

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT**

FILE NAME: Component of the Pacific Development Project—a new 18-story, 117-unit, mixed-use, condominium building (18-Story Condo Building) to be constructed at 206-214 ½ Washington Ave. N. and northwesterly half of 216 2nd Ave. N.

DATE OF APPLICATION: Determined to be complete on 10/11/06.

APPLICANT: Walter H. Rockenstein II, attorney for the Developer, Pacific Flats, LLC; Faegre and Benson LLP, 2200 Wells Fargo Center, 90 S. 7th St., Mpls., MN 55402-3901; voice: 612-766-7208, fax: 612-766-1600, email: wrockenstein@faegre.com

DATE OF HEARING: 11/14/06, continued to the 11/28/06 hearing

HPC SITE/DISTRICT: Local district: North Loop Warehouse Local District (established, 9/19/78); National Register of Historic Places District: Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District (established in 1989)

CATEGORY:

- **North Loop Local Warehouse District:**
 1. Linkage of building, structures, lands and space, a majority of which continue to exist in their original location and are distinguished by architectural quality and aesthetic appeal.
 2. Arouses a sense of time (history) and space (attractive special quality)
 - 3a. Contains a concentration of structures of superior workmanship.
 - 3b. Contains a number of structures which display the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type reflective of a style and method of construction.
 5. Has a sense of visual cohesion expressed through a harmony of related details, architectural or otherwise, based upon elements of quality (aesthetic) as:
 - a. Continuity of architectural factors (style, proportion, color, size, scale and materials);
 - b. Concentration or clustering of structures.
- **National Register of Historic Places Registration Form:** Categories are Event and Architecture/Engineering. Areas of Significance are Architecture, Commerce, and Transportation. Historic Functions are Commerce/Trade, Industry/Processing/Extraction, Manufacturing Facility, Specialty Store, and Warehouse. The area is historically significant as the area of early commercial growth during the development of the City that established Minneapolis as the trade center for the Upper Midwest and includes some of the oldest extant buildings in Minneapolis.

PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE: National Register District: 1850-1874, 1875-1899, 1900-1924, 1925-1949.

CLASSIFICATION: Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction, Sign and Awning.

STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: J. Michael Orange (voice: 612-673-2347; facsimile: 673-2728; TDD: 673-2157; e-mail: michael.orange@ci.minneapolis.mn.us)

PRINT DATE: 11/21/06

Attention: If you want help translating this information, call - **Hmong** - Ceeb toom. Yog koj xav tau kev pab txhais cov xov no rau koj dawb, hu 612-673-2800; **Spanish** - Atención. Si desea recibir asistencia gratuita para traducir esta información, llama 612-673-2700; **Somali** - Ogow. Haddii aad dooneyso in lagaa kaalmeeyo tarjamadda macluumaadkani oo lacag la' aan wac 612-673-3500

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
the 28-Story Condo Building at 212-216 2nd Ave. N. and part of 219 2nd St. N.

1.0 PROJECT DESCRIPTION

1.1 Summary of the entire Pacific Development Project: The following is a summary of the description of the entire Pacific Development Project (PD Project) and its three phases. The applicant submitted seven separate applications to the Minneapolis Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC) listed below. As a part of the staff reports for all seven of these applications is a separately printed collection of attachments that apply to all or most of the Project components. A glance at the list of attachments at the end of this report will aid in locating the appropriate attachment.

There are four contributing historic buildings on the Pacific Block, one of which has already been rehabilitated—the Pacific Flats Building. The developer proposes to rehabilitate two other historic buildings on the block—the Monte Carlo building and the Lowry-Morrison Building. Major modifications and reconstruction are proposed to the fourth historic building on the block—the Northwestern Building. The developer also proposes to demolish noncontributing buildings and replace those sites with new construction. In addition, new construction is also proposed for the existing surface parking lots on the block.

The Project will encompass approximately 595,000 square feet of developed floor space, with an additional area of approximately 258,000 sq. ft. of structured parking. The Project will include approximately 327 condominium units; a ten-story, 133-room hotel (New Hotel); and space devoted to neighborhood retail and destination office tenants. The retail and office uses are expected to include a health and fitness club, at least two restaurants, including the existing Monte Carlo Club, and a medical clinic. The proposed residential component comprises two residential condominium towers—the 18-Story Condo Building on Washington Avenue North, and the 28-Story Condo Building whose major axis parallels 2nd Street N. with an eight-story wing along 2nd Avenue North. Both buildings will have retail uses at the street level.

A structured parking ramp is proposed to be located in the interior of the Pacific Block in the location of an existing alley and existing surface parking lots. A parking ramp located in the interior of the Pacific Block will provide off-street parking for approximately 734 vehicles (Parking Ramp). The Parking Ramp will comprise eight parking levels—three parking levels below grade; an access, parking, and service level at grade; and four structured parking levels above grade (including a mezzanine level). A roof terrace will cover the eighth parking level. There will also be a roof terrace over the portion of the structured parking behind the Monte Carlo Club between the New Hotel and the Pacific Flats Building.

The following describes the components of the PD Project and identifies the applicable HPC applications (identified as PD 1 through 7):

- **PD1—Monte Carlo Pocket Park:** Construct the Monte Carlo Club Pocket Park on the vacant northern portion of the Pacific Flats building parcel at 218-228 Washington Ave. N.

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
the 28-Story Condo Building at 212-216 2nd Ave. N. and part of 219 2nd St. N.

- **PD2—Lowry-Morrison Rehab:** Rehabilitate the deteriorating Lowry-Morrison Building, a contributing building at 200-204 Washington Ave. N.
- **PD3—Northwestern Building Rehab and Expansion for Hotel:** Rehabilitate and add new construction to adaptively reuse the Northwestern Glass Company Building, a contributing building located at 215-223 2nd St. N, as a boutique hotel.
- **PD4—28-Story Condo:** Demolish the Gehl-Dolphin Building—a non-contributing building located outside of the local district but within the national district at 212-216 2nd Ave. N. and part of 219 2nd St. N.—and construct the 28-Story Condo Building on the site.
- **PD5—Auto Repair Garage Demo:** Demolish the Carriage House Building/Auto Repair Garage, a non-contributing building at 206-208 Washington Ave. N.
- **PD6—18-Story Condo:** Construct the 18-Story Condo Building at 206-214 ½ Washington Ave. N. and the northwesterly half of 216 2nd Ave. N. The project includes the demolition of the Auto Repair Garage (the subject of a separate application, PD5), a non-contributing building at 206-208 Washington Ave. N.
- **PD7—Parking Ramp:** Construct a parking ramp and vehicle access on parts of Lots 1-5, 7 and 8, Block 34, Town of Minneapolis.

The applicant proposes to build the Project in three phases:

Phase 1:

- Construction of the pocket park between the Monte Carlo Club and Pacific Flats Building
- Rehabilitation of the Northwestern Building into the New Hotel
- Construction of the parking and retail bases of the 18-Story Condo Building and of the 28-Story Condo Building
- Interior build-out of the upper two floors of the Pacific Flats Building (not part of this HPC application)

Phase 2:

- Construction of the residential portion of the 18-Story Condo Building (floors six through 18).

