "duplicating the exact form, material, style, and detailing of the historic building in the new addition so that the new work appears to be part of the historic building." New construction, floors 5-10 above the existing building, will be

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.**

consistent with the general design intent of the Standards because it will be discernable as new construction that is set back from the existing historic building and it will not create a false sense of history. However, the new construction, floors 5-10 above the existing building is inconsistent with the intent of the Guidelines. It is not “a masonry loading bearing building” but rather “a contemporary curtain wall structure” which the Guidelines discourage.

- 6. Maintaining overall integrity of District:** The application has not clearly indicated how incorporation of major new construction on this site as part of the existing historic structure will be accomplished in such a way as to maintain the overall integrity of the structure itself. Despite the very general recommendations of the Secretary of the Interior Standards on design compatibility, the widely varied assortment of architectural design treatments proposed for changes to this specific building will undermine its place as part of the collection of buildings within both the local and national districts, thereby weakening the overall character of both the local and national districts.
- 7. Building integrity:** There is considerable risk that the changes proposed to the building in this application would harm the physical integrity of the building to such an extent that it would call into question the building’s ongoing maintenance and its lasting place as part of this particular historic district.
- 8. Building setback, orientation, and entrances:** The existing primary façade (north) has two existing entrances, both of which will remain but to access the restaurant and retail on North 2nd Street. The proposed project for this portion of the block is inconsistent with the Guidelines because it will create a new primary building entrance which is setback from the street, in this case, Third Avenue North. In reference to new additions, the Standards recommend, “Locating the attached exterior addition at the rear or on an inconspicuous side of a historic building; and limiting its size and scale in relationship to the historic building.” Creating a new primary entrance for the hotel on Third Avenue North will change the historic entrance is inconsistent with this Standard and will create competing and confusing primary facades. Re-orienting the building entrance to the west façade undermines the existing primary building entrance on the north façade.
- 9. Porte-cochere and driveway:** The incorporation of a porte-cochere and driveway for vehicles on the northwest corner of the block is incompatible with the Design Guidelines for infill construction and the Secretary’s Standards because it introduces a new architectural form into an otherwise consistent architectural vocabulary that does not and never has included this sort of use or feature. The Guidelines state, “2. Building massing. a. New construction shall be built out to the property line on street frontage. b. Corner lots: The building shall be built out to both property lines on street frontage.” The Standards recommend against, “Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the building site so that, as a result, the character is diminished.”

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

- 10. Building height, massing, and shape:** The 10-story hotel complies with the height guideline. With the exception of the new façade proposed for the west side of the building that angles from 4 ft. to 12 ft. from the front of the existing façade, the new construction stays within the footprint of the existing building consistent with the Guidelines. The project is inconsistent with this requirement in that the new façade proposed for the west side of the building is set on an angle. In addition, the 6-floor hotel addition, while rectangular, sets back from the west façade by 8 to 14 ft. and from the north façade by 24 ft.
- 11. Curtain wall construction:** The District Guidelines specifically discourage curtain wall construction. The architectural rhythm of the new curtain wall construction is compatible with the existing building and other historic buildings in the District in terms of size, scale, materials, color, windows, and doors. However, the applicant has not made a clear case for why the west façade of the Northwestern Building should become its primary façade (as opposed to the existing primary façade, which is the north side of the building).
- 12. Angled west façade:** Rehabilitating the existing west facade to be similar to the north façade would be inconsistent with the Standards because it was not the front of the building historically and it could create a false sense of history.
- 13. Demolition to create internal courtyard:** The Minnesota Historic Society comment letter on the EAW included the following comment (Attachment J): “Rehabilitation of historic buildings in the block should be done in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation. In this respect, demolition of the rear portion of the Northwestern Building would not meet the Standards.”
- 14. Windows:** The new fifth floor will have floor-to-ceiling windows on all four sides, which is prohibited by the Guidelines. The new windows on floors 6-10 have a height-to-width ratio that is less than 3 and they are not proportional to either (a) the existing windows to be retained or (b) to the new windows proposed for the existing building. The proposed new fifth floor will have floor-to-ceiling windows on all four sides, which is prohibited by the Guidelines.
- 15. Roofs:** The adaptation of the roof of the Northwestern Building to allow for landscaping and patios has not yet been submitted. The application materials do not indicate how this structural load would be supported in such a way as to maintain the integrity of the existing building. Likewise, the application materials do not indicate how the drainage and stormwater management on this roof will be revised in order to ensure the continued maintenance and integrity of the historic building.
- 16. Green space/seating area:** The proposed green space/seating area on the northwestern corner of the block is not compatible with the Warehouse District Design Guidelines for infill construction. The attempt to incorporate green space into the Warehouse District is laudable. However, the location for this green space undermines the historic fabric of the

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

district because it does not allow for new building walls that are built out to both property lines on the street frontage.

17. **Green space/seating area scale:** If the proposed new structure for the green space/seating area is considered one-half story or less, it does not meet the Guideline's the minimum height of new structures, which is two stories. If the proposed structure is considered a raised sidewalk (similar to the historic sidewalks and loading docks in the district), it is too wide and poorly mimics the original feature in size, scale, and relationship to primary building elevations.

6.0 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

The Community Planning and Economic Development Department—Planning Division recommends that the Minneapolis Heritage Preservation Commission **adopt** the above findings and **deny** the Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction, Rehabilitation, and Demolition for the rehabilitation as a new hotel of the Northwestern Building, which is a component of the Pacific Development Project to be located at 215-223 2nd St. N

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building as a new hotel at 215-223 2nd St. N.

Attachments Common to all Pacific Development Applications (Printed separately)

- Attachment A.** General Description of the Pacific Development. Includes the following:
- Exhibit 1: Map of North Loop Warehouse Local District
 - Exhibit 2: Map of Minneapolis Warehouse National Register District
 - Exhibit 3: Schematic of Bridge Blocks
 - Exhibit 4: Existing Conditions
 - Exhibit 5: Nearby Building Heights
 - Exhibit 6: Project Perspectives
- Attachment B.** HPC application identification map
- Attachment C.** Buildings and addresses in area
- Attachment D.** Window dimensions and materials list
- Attachment E.** Pacific Development Project plans
- Attachment F.** Property owner sheets on the historic buildings and Sanborn maps of the site, 1912 and 1951
- Attachment G.** Photos of the area
- Attachment H.** Photos of affected elevations
- Attachment I.** Shadow analysis
- Attachment J.** EAW comment letter from the Minnesota Historical Society
- Attachment K.** Letters from the North Loop Neighborhood Association

Attachments Specific to Subject Application and Included Herein:

1. Applicant's application for the Certificate of Appropriateness: Description of subject project
2. Applicant's application for the Certificate of Appropriateness: Description of subject project consistency with HPC Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards
3. Excerpts from an email (10/16/06) from Charlene Roise and photo