Phase 3:

- Rehabilitation of the Lowry-Morrison Building
- Construction of the residential portion of the 28-Story Condo Building (floors five through 28)
- Construction of the second pocket park behind the Lowry-Morrison Building

- 1.2 Description of the project:** The applicant is proposing to construct a new, 18-story, 117-unit, mixed-use condominium building to fill the gap in the historic street wall between the Pacific Flats Building and the Lowry-Morrison Building on Washington Avenue N. The 18-Story Condo Building will replace the noncontributing Auto Repair Garage and surface parking lots. The first four stories of this Building will be built to the street

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
the 28-Story Condo Building at 212-216 2nd Ave. N. and part of 219 2nd St. N.

frontage in order to align with the facades of the three-story Pacific Flats Building to the west and the three-story Lowry-Morrison Building to the east. The fifth floor will step back from the Washington Avenue N. facade and will also serve as the base of residential floors six through 18, which will maintain a 29-foot setback from the Washington Ave. N. facade.

The building design is rectangular in shape and volume with variable-depth glass walls on the upper floors to create linear balconies. Setbacks are as follows (the description of setbacks in Attachment 1 is slightly different because it does not reflect the most current design):

- The fifth floor is set back 36 ½ ft. from Washington Ave.
- Floors 6-18 are set back approximately 29 ft. from Washington Ave.

According to the applicant, the setbacks of the upper 14 floors will prevent the height of the building from overwhelming the street-level experience and the scale of the adjacent historic structures. The height of the first three floors will range from 14 feet 7 inches to 16 feet to align with the appropriate floor heights of the adjacent Lowry-Morrison Building. Beginning with the fourth floor, the floor heights will be 10 feet through floor 17. Floor 18 will be 14 feet in height.

2.0 CONTEXT

The following primary sources of information were consulted for this report:

- National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) Nomination Form and Registration Form (1989).
- “Warehouse Area Preservation Study,” Minneapolis Planning Department, January 1978
- “Minneapolis Warehouse Preservation Action Plan,” City of Minneapolis, September 1998.
- Warehouse Historic District Design Guidelines.
- Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
- Environmental Assessment Worksheet for the Pacific Block Development Project, approved by the City of Minneapolis, 9/1/06

2.1 Minneapolis Warehouse National Register District: The Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District, covering 150 buildings, was added to the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) in 1989 (see Exhibit 2 in Attachment A). The NRHP Nomination Form states the following:

“The District is characterized by its historic 6-8 story warehouses which once formed a thriving and prosperous commercial neighborhood adjacent to the central business district of Minneapolis. Consisting of some 62 structures, covering about 7 square blocks the District is notable for its cohesiveness of architectural styles well as for the extent to which the structures have remained unaltered. Most of the warehouses in the District were built in the Chicago

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
the 28-Story Condo Building at 212-216 2nd Ave. N. and part of 219 2nd St. N.

Commercial Style. The exterior facades reflect the structural support system within and the ornamentation is usually minimal. The warehouses are rectangular, built up to the property line, and built of brick and stone. . . .”

“The district is historically significant for its association with the burgeoning railroad transportation network, which in the late nineteenth century, connected Minneapolis with the upper Midwest and the rest of the country. During this period, the area north of Minneapolis’ central business district was established as an area of concentrated warehouse activity for the wholesale storage and shipment related to milling and manufacturing. In addition, the district is architecturally significant for its concentration of commercial warehouse buildings designed by the city’s most prominent architects in styles ranging from late nineteenth century Romanesque to the Chicago Commercial Style of the early twentieth century.”

“The district has more than individually significant buildings. It has contributing buildings that, combined with the individually significant structures, create a landscape of buildings having a common history of age and original use and a common physical appearance of materials, design, siting and mass. These various factors combine to form a cohesive district of similar buildings, many of which are of superior design and appearance.”

The NRHP Registration Form (1989) adds the following information:

“The oldest buildings constructed in the warehouse district were small commercial structures, typically three stories tall. Many were built with storefronts on the first floor and hotels or manufacturing space above. As the area developed into the city’s warehouse and wholesale district in the late 1880s, the size of the buildings dramatically increased and was normally 5- to 7 stories with mill or semi-mill construction. After the turn of the century, massive utilitarian structures were built employing reinforced concrete and structural steel. The Warehouse District has retained its original sense of time and place with four steel bridges still in place, many streets paved with bricks or cobblestones, and with trains passing through daily on original track beds around which the area first developed. Architecturally the buildings include every major architectural style popular during the period of significance including Italianate, Queen Ann and Richardsonian Romanesque to the Classical Revivals and early 20th century Commercial Styles.”

The periods of significance for the District are as follows: 1850-1874, 1875-1899, 1900-1924, and 1925-1949. Washington Avenue North, from First Avenue North to Ninth Avenue North., is the spine of this 30-block district. This National Register district includes the so-called Pacific Block except for two parcels in the block immediately south that are the access to Interstate 394.

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
the 28-Story Condo Building at 212-216 2nd Ave. N. and part of 219 2nd St. N.**

The following chart lists the buildings in the block and their status as regards the National Register District and the North Loop Warehouse Local District (refer to section 2.2).

Building	Address	Built	Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District	North Loop Warehouse Local District
The Pacific Building	218-228 Washington Ave. N.	1865-1866	Contributing	Contributing
The Gluek Brewing Company Building, now known as the Monte Carlo	217 3rd Ave. N.	1910	Contributing	Contributing
Northwestern Glass Company Building	219 2nd St. N.	1912	Contributing	Contributing
	215 2nd St. N.	1918 & 1923	Contributing	Contributing
The Lowry Morrison Building	200 Washington	1879	Contributing	Contributing
Carriage House Building, also known as the Auto Repair Garage	206-208 Washington Ave. N.	1875	Noncontributing	Noncontributing
The Gehl-Dolphin Building	212 2nd Avenue N.	1951	Noncontributing	Not in District

2.2 North Loop Warehouse Local District: In 1978, the City established a local preservation district, the North Loop Warehouse Local District under the guidelines of the Minneapolis Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC). (See map, Exhibit 1 in Attachment A.) The Pacific Block is included in the local district except for the site of the Gehl-Dolphin Building and the lot at 212 2nd Avenue North. are excluded from the boundaries. The “Warehouse Area Preservation Study” of 1978 described the individually significant buildings and included the following comment on the importance of the local district (p. 4). The language parallels that of the NRHP Nomination text cited above: “An area to be considered for heritage preservation must have more than individually significant buildings. It should have, among other things, connecting tissue to unite and tie the individual buildings together. This Warehouse Area has such connections in abundance. It has contributing buildings that, combined with individually significant buildings create a streetscape of buildings that have a common history in terms of age and original use and that have a common physical appearance in terms of material, design, siting and mass. These various factors combine to form a cohesive district of similar buildings, many of which are of superior design and appearance.”

2.3 Minneapolis Warehouse Preservation Action Plan (adopted by the City Council, 2000): The following excerpt from the plan applies to the project (pp. 1, 10-11):

“A Vision for the Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District: The Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District is one of our nation’s premiere historic warehousing districts. Developed between 1865-1930, the warehouse district contains a diverse and handsome selection of late 19th- and early 20th-century commercial style buildings that reflect significant warehousing, jobbing and commercial activities

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
the 28-Story Condo Building at 212-216 2nd Ave. N. and part of 219 2nd St. N.

that made Minneapolis a regional trade center. A large part of the warehouse district's appeal is its unique historic environment. The district's renaissance as an arts, cultural and entertainment community in the 1970s continues to draw tenants, residents and visitors to the area. Creating an appropriate balance between old and new structures is encouraged and critical for the economic vitality of the district. The buildings of substantial character create a district that is one of Minneapolis' competitive advantages. Whenever an historic building is demolished or altered or a new structure is inappropriately designed, the district becomes a lesser place. With care and guidance, the continued development and preservation of the warehouse district as a recreation, entertainment and creative community will enrich the lives of residents and visitors to Minneapolis into the next millennium.

“Physical Environment: Enhance the historic character of the Warehouse District, guide new development and support the unique public realm in the plan area. The historic and cultural resources in the Warehouse District are one of Minneapolis' greatest assets. The uniqueness that other cities are searching for and trying to create, and that even the core of downtown Minneapolis is trying to enhance, is already in place in the Warehouse District.

“The goal, then, is to ensure the future preservation of this resource by establishing guidelines for sensitive and compatible alterations to the historic resources in the district, guiding new development in the district that is compatible with the historic character of the district, and enhancing streetscapes that foster pedestrian movement, encourage sidewalk cafes, create a safer atmosphere, and benefit continued reinvestment in the area.”

When the plan was adopted, the following criteria were established for all new development projects in the plan area:

- Encourage high quality design, architectural diversity, and the use of high quality materials that reinforces the historic character and integrity of the Warehouse Historic District and St. Anthony Falls Historic District.
- Maximize pedestrian activity through interactive building design, and enhanced streetscape and parking lot design.
- Provide opportunities for a variety of neighborhood services.
- Encourage a high quality urban environment that clearly establishes the public realm and incorporates gathering spaces.
- Accommodate and provide access to alternative modes of transportation, such as transit stops and bicycle paths.
- Discourage the demolition of historic resources for new construction or surface parking and encourage adaptive reuse.
- Emphasizes consistency with the policies of the City's Comprehensive Plan, including the Downtown 2010 component.

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
the 28-Story Condo Building at 212-216 2nd Ave. N. and part of 219 2nd St. N.

- Initiate the Development Objectives Process to be coordinated by the Planning Department and the Minneapolis Community Development Agency for all developments requesting public assistance or subsidy, including the sales of public land at market rate.”

2.4 The Environmental Assessment Worksheet: On June 31, 2006, the City published and distributed a Mandatory Environmental Assessment Worksheet (EAW) for the Pacific Block Development Project according to the Environmental Review Rules of the Minnesota Environmental Quality Board (EQB) under Rule 4410.4300 Subpart 19 Residential Development (it exceeds the 375-unit threshold) and Subpart 31, Historical Places (it includes the demolition of structures within the National Register of Historic Places District). On September 1, 2006, the City concluded that the EAW was adequate and that no Environmental Impact Statement was required. All documents associated with the EAW, including 66 pages of comment letters, are available on the City’s web site: (<http://www.ci.minneapolis.mn.us/planning/pacific-block.asp>)

2.5 Archeological and historic resources analysis in the EAW: State rules for preparing an EAW require the applicant to provide the City the data needed for the EAW. As such, Pacific Flats LLC hired the Hess, Roise and Company to prepare the required response to EAW Question 25 that addressed historic resources. The following excerpts from the EAW summarize the findings and conclusions as regards effects on contributing resources:

Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District (National Register): The Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District, covering 150 buildings, was designated in 1989. Washington Avenue North, from 1st to 9th Avenues N., is the spine of this 30-block district. This National Register district includes the Pacific Block, as well the adjacent blocks, with the exception of the I-394 access at the southwest corner of Washington and 3rd Avenues North. and the far (1st Avenue North.) side of the block between 2nd Street N. and Washington Avenue North, which contains a printing company and parking lots.

On the Pacific Block, the Carriage House Buildings at 208 Washington Avenue North and the Gehl-Dolphin building at 212 2nd Avenue North are considered noncontributing; the rest of the buildings on the block contribute to the district. See Attachments N: Map of Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District (National Register), B: Project Site, and P: Photos of Present Development of the Pacific Flats Block.

North Loop Warehouse Area (Local District): The City has established a local district, the North Loop Warehouse Area (Local District) in the area under the guidelines of the Minneapolis Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC). The north end of this district is irregular in shape, including most of the buildings southwest of 2nd Street North between the railroad corridor, 2nd Avenue North,

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
the 28-Story Condo Building at 212-216 2nd Ave. N. and part of 219 2nd St. N.

and Washington Avenue N. However, on the Pacific Block, the Gehl-Dolphin Building and lot at 212 2nd Avenue North are excluded from the boundaries. The district also includes the southwest half of the block fronting on Washington that is edged by 1st and 2nd Avenues North and 2nd Street North. The district jumps across 3rd Avenue to pick up the Moline, Milburn and Stoddard Company Building (a.k.a. Appliance Parts Building/Traffic Zone) at 250 3rd Avenue North. The rest of the district is mostly contained between 2nd Avenue North, 6th Street North, and 1st Avenue North, including the buildings fronting on the southeast side of 1st Avenue North. The modern building at the southeast corner of 1st Ave North and Washington Avenues is outside the boundaries of the local district. See Attachments O: Map of North Loop Warehouse Area (Local District), B: Project Site, and P: Photos of Present Development of the Pacific Flats Block.

The proposed renovation of the Lowry-Morrison Building, the demolition of back portion of the Northwestern Building, and the construction of new structures in the North Loop Warehouse Area (Local District) will initiate a Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC) review for appropriateness of the proposed renovation, demolition, and new construction. The HPC has adopted district specific guidelines to assist them and proposers in determining the appropriateness of elements of the proposed renovation, demolition, and new construction. The guidelines for the North Loop Warehouse Area (Local District) touch on topics such as masonry repair, storefronts, window replacement, roofing, dropped interior ceilings, removal of historical fabric, health and safety code requirements, building entrances, accent banding, and treatment of side or rear walls. . . .

The HPC guidelines for the adjacent St. Anthony Falls Historic District limits the height of new buildings to fit within the range of heights for existing buildings, typically 4 to 6 stories high. At this stage in the planning and design process, design details for the 28-Story Condo Building Alternative and the 40-Story Condo Building Alternative project are not known.

(a) 28-Story Condo Building Alternative and Guidelines: Both condominium buildings in the 28-Story Condo Building Alternative will be constructed partly or wholly within the North Loop Warehouse Historic District. The proposed design is not within conformance of the adopted Warehouse Historic District Guidelines. All rehabilitation and infill construction will require approvals by the HPC.

(b) 40 Story Condo Building Alternative And Guidelines: In this 40-story Condo Building Alternative, the 40-Story part of the Condo Building will be constructed entirely on the lot on where the Gehl-Dolphin Building is located. That lot is not within the North Loop Warehouse Area (Local District) though it is within the national district. All rehabilitation and infill construction will require approvals by the HPC. After a report by CPED-Planning staff and hearing from the public, the HPC will determine the appropriateness of the design of all the elements of

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
 CPED PLANNING DIVISION
 HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
 Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
 the 28-Story Condo Building at 212-216 2nd Ave. N. and part of 219 2nd St. N.**

either alternative in the North Loop Warehouse Area (Local District). The decision of the HPC can be appealed to the City Council.

2.6 Height analysis in the EAW: The following table and paragraph from the EAW describe the project heights and provides a comparison to other buildings in the area. The 18-story condo alternative is the subject of the HPC application. Exhibit 5 in Attachment A shows building heights in the area.

Table 7-3: Project Building Heights

Building	Existing Height		Proposed Height	
	Stories	Feet	Stories	Feet
Pacific Flats Building	3	48'-7"	3	48'-7"
Monte Carlo Club	2	34'	2	34'
New Hotel				
Central structure			10	121'
South wing			4	65'
Interior courtyard			1	21'
Northwestern Building	4	60'-6"	5	78'
Lowry-Morrison Building	3	50'-11"	3	50'-11"
Parking Ramp			5	61'
28-Story Condo Bldg. Alt.				
28-Story Condo Bldg.			28	305'
18-Story Condo Bldg.			18	205'
40-Story Condo Bldg. Alt.				
40-Story Condo Bldg.			40	425'
10-Story Condo Bldg.			10	120'

The 3, 4 and 5 story heights, none higher than 5 stories, of the existing buildings surrounding the project site are typical of the district between Washington Ave. and the River. . . . Many of these buildings have been renovated for residential and commercial use with little if any changes to the original building envelope. New, infill, construction, with the exception of the 10 story office portion along Hennepin Avenue of the Federal Reserve Bank (which is 3 stories at 1st Avenue), is typically 4 to 8 stories. East of Hennepin in the former Gateway Urban Renewal District, cleared of most original structures in the 1950's and 1960's, taller new office and residential construction has occurred between Washington and the River. Residential buildings include the buildings at Hennepin and 1st St of 16 stories, and the building along 1st Street N. is 27 stories. Also in the Gateway District is the 33 story Churchill Apartments on Marquette, and the under construction 39 story Carlyle on 3rd Ave. South of Washington on the west side of Hennepin Ave. the City has approved the 24 and 32 story Eclipse residential towers. The City is reviewing the "Two Twenty Two", located at 222 Hennepin Ave., the site of the current Jaguar dealership, a proposed project with 290 dwelling units in a 35 story tower. Neither the Eclipse nor the Two Twenty Two project sites are within a historic district.

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
the 28-Story Condo Building at 212-216 2nd Ave. N. and part of 219 2nd St. N.**

As regards visual impacts, the EAW stated, “The height of the proposed towers in both alternatives is out of character with the surrounding local and national historic districts and will have a negative visual impact.”

- 2.7 Comments on the EAW from the Minnesota Historical Society:** The Minnesota Historic Society comment letter on the EAW referenced the height limits in both the national and local districts, however, there is only a limit in the local district—two-to-ten stories. The letter concluded as follows:

“We have the following comments on this proposed project:

1. As the EAW indicates, both alternatives significantly exceed the heights appropriate for both the national and local district. Buildings of this height should not be built in this area.
2. Rehabilitation of historic buildings in the block should be done in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation. In this respect, demolition of the rear portion of the Northwestern Building would not meet the Standards.
3. We recommend that a land use history of the block be prepared as a basis for an assessment of the need for a historic archeological survey of the site.”

3.0 PROPOSED CHANGES

The following is a summary of the information submitted by the applicant, which is available in Attachment 1:

- 3.1 Design of Four-Story Base:** The first-story storefront along Washington Avenue N. will be divided into 10 bays separated by masonry piers that align with the window openings for the second through fourth floors. Awnings will run along the entire length of these facades at approximately 16 feet above grade. Individual store entrances will be incorporated into their respective storefronts at grade. The entrance into the building will be located at the center bay of the Washington Avenue N. facade and will continue past the vertical circulation core at the center of the building to the back where it will link to an enclosed public thoroughfare. At the north edge of the building will be a pedestrian concourse that serves as part of a through-block pedestrian way connecting the pocket park on 3rd Avenue N. adjacent to the Monte Carlo Club to the pocket park behind the Lowry-Morrison Building on 2nd Avenue N. (Refer to the discussion in the staff report at section 3.5 regarding this concourse and the need to vacate the mid-block alley.)

The four-story retail base will be constructed to abut the interior side walls of the Pacific Flats Building and the Lowry-Morrison Building, which is consistent with the windowless interior party wall construction and historic character of those buildings. The structural composition of the east and west walls will be designed to reinforce and protect the fragile walls of the adjoining historic structures and, where possible, expose the historic brick walls on the interior.

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
the 28-Story Condo Building at 212-216 2nd Ave. N. and part of 219 2nd St. N.**

- Exterior Materials:** The four-story retail base will be built with modular brick and stone trim that the applicant intends to be compatible with the existing pallet of the warehouse buildings in the area. The following lists the materials and how they are used in the various components of the PD Project:

Item	Color	Texture and Finish	Color Name	Mortar	Use	Manufacturer
Brick, Type 1	Yellow	Smooth and dull	Butternut Velour		Rehab of the Lowry-Morrison Building	Sioux City Brick
Brick, Type 2	Reddish-brown	Smooth and dull	Cabernet	Same color	18-Story and 28-Story Condo Buildings	Robinson Brick Company
Brick, Type 3	Light yellow	Rough and dull	Modular Glasgow Blend 8X A	Dark buff	Floors 1-4 of the New Hotel Building	Belden Brick Company
Brick, Type 4	Grayish-brown	Smooth and lightly glazed	Mountain Shadow Smooth	Portland and lime	Floors 5-10 of the New Hotel Building	Sioux City Brick
Stone	Reddish-tan	Polished	Minnesota Travernelle	White	18-Story and 28-Story Condo Buildings	Vetter Stone

The brick will be a reddish brown, the same as used on the 28-Story Condo Building. The small portions of the side walls of the fourth story that will be visible to the street will be the same brick. As with the 28-Story Condo Building, a natural stone base will be installed for the first four feet of the building, and stone will also be used for architectural detailing, window sills, and lintels. Stone will also be used to frame the windows of the retail base. The rear wall of the retail base will be incorporated into the Parking Ramp and will not be visible from the street.

- Windows & Doors:** The retail base will have punched windows with a rectilinear form and vertical orientation. Windows will be separated by masonry piers and will be double hung. The frames and mullions will have a black powder coat finish and all door and window glazing will be clear, non-tinted, non-reflective glass. The height-to-width ratio of the individual windows will average approximately 3.6 and approximately 3.8 for the total windows openings (refer to Attachment D for a more complete description).

Building	Windows per Total Window Opening/Average Height-to-Width Ratio*		
	First Floor	Floors 2-4	Upper floors
Northwestern (north facade)	3/3.0	3/1.8	
Hotel (new west façade)	4/3.4	3/2.9	
Hotel (new construction)**			1/1.9
Lowry-Morrison	3/1.3	2/1.6	
Pacific Flats	2.5/4.8	1/2.7	
18-Story Condo	4/4.6	3/3.0	3/2.9
28-Story Condo	4/3.7	3/2.9	3/2.9

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
 CPED PLANNING DIVISION
 HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
 Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
 the 28-Story Condo Building at 212-216 2nd Ave. N. and part of 219 2nd St. N.**

*HPC Guideline for height-to width ratio is 3.0			
** Does not include floor 5, which is a glass curtain wall on all 4 sides			

The above chart summarizes Attachment D and compares the average of the height-to-width ratios for the total window openings for the proposed and contributing buildings. The number ahead of the slash is the average number of windows per opening. The ratios range from 2.9 to 4.6 for the 18-Story Condo Building, which is comparable to the 3.0 ratio called for in the HPC Guidelines for the historic district (refer to Section 5.2). The Lowry-Morrison Building has smaller average ratios at 1.3 for the first floor 1.6 for the upper two floors; however, these low ratios are largely due to the wide masonry piers within the full opening and between the individual windows. The average ratios for the Pacific Flats Building are 4.8 for the first floor and 2.7 for the upper two floors; well within the range of those for the base of the 18-Story Condo Building. The window openings in the 4-story base of the new building have 3 and 4 windows per opening. This is compatible with the multiple windows in the openings for the two adjacent contributing buildings.

- **Roof:** The roof of the four-story masonry base will be flat and incorporate a parapet, relating to historic buildings in the area.

3.2 Design of Upper 14 Floors: The first four stories of this Building will be built to the street frontage in order to align with the facades of the three-story Pacific Flats Building to the west and the three-story Lowry-Morrison Building to the east. The fifth floor will step back approximately 36 feet, 6 inches from the Washington Avenue N. facade and will also serve as the base of residential floors six through 18, which will maintain a 29-foot setback from the Washington Ave. N. facade. The fitness club will occupy the fifth floor; the top 13 floors will be condominium units.

- **Exterior Materials:** The facades facing 2nd Avenue N. and 3rd Avenue N. will be constructed with a brick framework with punched openings. Conversely, the facades facing Washington Avenue and 2nd Street N. are designed with a system of undulating glass and rectilinear concrete floor plates that creates recessed balconies or terraces on each floor. The brick will be the same as that used in the four-story retail base.
- **Windows & Doors:** The undulating glass will be set back from the slab edge. This distance varies from zero to seven feet throughout the length of the facade. This interstitial space creates covered balconies with panoramic views to the Downtown skyline and the riverfront. The floor-to-ceiling window system will allow generous amounts of daylight to pour into the residential units. Glazing will be clear, non-tinted, non-reflective glass. A clear anodized finish will be used for the aluminum balconies and glass railings of the residential floors. The height-to-width ratio of the individual windows will average approximately 2.9 for the total

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
the 28-Story Condo Building at 212-216 2nd Ave. N. and part of 219 2nd St. N.

windows openings (refer to above chart and Attachment D).

- **Roof:** The roof for the condominium tower will be flat and trimmed with metal coping to present a slim profile. The rooftop elevator penthouse will be set back from the perimeter of the Building beyond street sightlines.

4.0 GUIDELINE CITATIONS

4.1 Chapter 599, Heritage Preservation Regulations, Article VI: Certificate of Appropriateness

599.310. Purpose. Certificates of appropriateness are established to protect landmarks, historic districts and nominated properties under interim protection by providing the commission with authority to review and approve or deny all proposed alterations to a landmark, property in an historic district or nominated property under interim protection.

599.350. Required findings for certificate of appropriateness. (a) *In general.* Before approving a certificate of appropriateness, the commission shall make findings that the alteration will not materially impair the integrity of the landmark, historic district or nominated property under interim protection and is consistent with the applicable design guidelines adopted by the commission, or if design guidelines have not been adopted, is consistent with the recommendations contained in The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, except as otherwise provided in this section.

599.360. Certificate of appropriateness conditions and guarantees. (a) *In general.* Following commission approval of an application, the applicant shall receive a signed certificate of appropriateness and approved plans stamped by the planning director. The applicant shall produce such certificate of appropriateness and plans to the inspections department before a building permit or demolition permit may be issued. The signed certificate of appropriateness and stamped plans shall be available for inspection on the construction site together with any inspections department permit.

(b) *Mitigation plan.* The commission may require a mitigation plan as a condition of any approval for demolition or relocation of a landmark, property in an historic district or nominated property under interim protection. Such plan may include the documentation of the property by measured drawings, photographic recording, historical research or other means appropriate to the significance of the property. Such plan also may include the salvage and preservation of specified building materials, architectural details, ornaments, fixtures and similar items for use in restoration elsewhere.

(c) *Additional conditions and guarantees.* The commission may impose such conditions on any certificate of appropriateness and require such guarantees as it deems reasonable and necessary to protect the public interest and to ensure compliance with the standards and purposes of this chapter.

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
the 28-Story Condo Building at 212-216 2nd Ave. N. and part of 219 2nd St. N.

Design Guidelines for On-Premise Signs and Awnings:

1. In General:
 - a. Sign message: All signs, except window signs, real estate signs, project information signs, auxiliary signs, temporary signs and portable signs, are limited to the name and address of the establishment.
 - b. Historic signs: Maintenance or restoration of existing historic signs is encouraged and should not be counted in number of allowable signs.
 - c. Number of signs: Each principal building entrance that faces a public street, or each ground floor principal use, whichever is less, is allowed two signs. A corner lot with a principal entrance on each street is allowed two signs per street frontage. The two signs may be a combination of one wall sign, one projecting sign, one ground sign, one banner, and awning signage. However, a property may not have both a projecting sign and a ground sign. Only one of the signs should be illuminated, except that banners and awning signs should never be illuminated. Awning signs are limited to ground floor awnings and are subject to the specific guidelines for awnings and awning signs. Parking lot signs are subject to the specific guidelines for signs accessory to parking lots.
 - d. Location of building signs: Wherever possible, signs should be placed in traditional sign locations including the storefront sign band area. Signs should not obscure or damage architectural features including windows, doors, pilasters, columns and historic signs. Building signs should be located only on the primary façade of the building adjacent to the street and should be no higher than fourteen (14) feet, except as otherwise provided in the specific guidelines for wall signs.
 - e. Color: Sign colors and materials should be compatible with the colors of the building and its surroundings. Day-glo, light reflecting or fluorescent colors or materials are not allowed.
 - f. Installation: Sign installation should have a minimal impact on the building and to the extent practical allow the building to be returned to its original condition if the sign is removed. Existing signboards and sign frames should be reused to limit drilling new holes into masonry. Wall signs should be attached to the building through the mortar joints. Projecting signs should be attached to a permanent mounting plate. Awnings should be attached to window or door frames and should never damage masonry.
 - g. Illumination: Signs may be illuminated externally, internally, or by neon. Plastic face covers should not be placed on illuminated signs. All illuminated building signs should connect to a permanent mounting plate located near the entrance. Electrical conduit should be installed through the permanent mounting plate. Not more than one brick should be damaged by the installation of the permanent mounting plate. Electrical

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
 CPED PLANNING DIVISION
 HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
 Certificate of Appropriateness for a Component of the Pacific Development Project:
 the 28-Story Condo Building at 212-216 2nd Ave. N. and part of 219 2nd St. N.**

conduit and any lighting fixture should be attached to the sign and not the building wall.

2. Sign Types Allowed:
 - a. Wall signs.
 - b. Projecting signs.
 - c. Banners.
 - d. Ground signs.
 - e. Awning signs.
 - f. Window signs.
 - g. Marquee signs, on theaters only.
 - h. Project information signs.
 - i. Real estate signs.
 - j. Temporary signs.
 - k. Auxiliary signs.
 - l. Portable signs.

3. Sign Types Not Allowed:
 - a. Off-premise advertising signs and billboards.
 - b. Roof signs, unless present during the period of significance.
 - c. Backlighted signs, backlighted awnings and backlighted awning signs.
 - d. Balloon signs.
 - e. Individual letters or elements applied to the surface of a building.
 - f. Pole signs, unless present during period of significance, or a project information sign, real estate sign, auxiliary sign or sign accessory to a parking lot.
 - g. Canopy signs and service area canopy signs.
 - h. Signs placed on or painted on a motor vehicle or trailer and parked with the primary purpose of providing signage.
 - i. Signs placed or maintained on natural features.
 - j. Audible signs.
 - k. Signs with moving or swinging parts or elements.
 - l. Any sign relating to sexually oriented uses and prohibited by the regulations governing such uses in Chapter 549, Downtown Districts.
 - m. Searchlights and strobe lights.
 - n. Signs attached to skyway bridges and intended to be read from the public right-of-way.
 - o. Animated signs.
 - p. Flashing signs.
 - q. Changeable copy signs, except on a theater marquee or ground sign.

4. Guidelines for Specific Types of Signs:
 - a. Wall Signs:
 - i. Location. Wall signs should be located between the first and second floor and should not be higher than fourteen (14) feet, except where the historic sign band is higher. Wall signs should not conceal architectural features or obstruct openings.
 - ii. Size. Wall signs should be no more than two (2) feet high and thirty-two (32) square feet in area and should not extend outward from the building more than eight (8) inches.
 - iii. Materials. Wall signs may be constructed of wood, metal, painted fiberglass or painted plastic.

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for the DeLaSalle Athletic Facility Project located at 25 West Island Avenue and 201 Island Avenue East

- iv. Installation. Wall signs should be attached to the building through the mortar joints. If illuminated, a wall sign should be placed adjacent to or over a permanent mounting plate for electrification. Electrical conduit and lighting fixtures should be attached to the top of the wall sign, and should not be attached to the building. Wall signs should not be painted directly on the surface of the building, except as part of the maintenance or restoration of an existing historic sign.
- b. Projecting Signs:
 - i. Location. Projecting signs should be located near a building entrance and should not be higher than fourteen (14) feet. Projecting signs should not conceal architectural features or obstruct openings, and should not be suspended from the soffit.
 - ii. Size. Projecting signs should be no more than twelve (12) square feet in area and should not project more than four (4) feet from the building. The thickness of a projecting sign should not exceed eight (8) inches.
 - iii. Materials. Projecting signs may be constructed of wood, metal, painted fiberglass or painted plastic.
 - iv. Installation. Projecting signs should always use a single permanent mounting plate.
- c. Ground Signs:
 - i. Location. Ground signs should not obscure the significant architectural detail of adjacent buildings.
 - ii. Size. Ground signs should be no more than thirty-two (32) square feet in area and should not be higher than eight (8) feet.
 - iii. Materials. Ground signs should be constructed of materials similar to those found on the existing building or compatible with the existing building. Acceptable materials include brick, stone, stucco, metal or wood.
- d. Banners:
 - i. Location. A banner should follow the location guidelines for a wall sign or a projecting sign.
 - ii. Size. A banner should follow the size guidelines for a wall sign or a projecting sign.
 - ii. Materials. A banner should be constructed of coated or uncoated fabric.
 - iv. Installation. A banner should follow the installation guidelines for a wall sign or a projecting sign.
 - v. Illumination. A banner should not be illuminated.
- e. Awnings and Awning Signs:
 - i. Location. Awnings should fit within the window or door opening.
 - ii. Number of awnings. The number of awnings may not exceed the number of window or door openings.

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for the DeLaSalle Athletic Facility Project located at 25 West Island Avenue and 201
Island Avenue East**

- iii. Number of awning signs. Awning signs are limited to ground floor awnings. There should be no more than one sign per awning. Awning signs should be no more than six (6) square feet in area. Where there are multiple awning signs on a building, all signs should be located in the same or similar position on the awnings.
- iv. Materials. Awnings should be constructed of coated or uncoated cloth fabric.
- v. Installation. Awning hardware should be attached to the window or door frame and should never damage masonry. Awnings should not be attached to or cover any part of the building wall.
- vi. Illumination. Awnings and awning signs should not be illuminated.
- vii. Awning shape. Awnings should project downward and outward from the openings in straight lines unless they are reflecting the curved shape of the opening. The projection of an awning should be less than its height. An awning drop or skirt should not exceed twelve (12) inches.
- f. Window signs: The number, size and location of window signs are not regulated by the HPC. A window sign may not include a backlighted sign, flashing sign, or any other sign type not allowed.
- g. Project information signs:
 - i. Location. If attached to a building, a project information sign should be a window sign.
 - ii. Size. Freestanding project information signs should be no more than thirty-two (32) square feet in area and eight (8) feet in height.
 - iii. Number. One project information sign is allowed per street frontage and will not be counted toward the number of signs allowed.
 - iv. Illumination. Project information signs should not be illuminated.
- . Real estate signs:
 - i. Location. If attached to a building, a real estate sign should be a window sign.
 - ii. Size. Freestanding real estate signs should be no more than thirty-two (32) square feet in area and eight (8) feet in height.
 - iii. Number. One real estate sign is allowed per street frontage and will not be counted toward the number of signs allowed.
 - iv. Illumination. Real estate signs should not be illuminated.
- i. Temporary signs: Temporary signs are limited to window signs and portable signs.
- j. Auxiliary signs:
 - i. Location. If attached to a building other than a parking attendant building, an auxiliary sign should be a window sign.
 - ii. Size. Freestanding auxiliary signs should be no more than four (4) square feet in area and four (4) feet in height.

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for the DeLaSalle Athletic Facility Project located at 25 West Island Avenue and 201 Island Avenue East

- iii. Number. One freestanding auxiliary sign is allowed per street frontage or per parking lot street entrance and will not be counted toward the number of signs allowed.
- iv. Illumination. Auxiliary signs should not be illuminated.
- k. Signs accessory to parking lots.
 - i. Location. If attached to a building other than a parking attendant building, a parking lot sign should be a window sign.
 - ii. Size. Freestanding accessory parking lot signs should be no more than eight (8) square feet in area and six (6) feet in height. Commercial parking lot signs should be no more than fifteen (15) square feet in area and twelve (12) feet in height.
 - iii. Number. One freestanding parking lot sign is allowed per street entrance.
 - iv. Illumination. Parking lot signs should not be illuminated.
- l. Portable signs: The number, size and location of portable signs are not regulated by the HPC. A portable sign may not include a backlighted sign, flashing sign, or any other sign type not allowed.
- m. Signs for multiple tenant buildings: An application for approval of a master sign plan for a multiple tenant building may be submitted to the HPC for review and approval. Following approval by the HPC, staff will issue a Certificate of No Change for signs that are consistent with the approved plan.

4.4 U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service, National Register Criteria: National Register criteria define, for the nation as a whole, the scope and nature of historic and archeological properties that are to be considered eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.

Criteria for Evaluation: The quality of significance in American history, architecture, archeology, engineering, and culture is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects that possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association and:

- a. That are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history: or
- b. That are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past: or
- c. That embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or
- d. That have yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

Criteria Considerations: Ordinary cemeteries, birthplaces, or graves of historical figures, properties owned by religious institutions or used for religious purposes, structures that have been moved from their original locations, reconstructed historic

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for the DeLaSalle Athletic Facility Project located at 25 West Island Avenue and 201
Island Avenue East**

buildings, properties primarily commemorative in nature, and properties that have achieved significance within the past 50 years shall not be considered eligible for the National Register. However, such properties will qualify if they are integral parts of districts that do meet the criteria or if they fall within the following categories:

- a. A religious property deriving primary significance from architectural or artistic distinction or historical importance; or
- b. A building or structure removed from its original location but which is significant primarily for architectural value, or which is the surviving structure most importantly associated with a historic person or event; or
- c. A birthplace or grave of a historical figure of outstanding importance if there is no other appropriate site or building directly associated with his productive life; or
- d. A cemetery that derives its primary significance from graves of persons of transcendent importance, from age, from distinctive design features, or from association with historic events; or
- e. A reconstructed building, when accurately executed in a suitable environment and presented in a dignified manner as part of a restoration master plan, and when no other building or structure with the same association has survived; or
- f. A property primarily commemorative in intent if design, age, tradition, or symbolic value has invested it with its own historical significance; or
- g. A property achieving significance within the past 50 years if it is of exceptional importance.

4.5 National Park Service, Secretary of the Interior Standards: The Standards address rehabilitation of and additions to buildings that are listed or eligible for listing on the National Register and to new buildings located within historic districts. The following are selected Standards applicable to this 28-Story Condo Project:

District/Neighborhood

Recommended:

- Removing non-significant buildings, additions, or streetscape and landscape features which detract from the historic character of the district or the neighborhood.

Not Recommended:

- Introducing a new building, streetscape or landscape feature that is out of scale or otherwise inappropriate to the setting's historic character, e.g., replacing picket fencing with chain link fencing.
- Introducing new construction into historic districts that is visually incompatible or that destroys historic relationships within the district or neighborhood.

6.0 FURTHER INFORMATION:

Building height, shadows, and wind: Attachment I includes the shadow study for the PD Project. Consistent with typical shadow analyses, the study projected shadows for four times of day (10 a.m., noon, 2 p.m., and 4 p.m.) on four days—the summer and winter solstices (the

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for the DeLaSalle Athletic Facility Project located at 25 West Island Avenue and 201
Island Avenue East**

longest and shortest days of the year) and for the two equinoxes (equal day and night)—with the following results (directional references are by the compass):

- **Summer solstice (June 21):** Shadows of the 18-Story Condo Building will stay on the site during the four study times (10 a.m. to 4 p.m.). The building will cast longer shadows to the southwest and southeast respectively for approximately half of the 16-hours of available daylight during the periods before about 8 a.m. and after 4 p.m.
- **Equinoxes (March 21 and September 21):** Between sunrise and approximately 11 a.m., the upper stories of the 18-Story Condo Building (above approximately the 12th floor) will cast shadows on to 3rd Ave. N. and its sidewalks and the building at 300 3rd Ave. N. Between 11 a.m. and into early evening, the shadow will stay on site or will merge with that of the 28-Story Condo Building.

The shadow of a theoretical 10-story condo building (about 125 ft. tall) on the site of the 18-Story Condo Building would remain on site all day except for the early morning before 10 a.m. and late evening when it would merge with that of the 28-Story Condo Building. This shadow will be approximately 60% as long compared to the proposed building.

- **Winter solstice (December 21):** On the shortest day of the year when we experience approximately 8 hours of daylight and the sun never climbs higher than 22 degrees above the horizon, all multistory buildings cast long shadows all day. Even between noon and 2 p.m., the 18-Story Condo Building will cast shadows that reach across to the Colonial Warehouse Building and later over to the building at 116 3rd Ave. N. These shadows will fall on public streets, sidewalks, and alleys.

The shadow of a theoretical 10-story condo building on the site of the 18-Story Condo Building would remain on site only during the noon-to-2 p.m. period. During the other 10 hours of daylight, the length of the shadow would be about 60% as long as that of the proposed building.

Buildings approximately 20 stories or taller can have a funneling and magnifying effect on wind that is transmitted down to create problems at the street level. Building setbacks at lower stories and canopies are effective methods to mitigate this condition by fracturing downward directed winds. On the Washington Ave. side of the 18-story building, there are two setbacks: a substantial 29-ft. setback at floor 5 and a smaller one at the top floor. Large storefront canopies extend from the entrance and each of the window bays (approximately 9 feet wide by 7 feet deep). These setbacks and the canopies should provide adequate mitigation for potential pedestrian-level winds.

Planning staff agree with the analysis in the EAW that the height of the 18-Story Condo Building “is out of character with the surrounding local and national historic districts and will have a negative visual impact” and with the comment from the Minnesota Historical Society, “Buildings of this height should not be built in this area.” Furthermore, since the shadow study indicates that the 18-story building will create shadows that will be more than 3 times longer

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for the DeLaSalle Athletic Facility Project located at 25 West Island Avenue and 201
Island Avenue East**

(with conceivably three times the adverse effect) than the average 4-story building within the District and approximately 40% longer than if the project complied with the District's 10-story height limit, these shadows are excessive and they will also have an adverse effect on the District.

7.0 FINDINGS

1. **Historic designation:** The Pacific Development Project (PD Project), including the subject application, is located within the North Loop Warehouse Local District (established in 1978) and the Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District (National Register of Historic Places District established in 1989).
2. **The Pacific Development Project application:** The Pacific Flats LLC is applying for a Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction, Signs and Awnings for a new 18-story,¹ 117-unit, mixed-use, condominium building to be constructed at 206-214 ½ Washington Ave. N. and northwesterly half of 216 2nd Ave. N. The project includes the demolition of the Auto Repair Garage (the subject of a separate application, PD6), a non-contributing building at 206-208 Washington Ave. N.
3. **Contributing properties:** The following describes the contributing and noncontributing properties:
 - The Carriage House Buildings (AKA Auto Repair Garage) at 208 Washington Avenue North and the Gehl-Dolphin building at 212 2nd Avenue North are noncontributing structures to the national Minneapolis Warehouse Historic District.
 - The Gehl-Dolphin building at 212 2nd Avenue North is not within the North Loop Warehouse Local District.
 - The rest of the buildings on the block contribute to both the national and local districts: The Monte Carlo Building at 217 3rd Ave. N, the Northwestern Building (Northwestern Glass Company) at 215-223 2nd St. N., the Pacific Flats Building at 218 Washington Ave. N., and the Lowry-Morrison Building at 200-204 Washington Ave. N.
4. **Outcome of EAW process:** The analysis in the EAW for the PD Project concluded the following: “Both condo buildings in the 28-Story Condo Building Alternative will be constructed partly or wholly within the North Loop Warehouse Historic District. The proposed design is not within conformance of the adopted Warehouse Historic District Guidelines. . . . The height of the proposed towers in both alternatives is out of character with the surrounding local and national historic districts and will have a negative visual impact.”

¹ Under the Minneapolis Zoning Code, the 18-Story Condo Building is considered a 20-story building because the first two stories, which are 16 feet and 14 feet, 7 inches high respectively to match the second and third floor levels in the adjoining historic Lowry-Morrison Building, both exceed 14 feet in height, which is the Zoning Code definition of a story, and are counted as two stories each.

CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for the DeLaSalle Athletic Facility Project located at 25 West Island Avenue and 201 Island Avenue East

5. **Minnesota Historical Society letter:** The Minnesota Historic Society comment letter on the EAW concluded as follows: “As the EAW indicates, both alternatives significantly exceed the heights appropriate for both the national and local district. Buildings of this height should not be built in this area.”
6. **Building height:** The PD Project block is located towards the center of the National Register District, towards the north end of the local District, and two or more blocks from the tall buildings in the central core of downtown. Existing buildings surrounding the project site and between Washington Ave. and the River are at 3-5-story heights; none higher than 5 stories. New infill construction is typically 4 to 8 stories in the District, with the exception of the 10-story office portion along Hennepin Avenue of the Federal Reserve Bank (which is 3 stories at 1st Avenue). The height of the 18-Story Condo Building is out of character with the surrounding local and national historic districts and will have a negative visual impact.
7. **Shadow effects:** At 18 floors, the project has 8 floors in excess of the District’s 10-story height limit and about 13 stories above the average 4-story height of other nearby buildings in the District. Furthermore, since the shadow study indicates that the 18-story building will create shadows that will be more than 3 times longer (with conceivably three times the adverse effect) than the average 4-story building within the District and approximately 40% longer than if the project complied with the District’s 10-story height limit, these shadows are excessive and they will also have an adverse effect on the District.
8. **Building outline, shape, and base:** The four-story base portion of the 18-Story Condo Building has proportions that are close to the massing, height, floor levels, fenestration, and scale of the abutting, three-story, historic Lowry-Morrison and Pacific Flats buildings without so perfectly matching them in color and other details as to evoke a false sense of history. The design for the tower is inconsistent with the intent of the Guidelines because it includes “a contemporary curtain wall structure” which the Guidelines discourage instead of “a masonry loading bearing building.” Also inconsistent with the Guidelines, setbacks occur above the fourth floor on both the Washington Avenue North side of the building.
9. **Delineation of historic and modern design references:** The Secretary of Interior Standards call for new construction to “make clear what is historic and what is new,” and recommends against “duplicating the exact form, material, style, and detailing of the historic building in the new addition so that the new work appears to be part of the historic building.” The glass curtain walls and the setbacks on the upper floors will help the viewer realize that this is a modern building component. However, the same combination of brick and stone that dominates the four-story base portion of the building carries up the east (2nd Ave.) and west (internal to the site) facades. Above these floors, the façade changes to all glass (including recessed balconies) with exposed concrete floors. On the north and south facades above the four-story base, the facades are all undulating glass that creates recessed balconies. Although some of these treatments distinguish parts of the building as new construction, the overall combination of facades may lend itself to a sense of confusion as to whether and which pieces of the building might be existing construction from that has been rehabilitated and what is new construction. This approach does not fully meet the intent of the Secretary of

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for the DeLaSalle Athletic Facility Project located at 25 West Island Avenue and 201
Island Avenue East**

Interior Standards and is not in compliance with the Warehouse Historic District Design Guidelines.

10. **Windows:** A combination of brick and stone dominates the four-story base portion of the building carries up the east (2nd Ave.) and west (internal to the site) facades to the 25th and 23rd floors respectively. Above these floors, the façade changes to all glass (including recessed balconies) with exposed concrete floors. On the north and south facades above the five-story base, the facades are all undulating glass that creates recessed balconies. Although this distinguishes the building as new construction, it is not in compliance with the Warehouse Historic District Design Guidelines. Inconsistent with the Guidelines, the floors above the base include continuous horizontal bands of windows above the base portion of the structure. These floors also include undulating windows that create recessed balconies.
11. **Building entrance and storefronts:** The building entrances are incorporated into the storefronts and this is consistent with the Guidelines. The design for storefronts on the building base is generally consistent with the Guidelines. The orientation and location of the primary building entrance is consistent with the Guidelines.
12. **Signs and awnings:** The design for storefronts on the building base is generally consistent with the Guidelines. The project design has not yet reached a level of detail where dimensions and materials are specified for signs and awnings.
13. **Reasonable alternatives:** Building height could be reduced to comply with the 10-story limit in the Guidelines.

G. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

The Community Planning and Economic Development Department—Planning Division recommends that the Minneapolis Heritage Preservation Commission **adopt** the above findings and **deny** the Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction, Sign and Awning for a new 18-story, 117-unit, mixed-use, condominium building (18-Story Condo Building), which is a component of the Pacific Development Project, to be constructed at 206-214 ½ Washington Ave. N. and northwesterly half of 216 2nd Ave. N.

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness for the DeLaSalle Athletic Facility Project located at 25 West Island Avenue and 201
Island Avenue East**

Attachments Common to all Pacific Development Applications (Printed separately)

- Attachment A.** General Description of the Pacific Development. Includes the following:
- Exhibit 1: Map of North Loop Warehouse Local District
 - Exhibit 2: Map of Minneapolis Warehouse National Register District
 - Exhibit 3: Schematic of Bridge Blocks
 - Exhibit 4: Existing Conditions
 - Exhibit 5: Nearby Building Heights
 - Exhibit 6: Project Perspectives
- Attachment B.** HPC application identification map
- Attachment C.** Buildings and addresses in area
- Attachment D.** Window dimensions and materials list
- Attachment E.** Pacific Development Project plans
- Attachment F.** Property owner sheets on the historic buildings and Sanborn maps of the site, 1912 and 1951
- Attachment G.** Photos of the area
- Attachment H.** Photos of affected elevations
- Attachment I.** Shadow analysis
- Attachment J.** EAW comment letter from the Minnesota Historical Society
- Attachment K.** Letters from the North Loop Neighborhood Association

Attachments Specific to Subject Application and Included Herein:

1. Applicant's application for the Certificate of Appropriateness: Description of subject project
2. Applicant's application for the Certificate of Appropriateness: Description of subject project consistency with HPC Guidelines